

# The Catholic Historical Review

ALOYSIUS K. ZIEGLER

MARTIN R. P. MCGUIRE

JOHN TRACY ELLIS

*Managing Editor*

## ADVISORY EDITORS

MANOEL S. CARDOZO

THOMAS T. McAVOY

THOMAS P. NEILL

WILLIAM L. DAVIS

ROBERT F. McNAMARA

GEORGE J. UNDRER

---

## Table of Contents

APRIL, 1948

## ARTICLES

- The Anticlerical Program as a Disruptive Factor in the  
Solidarity of the Late French Republics

*Leo L. Rummel* 1

## MISCELLANY

- The Twenty-Eighth Annual Meeting of the American Cath-  
olic Historical Association, Cleveland, Ohio, December  
27-29, 1947 . . . . .

20

BOOK REVIEWS . . . . . 33

NOTES AND COMMENTS . . . . . 82

BRIEF NOTICES . . . . . 94

PERIODICAL LITERATURE . . . . . 118

BOOKS RECEIVED . . . . . 125

## BOOK REVIEWS

<i>Documents of the Christian Church.</i> (Henry Bettenson). J. JOSEPH RYAN.	33
<i>Art in the Early Church</i> (Walter Lowrie). EDWARD J. DUNCAN.	36
<i>Humanist as Hero: The Life of Sir Thomas More</i> (Theodore Maynard). ELIZABETH FRANCES ROGERS.	37
<i>The Progress of the Jesuits, 1556-1579</i> (James Broderick). HENRY S. LUCAS	39
<i>Jean Duvergier de Hauranne, Abbé de Saint-Cyran, et son temps (1581-1638)</i> (Jean Orcibal). EDWARD A. RYAN.	40
<i>Pontificia Nipponica: Le relazioni tra la Santa Sede e il Giappone attraverso i documenti pontifici</i> (Leo Magnino). EDWARD HAGEMANN.	43
<i>Windows Westward. Rome, Russia, Reunion</i> (Stephen C. Gulovich). JOSEPH V. SWASTEK.	44
<i>De Dageraad van de Emancipatie der Katholieken de Nederlandsche Kath- olieken en de Staatkundige Verwickelingen uit heb laatste Kwart van de achttiende Eeuw</i> (Marinus Josephus Maria van der Heiden). EDWARD P. CALLENS.	45
<i>The Story of the Ukraine</i> (Clarence A. Manning). JOSEPH V. SWASTEK.	47
<i>Colony to Nation. A History of Canada</i> (A. R. M. Lower). DONALD J. McDOUGALL.	48
<i>"The Illiterate Anglo-Saxon" and other Essays on Education, Medieval and Modern</i> (John William Adamson). BERNARD J. KOHLBRENNER.	51
<i>Anglo-Saxon Saints and Scholars</i> (Eleanor Shipley Duckett). SISTER M. THOMAS AQUINAS CARROLL.	52
<i>Dante Alighieri. Citizen of Christendom</i> (Gerald G. Walsh). GERHART B. LADNER.	53
<i>Bordeaux and the Gironde, 1789-1794</i> (Richard Munthe Brace). GEOFFREY BRUNN.	55
<i>Apologia pro vita sua; A Grammar of Assent; The Idea of a University</i> (John Henry Cardinal Newman, edited by Charles Frederick Harrold). J. F. LEDDY.	56
<i>Lady Gregory's Journals, 1916-1930</i> (Lennox Robinson). EDWARD F. KENRICK.	58
<i>The American Experience. An Interpretation of the History and Civiliza- tion of the American People</i> (Henry Bamford Parkes). THOMAS T. McAVOY.	60
<i>The Record of American Diplomacy: Documents and Readings in the His- tory of American Foreign Relations</i> (Ruhl J. Bartlett). JOHN T. FARRELL.	61
<i>The Atlantic Frontier. Colonial American Civilization, 1607-1763</i> (Louis B. Wright). MARSHALL SMELSER.	62
<i>The Wilderness Road (1644-1947).</i> American Trail Series (Robert L. Kinkaid). THOMAS F. CLEARY.	64
<i>History and Bibliography of American Newspapers, 1690-1820</i> (Clarence S. Brigham). EUGENE P. WILLGING.	65
<i>Thomas Jefferson: American Humanist</i> (Karl Lehmann). ANNABELLE M. MELVILLE.	66
<i>The Great Northwest</i> (Oscar Osburn Winther). WILLIAM L. DAVIS.	68
<i>Richard Hildreth</i> (Donald E. Emerson). WILLIAM D. HOYT, JR.	69
<i>Diplomat in Carpet Slippers</i> (Jay Monaghan). CHARLES CALLAN TANSILL.	70
<i>Horace Greeley and the Republican Party</i> (Jester Allen Isely). GEORGE L. A. REILLY.	72
<i>The South during Reconstruction, 1865-1877</i> (E. Merton Coulter). CLEMENT EATON.	73
<i>The Progressive Movement of 1924</i> (Keneth Campbell MacKay). P. RAYMOND NIELSON.	75
<i>Prosperity Decade: From War to Depression: 1917-1929</i> (George Soule); <i>Depression Decade: From New Era through New Deal</i> (Broadus Mitchell). P. RAYMOND NIELSON.	77
<i>O descobrimento do Brasil estudo crítico de acordo com a documentação historico-cartografica e a nautica</i> (Thomas Oscar Marcondes de Souza). MANOEL S. CARDOZO.	78
<i>Pichardo's Treatise on the Limits of Louisiana and Texas</i> (Charles Wilson Hackett and Charmion Clair Shelby). FRANCIS BORGIA STECK.	80

# The Catholic Historical Review

---

Volume XXXIV

APRIL, 1948

No. 1

---

## THE ANTICLERICAL PROGRAM AS A DISRUPTIVE FACTOR IN THE SOLIDARITY OF THE LATE FRENCH REPUBLICS

By

LEO L. RUMMEL\*

The interest in the recent electoral results in France gives some evidence that at least a fraction of the world still believes in the old dicta that "as France goes politically, so goes Europe," or "Europeans do not understand anything until a Frenchman translates it." For this reason the new constitution of the Fourth Republic has held the attention of a number of interested observers of governmental trends. In particular, Articles IV, XIV, and XVIII on the questions of *laïcité*, public education, and the right of association have been targets for sharp controversial attacks.<sup>1</sup> With regard to the first issue, *laïcité*, the counting of the ballots would indicate that thus far voting Frenchmen are equally divided on the constitutional *laïcité* of the new republic. This traditional cleavage of French republics into Stendhal's *The*

To envisage and appreciate this possibility demands an accurate evaluation of terms and a preview of the purposes and goals of laicism and clericalism. It is not enough to try to describe anticlericalism as a feeling of nausea for a certain manner of living or views of life, a

\* This article was originally read as a paper at the joint session of the American Historical Association and the American Catholic Historical Association in New York City, December 29, 1946. Father Rummel, a member of the Canons Regular of Premontré, holds his doctorate from the University of Wisconsin and is stationed at St. Mary's Hospital in Madison.

<sup>1</sup> "Proposition de la loi," *Revue du droit publique de la science politique*, LXII (January-March, 1946), 156-166; and T. E. Utley, "The French Choice," *Free Europe*, XIII (May, 1946), 124.

*tout ensemble* of the effluvia of the religious atmosphere. On this point Pius XI made a definitive statement in his encyclical, *Quas Primas, Red and the Black* is a legacy that may become a painful anachronism to modern Frenchmen.

written for the establishment of the feast of the kingship of Christ. In it he described laicism as "the plague of our time" because "it rejects the supernatural and has de-supernaturalized man's life."<sup>2</sup> In the summer of 1946 at the Institute of Sociology in Reading, England, Monsignor Ronald Knox developed the papal teaching by demonstrating the fulfillment of the predicted calamities in the omniscient state in which "man exists for the state and not the state for man."<sup>3</sup> On the other hand, Harold J. Laski continues to announce that

secularization of society is a final achievement in the evolution of mankind. It will extend and not diminish its power. The faith we have to build is a faith in the values of this world, not in the values of another.<sup>4</sup>

These two movements have clashed already in most civilized countries of Europe and generally have ended in a temporary laic victory.<sup>5</sup> Nearly all the early conflicts were within the acceptance of divine revelation,<sup>6</sup> but with the rise of modern laicism in the eighteenth century and its growth and extension in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries the movement was no longer one of lay Christians against priests or clerics but rather an attack on the clergy as defenders of revelation. Modern laics have stigmatized belief in revelation as a disgraceful shackle of the human race.<sup>7</sup> Despite this clear distinction of conflicting issues in the duel between two ideologies, which Jules

<sup>2</sup> *Spiritual Well-Springs: Eighteen Encyclicals of Social Reconstruction by Pope Pius XI*, edited by Joseph Husslein, S.J., 2 vols. (Milwaukee, 1941), II, 41.

<sup>3</sup> Ronald Knox, "Religion and Civilization: the Rise of the Omnipotent State," *Tablet* (London) CLXXXVIII, (August 3, 1946), 56-58.

<sup>4</sup> Harold J. Laski, *Reflections on the Revolution of Our Times* (New York, 1943), p. 197; also *Faith, Reason, and Civilization* (New York, 1944), pp. 34-35; 105-106.

<sup>5</sup> Carl Conrad Eckhardt, *The Papacy and World Affairs as Reflected in the Secularization of Politics* (Chicago, 1937).

<sup>6</sup> Georges de La Garde, *La naissance de l'esprit laïque au déclin du moyen âge*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1934).

<sup>7</sup> Georges Weill, *Histoire de la idée laïque en France au XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle* (Paris, 1929).



Ferry called the "Western Question,"<sup>8</sup> there has been a willful or thoughtless confusion of the definition and connotation of the terms clericalism and *laïcité* or laicism. To a large group clericalism suggests superstition, reaction, intolerance, anti-democracy, even fascism, whereas laicism implies liberation from church despotism.

On November 13, 1945, the archbishops and bishops of France published in *A Declaration on the Human Person, the Family, and Society* their objections to the ambiguous use of the term *laïcité* that "threatens to injure national unity."<sup>9</sup> In the third part of their *Declaration* they discussed the relation of Church and State and insisted that "the Roman pontiffs have taught that the State is sovereign in her own sphere . . . and have reminded the faithful of the duty of submission to the constituted authority." Accordingly they denounced as calumny the attempted brandishing of "the worn-out spectre of clericalism" because if the word means "the introduction of the clergy into the political sphere of the State" or the "clerical arrogation of any of the State's power . . . we declare very forcefully that we condemn clericalism as contrary to the authentic teaching of the Church."<sup>10</sup> To the laic contention that in a country of divided beliefs *laïcité de l'état* is the only guarantee of the freedom of religions, the episcopal reply was:

But the Church, which desires that the act of faith be made freely, without being imposed by any external constraint, takes account of the fact of the division of beliefs; she demands, therefore, simply her freedom to fulfill the spiritual and social mission which her Divine Founder has entrusted to her.<sup>11</sup>

After thus expounding *laïcité*, refuting the customary charges of ecclesiastics plotting in state affairs, and repudiating the Church's imputed intolerance toward other beliefs, the French bishops showed an unalterable and militant opposition toward two other prevailing interpretations of *laïcité de l'état*. They declared that if these words stand for

a philosophical doctrine, containing in it a whole materialistic and atheistic conception of human life and society, if these words mean a system of

<sup>8</sup> Gabriel Hanotaux, *Contemporary France, 1877-1882*, trans. by E. Sparvel-Bayly, 4 vols. (London, 1909), IV, 152.

<sup>9</sup> "A Statement by the Archbishops and Bishops of France," *Tablet* (London), CLXXXVI (December 15, 1945), 286-289.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 287.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*

political government which imposes that conception on the officers of the state, even in their private lives, on the state schools, and on the whole nation, then we rise up with all our strength against that doctrine.<sup>12</sup>

Furthermore, they pronounced an identical ultimatum on the same puzzling phrase if it means "the will of the state not to submit itself to any superior morality and to recognize only its own interest as the rule of its behavior."<sup>13</sup> In truth the two teachings have been the trademarks of modern French laicism of the republic. For instance, on February 18, 1892, when Clemenceau exploded in the chamber: "There is no alliance between the rights of man and the so-called rights of God. . . . Fight for the secularization of the state. It is the movement of the Revolution," he actually overthrew Freycinet's ministry for attempting to compromise with the *Ralliement*.<sup>14</sup>

On February 11, 1895, another Socialist deputy, Jean Jaurès, while disputing with Monsignor Maurice d'Hulst in the chamber about methods of higher education, announced his party's view toward the demands of a Supreme Being in these words:

If God Himself in palpable form would speak before a multitude, the first duty of man would be to refuse obedience and to consider himself as an equal with the one who discusses, not as a master to whom one must submit.<sup>15</sup>

At the same session the minister of education, Raymond Poincaré, approved Jaurès' teachings and seconded unreservedly the proclamation: "No dogma ought to limit the perpetual effort of human search."<sup>16</sup> The speeches of many officials in the French Chambers re-echoed

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 288.

<sup>14</sup> *Journal officiel de la république française* (Paris, 1876-1940). The Chamber and the Senate debates are in separate volumes referred to as *J. O. C.* and *J. O. S.* *J. O. C.*, February 18, 1892, p. 166; and A. Daniel, *L'Année politique*, 1892 (Paris, 1893), pp. 71-75.

<sup>15</sup> *J. O. C.*, February 11, 1895, p. 340. Charles Péguy in his *Notre jeunesse* 8th ed., (Paris, 1933), p. 121, blames Jaurès for imposing "le système Combiste" on France by his oratorical and parliamentary power.

<sup>16</sup> *J. O. C.*, February 11, 1895, pp. 342-346. Raymond Poincaré wrote a eulogistic preface to Ferdinand Buisson's *La foi laïque* (Paris, 1912) in which he assured the reader that this laic educator's book contained "the most intimate thoughts of Jules Ferry."

similar dogmas of an "anthropocentric universe" in opposition to a theocentric one.<sup>17</sup>

For nearly fifty years metaphysical disagreements among political parties have harried the French Republic with laicism in control.<sup>18</sup> In reality representatives of both sides have described these ingrained strains of French republicanism under the elusive terms of mysticism<sup>19</sup> and national instinct.<sup>20</sup> The fall of the republic and the occupation of the country were calamities that apparently softened some prejudices of political leaders and made the expression of their principles more fluid. In fact, a lively courtship among the once antagonistic parties has been proceeding in liberated France.

Père Phillippe, the Carmelite provincial and a member of the French consultative assembly representing the National Front, wrote in the party sheet: "In so far as clericalism means the intrusion of clerics in affairs outside their competence, I am anticlerical." At the same time he objected to "the baptism of the Revolution" and explained that although the National Front does not try to synthesize contradictory principles, such as atheistic, materialistic Marxism, in the felicitous phraseology of Jacques Maritain, "it professes to co-operate, in spite of doctrinal differences, for temporal, political, and social reform . . . with sufficient similarity of aim to enable all parties to work in common

<sup>17</sup> René Viviani, *J. O. C.*, January 15, 1901, pp. 62 and 70; Camille Pelletan, *J. O. C.*, March 11, 1901, pp. 899-908; M. Zévaès, *J. O. C.*, March 12, 1901, p. 912; M. Lanessan, *J. O. C.*, March 20, 1901, pp. 1049-1056; Georges Trouillot, *Pour l'idée laïque* (Paris, 1901); also *J. O. C.*, March 29, 1901, p. 2096; E. Combes, *J. O. C.*, October 19, 1901, p. 142; Eduard Vaillant, *J. O. C.*, October 17, 1902, p. 67; M. Allard, *J. O. C.*, January 26, 1903, pp. 277-282; Marcel Sembat, *J. O. C.*, January 26, 1903, p. 285; and E. Combes, *J. O. S.*, June 21, 1901, pp. 381-386.

<sup>18</sup> B. Emonet, "Laïcisme," *Dictionnaire apologétique de la foi catholique*, 4 vols. (Paris, 1924), II, 1767-1810; Wilhelm Herzog in his *Der Kampf einer Republik die Affäre Dreyfus* (Wien, 1933), pp. 26-33, repeats the usual anticlerical accusations against the Church, and in his *From Dreyfus to Petain*, translated by Walter Sorell (New York, 1947), chap. 18, "The Struggle Never Ends," pp. 254-299, claims that the war against clericalism runs like a thread through the history of the French republics and concludes that "the red and black internationals," Moscow and Rome, "will fight their first battle after World War II in France."

<sup>19</sup> Péguy, *op. cit.*, pp. 17, 29.

<sup>20</sup> André Siegfried, *Tableau des partis en France* (Paris, 1930), pp. 34, 67, and 71.

for its achievement."<sup>21</sup> On November 10, 1944, seven days prior to the invitation of the National Front, François Mauriac, writing in *Figaro*, had attracted attention by his appeal to the Socialists and Christian Democrats to unite for the common good, even though partisan ideas "are hardened in us like lava once youth is past." He asked both Communists and Socialists "to swim against the current of their prejudices and to consider with new eyes how faith in Christ and how Christian hope have endowed the world."<sup>22</sup> Not only did he promise "an elite of Christians formed from the fire of persecution and contradictions" but also hoped that "*sécularité* would not remain an obstacle against which the best efforts of Socialists and Christians would break."<sup>23</sup>

Already the leaders of the Republican Popular Movement had gone so far in their attempts to conciliate the communists that Paul Reynaud, the ex-premier, labeled them the "opportunistic party."<sup>24</sup> According to this writer, the chief socialists at their convention in August, 1946, rejected union with the extreme Marxists because they were "foreign nationalists," notwithstanding their noble work in the resistance, and "by virtue of their proportional power could destroy the organization of which they were the conductors."<sup>25</sup> Consequently, the hope of a party of national unity between Socialists and Catholics is more promising than any other political alignment. In 1944 the socialists responded to the friendly advances of the Catholics with this encouraging declaration: "The Socialists are attempting to form a new relationship with the Christians because they [Socialists] believe that there has been an evolution in their [Christians'] opinion."<sup>26</sup> But the Socialist editor hesitated before "the difficult problem of education . . . the imperative necessity of keeping their youth brought up apart."<sup>27</sup>

<sup>21</sup> *Front National*, November 26, 1944.

<sup>22</sup> *Figaro*, November 17, 1944.

<sup>23</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>24</sup> Paul Reynaud, "La situation politique en France à la veille des élections," *Revue de Paris*, 53<sup>e</sup> année, No. 11 (November, 1946), 6, asserted with applause to Duclos, that the Catholics' excuse was "Better to be united in error than divided in truth." This sentence was suppressed in *Journal officiel* and is quoted from the press.

<sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>26</sup> *Le Populaire*, November 25, 1944.

<sup>27</sup> *Ibid.*, December 23 and 24, 1945. Robert Verdier, the author of these articles, republished them in his *Ecole laïque et liberté* (Paris, 1945).

After a review of the position of Léon Blum and his co-Socialists toward the baffling questions arising in the youthful Fourth Republic, S. William Halperin concludes that the educational question "looms as one of the formidable barriers to national unity."<sup>28</sup> Another political writer insists that "state neutrality in education" continues to be a "potential element of discord" because of the traditional suspicion between *laïc* and *Catholique*.<sup>29</sup> A look at the development of the French school system will help to disclose the cause of this impasse.

H. Taine's chapter on *l'école* in his *Les origines de la France contemporaine* is almost as good prophecy as history. The clericals of his day excluded this positivist historian<sup>30</sup> when a young man from a teaching position in a profession invented by the first modern anti-clericals (Jacobins). Later in life the author confessed that both filled him with the same disgust as a rotting corpse, but to him the anti-clericals were like the itch and the clericals were a stench. He preferred the itch.<sup>31</sup> Thus conditioned in early life, Taine in his *Les origines* emphasized Napoleon as the organizer of the French system of education. The emperor, according to the author, aimed to develop the Jacobin system into a corporation because it would never die. He demanded that "this corporation must be laic. Its members are to be state and not church Jesuits. They must belong to the Emperor and not to the Pope, and will form, in the hands of the government, a civil militia composed of ten thousand persons."<sup>32</sup> For those entering his imperial university he eventually devised a monastic ceremony known as the "taking of the cowl." He stressed strict military discipline like that of the Jesuits. According to Napoleon's design, all education, even that of the Church,<sup>33</sup> was centered in the State.<sup>34</sup> In Taine's opinion the

<sup>28</sup> S. William Halperin, "Léon Blum and Contemporary French Socialism," *Journal of Modern History*, XVIII (September, 1946), 241-246.

<sup>29</sup> Dorothy M. Pickles, "The Political Situation in France," *Political Quarterly*, XVI (April-June, 1946), 101.

<sup>30</sup> K. de Schaepdryver, *Hippolyte Taine: Essai sur l'unité de sa pensée* (Paris, 1938), pp. 77-89.

<sup>31</sup> Letter of June 28, 1873, in *ibid.*, p. 80.

<sup>32</sup> H. Taine, *Les origines de la France contemporaine*, 3 vols. (Paris, 1858-1894), III, Livre VI, chapitre i.

<sup>33</sup> "Napoleonic Catechism," in Sister Mary Justine Redmond's *Laicism in the Schools of France* (Washington, 1932), pp. 10-11.

<sup>34</sup> A. Aulard, *Napoléon Ier et le monopole universitaire: origines et fonctionnement de l'université impériale* (Paris, 1911).

result has been the maneuvering of the Napoleonic educational machinery by those exercising control so that it has produced either a "laïcisant or a clérical" student in uncompromising rigidity.<sup>35</sup> It all depended on who was in power.

With the educational machinery of France thus geared to serve the doctrines of the political leaders, it was natural that with each turn-over in the government there would be a struggle to control the pedagogical citadel. When Pius VII re-established the Jesuits in France on August 7, 1814, under the name Pères de la Foi, Voltairian journalists, like Jouy, Tissot, and Jay, began to agitate against the illegal society. The author of the most bitter diatribe was an *émigré*, Comte de Montlosier, who warned the readers of his *Mémoires* that the Association of Saint Joseph was preparing to betray France to the *parti-prêtre*.<sup>36</sup> Eight printings of this work followed in quick succession. One hailed it "le flambeau de France." The friends of the Jesuits retorted in pamphlets, attributing the authorship of the *Mémoires* to a disordered mind.<sup>37</sup> Into this melee the count threw another book, an attempt to prove the strangle-hold the Jesuits were gaining on public officials, especially those at the university.<sup>38</sup>

Under Louis Philippe's government the foes of the religious associations gained favor. The anti-Jesuit campaign grew stronger, and Beranger's satirical odes, written in 1819, became so popular that the following lines were chanted even on the streets.<sup>39</sup>

Whence do you come, O black-clad men?  
Fox and wolf, our nature dual,  
Deep in the earth is found our den;  
Darkest of mysteries is our rule.  
We are the sons of Loyola.<sup>40</sup>

<sup>35</sup> Taine, *op. cit.*, Livre VI, chapitre iii.

<sup>36</sup> Comte de Montlosier, *Mémoires à consulter sur un système politique tendant à renverser la religion, la société et le trône* (Paris, 1826).

<sup>37</sup> J. Brugerette, *Le prêtre français et la société contemporaine*, 3 vols. (Paris, 1933-1938), I, 58.

<sup>38</sup> Montlosier, *Les Jésuites, les congrégations et le parti-prêtre en 1827* (Paris, 1827), p. 185.

<sup>39</sup> Weill, *op. cit.*, p. 31.

<sup>40</sup> "Les révérends pères," *Oeuvres complètes de P. J. de Beranger*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1856), I, 316-317.



The campaign to mold public opinion against the Jesuits proved to be so effective that the Jesuit general could write in 1831: "Who is called a Jesuit in France, at least in Paris, is labeled a wild beast which must be attacked."<sup>41</sup> At this time the anticlericals began to concentrate their attacks on the educational system of other religious communities.

Claude Tillier added fresh accusations. He alleged that he saw the work of God in the Gospel, but he observed sardonically that he had searched in vain to find anything about the Jesuits, "half-wolf and half-fox."<sup>42</sup> Next he censured the teaching of priests and brothers because they slighted the heroes of the Revolution. He reproached the religious teachers for giving an anti-patriotic training.<sup>43</sup> Tillier taught that *patrie, démocratique, liberté*—these three—were always united and that the clerical teacher went counter to them because he was unable to harmonize the Gospel with the *Declaration of the Rights of Man*.<sup>44</sup> Arsène Meunier was a more energetic collaborator of Tillier. In 1845 he established his *Echo des instituteurs* for the main purpose of attacking the Christian Brothers, whom Napoleon had used.<sup>45</sup> Meunier denounced them as inferior to lay teachers because they had neither country nor homes, whereas their competitors were citizens and fathers of families.<sup>46</sup> For his reason he demanded that since "the State is laic, the instruction given in the name of the State ought to be laic."<sup>47</sup>

Victor Cousin was less radical but far more influential in the campaign. As administrator of secondary education in 1830 he moderately

---

"Hommes, d'où sortez-vous?"

"Nous sortons de dessous terre;

Moitié renards, moitié loups,

Notre règle est un mystère;

Nous sommes fils de Loyola."

Cf. also "Le Chant du Cosaque," in "Les Capucins," *op. cit.*, I, 235.

<sup>41</sup> J. Burnichon, *La compagnie de Jésus en France: Histoire d'un siècle, 1814-1914*, 4 vols. (Paris, 1914-1922), I, 516. Letter of October 17, 1831.

<sup>42</sup> Claude Tillier, *Pamphlets*, edited by Marius Gerin (Paris, 1906), p. 488.

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 629.

<sup>44</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 247 and 330.

<sup>45</sup> Aulard, *op. cit.*, pp. 240-248.

<sup>46</sup> Arsène Meunier, *Lutte du principe clérical et du principe laïque dans l'enseignement* (Paris, 1861), p. 27.

<sup>47</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 387.

avored the advocated changes. However, his subordinates attacked the clergy, and in turn Louis Veuillot and Comte Charles de Montalembert arose to the defense of the priests and condemned the irreligion of the university.<sup>48</sup> This polemic so agitated public opinion that Cousin as an official had to defend not only the educational system sponsored by his party but himself as well. With a patriotic appeal for national unity and with the usual charge of reactionary against the churchmen he pleaded in the Chamber:

It is first of all a great moral and political institution which impresses on all its establishments a common spirit and directs them toward a common end, the service and love of the native land, such as our fathers have made it. On this title it has been violently attacked in 1815, again in 1821, and finally today.<sup>49</sup>

A month later he sounded a warning to the teaching congregations, which Waldeck-Rousseau, Emile Combes, and Léon Blum would repeat, that "France will not know two systems of education essentially contradictory: the one clerical and fundamentally Jesuitical, the other laic and secular. For two generations were separated one from the other at infancy, impregnated at an early age with opposing principles, and one day perhaps will be enemies."<sup>50</sup>

The educational system and the teaching personnel of the university continued to be political tools. Adolphe Thiers as chairman of a committee to examine a bill on secondary education became implicated in the politics of the campaign. On July 13, 1844, he gave a report against the teaching congregations.<sup>51</sup> Thinking that the question of the orders would give him an opportunity to overthrow the government of Guizot, his life long rival, he demanded on May 2, 1845, that the laws of France be enforced against the congregations. In this dispute the laics won merely Pyrrhic victory. Some Jesuits left the country, but the majority remained.<sup>52</sup>

<sup>48</sup> Weill, *op. cit.*, p. 79.

<sup>49</sup> Victor Cousin, "Discours 21 avril, 1844," réunis dans *Défense de l'université et de la philosophie* (Paris, 1845).

<sup>50</sup> "Discours 3 mai, 1844," *ibid.*

<sup>51</sup> A. Thiers, *Discours parlementaires*, publiées par M. Calmon, 16 vols. (Paris, 1879-1889), VII, 618.

<sup>52</sup> P. Rimbault, *Histoire politique des congrégations religieuses, 1790-1914* (Paris, 1926), p. 117.

Thiers felt that the efforts of Cousin and the latter's two disciples, Quinet and Michelet, had effectually molded public opinion against the religious orders, especially the Jesuits. It was through Cousin that Quinet and Michelet, had effectually molded public opinion against the and Michelet came from homes permeated with eighteenth-century Voltairianism.<sup>54</sup> The former vaunted and advertised his life long hatred of the Catholic Church.<sup>55</sup> At the Collège de France the two friends transformed their classrooms into arsenals against the Jesuits and combined their lectures into a volume, *Les Jésuites*, in which they pretended to "reveal the perfidious hopes of this insatiable order."<sup>56</sup> After publishing in 1859 *Le Prêtre, la femme et la famille*, in which he attacked the supposed Jesuit monopoly of directing consciences, Michelet wrote his apology for democracy, *Le Peuple*, and announced therein that God and *la patrie* are the two truths that parents ought to teach, but "this instruction is impossible under the tyranny of priests."<sup>57</sup>

Not only were the religious congregations as such the target of these almost personal attacks; they were also smeared as the traditional enemy of progress and democracy. The translator of Darwin's *Origin of Species* wrote in his preface: "The doctrine of Darwin is the rational revelation of progress, placing itself in logical opposition to the irrational revelation of the fall. For me the choice is made. I believe in

<sup>53</sup> Edgar Quinet, *Oeuvres complètes*, 28 vols. (Paris, 1857-1879), XIX, 320.

<sup>54</sup> V. Monod, *Jules Michelet* (Paris, 1905), p. 234; and E. Quinet, *Histoire des mes idées* (Paris, 1879), pp. 19, 35, and 54.

<sup>55</sup> Quinet, *op. cit.*, vi, préface. In his introduction to the new edition of Marnix de Sainte Aldegonde's work Quinet, after stating that Marnix showed that Catholicism is a new paganism, added: "For my part I claim the honor of not having desisted for a single day during thirty years to expose the incompatibility of Catholicism with modern civilization. Catholicism must fall." In his letters he revealed the same spirit. Edgar Quinet, *Lettres d'exile*, 4 vols. (Paris, 1885), I, 154-155. In Lettre lxii to Mazzini on July 7, 1854, *ibid.*, p. 149, he urged the Italian leader to cut off the head of Catholicism for the deliverance of the world. In Lettre lxiii to Michelet on July 29, 1854, he mentioned the variation between his Belgian and French editions of Marnix, and, referring to the preface, told how he had colored it for Belgian readers.

<sup>56</sup> *Les Jésuites* was translated into English as *Jesuits and Jesuitism* (London, 1846) with the announcement quoted above.

<sup>57</sup> Jules Michelet, *Le Peuple* (Paris, 1864), p. 253.

progress."<sup>58</sup> The word "progress" served as a magic formula to the Republicans. According to André Siegfried, it meant a push to the left because in "every French community we find the schoolmaster and his followers eager to emancipate the people, while behind the priest, the nobleman, and the rich bourgeois are lined up the conservatives."<sup>59</sup> Besides being catalogued among the "superstitious" and the enemies of progress, the religious teachers were by degrees advertised as opponents of the Revolution and plotters against democracy. Vacherot incorporated these ideas in his *La Démocratie* and expanded his thesis that since a religion of infallibility cannot be harmonized with liberty, toleration, and progress, it is necessarily opposed to the Republic.<sup>60</sup> Jean Baptiste Proudhon, like Vacherot, popularized the accusations against the religious teachers. He, in turn, attempted to show that there is a fundamental antagonism between revolutionary democracy and Catholicism insofar as the latter is a religion of transcendence and revelation. According to Proudhon, the Revolution, by affirming the Absolute, allows a place for the metaphysical without being subject to it.<sup>61</sup>

These agitators impinged their views on the popular mind so that they even gained admittance to official documents pertaining to French education. In his *Rapport* of May 29, 1879, which was a digest of the arguments for legislation against the teaching congregations, M. Spuller quoted Victor Cousin as an authority four times, and cited Vacherot, Duruy, and Paul Bert in support of laic education.<sup>62</sup> To

<sup>58</sup> Clemence Royer, *De l'origine des espèces par voie de sélection sexuelle* (Paris, 1862).

<sup>59</sup> *Op. cit.*, p. 67. Siegfried also quoted favorably François Mauriac's description of the country people in *Le Province* (Paris, 1926), p. 34. "Those who are familiar with the provinces know that contemporary France was born of the mortal sin of envy. The peasant shuts his eyes and casts his vote for the Left, certain that he can make no mistake if he votes against those who wash and go to Mass. He loathes any distinction in dress, occupation, or ideas."

<sup>60</sup> *La Démocratie* (Paris, 1860), chap. iii.

<sup>61</sup> Jean B. Proudhon, *De la justice dans la révolution et dans l'église* (Paris, 1800), p. 123.

<sup>62</sup> "Rapport fait au nom de la commission chargée d'examiner le projet de la loi relatif à la liberté de l'enseignement supérieur," par M. Spuller in *J. O. C.*, May 29, 1879, Annexe No. 1442, p. 8. Combes frequently quoted Cousin's teaching with regard to state supremacy in the school. Cf. *J. O. C.*, March 18, 1901, pp. 1511-1555; and *J. O. S.*, June 21, 1901, pp. 381-382.

terrorize the voters the official reporters also compiled and printed statistics illustrating the startling growth of the unauthorized teaching orders. For example, the Jesuits were listed as having had five houses in France with 162 members in 1820, but in 1880 they had fifty-nine houses with 1500 members.<sup>63</sup>

As this internal struggle in nineteenth-century France was taking shape, foreign entanglements and parallels were developing around it. Otto von Bismarck tried to encourage and support Gambetta in his anticlerical Republican campaign because the imperial chancellor feared the development of a strong monarchy.<sup>64</sup> Accordingly, he plotted to curb the activities of the French bishops against *rapprochement* with Germany.<sup>65</sup> He instructed his ambassadors at the Belgian, Austrian, and Italian courts to object to their respective bishops' protests against Bismarckian legislation.<sup>66</sup> While these diplomatic operations were under way, both Spain and Italy passed laws restricting the activities of the teaching communities.<sup>67</sup> However, Bismarck recalled in his memoirs that he did not favor the Falk laws. "It was only by seeing them in practise," he wrote, "that I became convinced that the legal details had not been properly conceived for the effect they were intended to produce."<sup>68</sup>

Nevertheless Paul Bert, the French *rapporteur* who became notorious for his explosive attack on the clericals,<sup>69</sup> told the German ambassador that Bismarck had made a mistake in the *Kulturkampf* by

<sup>63</sup> "Tableau," *J. O. C.*, May, 29, 1879, Annexe No. 7, p. 46.

<sup>64</sup> Francis A. Arlinghaus, "The Kulturkampf and European Diplomacy, 1871-1875," *Catholic Historical Review*, XXVIII (October, 1942), 340-375.

<sup>65</sup> *Documents diplomatiques français, 1871-1914*, 11 vols. (Paris, 1929-1936), I, 134-135. Otto Fürst von Bismarck confessed in his *Gedanken und Erinnerungen*, 2 vols. (Stuttgart, 1898), II, 123, that he tried "to influence the Pope to curb the French clergy in the interest of peace."

<sup>66</sup> *Documents diplomatiques français*, I, 306.

<sup>67</sup> E. Allison Peers, *Spain, the Church, and the Orders* (London, 1945), pp. 86-98; and S. William Halperin, *Italy and the Vatican at War* (Chicago, 1939), pp. 287-289 and 290-302.

<sup>68</sup> Von Bismarck, *op. cit.*, II, 130.

<sup>69</sup> Paul Bert, *Le Cléricalisme* (Paris, 1900). Joseph Reinach, *Le Ministère Gambetta: histoire et doctrine* (Paris, 1884), p. 267, testified that Paul Bert and Jules Ferry "walked hand in hand, always united to make the school the real seminary of the Republic."

fighting the bishops and even the lower clergy.<sup>70</sup> Bert's pet formula was "Peace to the *curés*, but war on the monks."<sup>71</sup> He explained to Bernard von Bülow that his aim was to abolish religious instruction and to expel the monks because "they are more dangerous to the State than the ordinary cleric. Il faut laïciser la France."<sup>72</sup>

Both parties realized the meaning of the struggle and its implications. In an impressive speech Jules Ferry had announced that "our first duty is to save the souls of the new generation from the influence of those who disdain the political and social order of the world."<sup>73</sup> On the other side the Dominican, Père Didon, oratorically vocalized the attitude of the majority of Catholics toward the repressive legislation for the religious teachers in equally forceful words: "The struggle," he said, "has begun. The battlefield is the country, the army, the universities. Catholicism and Positivism are about to contend for the soul of France."<sup>74</sup> A competitive school system, liberally supported by a laic government, was established in opposition to the schools of the Church congregations. The latter were so hampered by coercive legislation that they could scarcely function.<sup>75</sup>

In this continual struggle during the life of the Third Republic, all such embroilments as the bitter tax dispute and the legislation against the religious associations,<sup>76</sup> the forced implication of Catholics in the Dreyfus affair,<sup>77</sup> and the smearing campaign against the patriotism and possessions of the "business monks" and the "whiskey monks" deepened prejudices against the religious communities and educators. From March 8, 1871, until November 14, 1898, thirty-four legislative pro-

<sup>70</sup> Bernard Fürst von Bülow, *Denkwürdigkeiten*, 4 vols. (Berlin, 1930), IV, 501.

<sup>71</sup> Bert, *op. cit.*, p. 59.

<sup>72</sup> Von Bülow, *op. cit.*, p. 505.

<sup>73</sup> Hanotaux, *op. cit.*, p. 521.

<sup>74</sup> Louis Liard, *L'enseignement supérieur en France, 1789-1893* (Paris, 1894), II, 297-300; also in *Lettres du R. P. Didon à Madame Caroline Commanville, 1874-1895*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1895), II, 42.

<sup>75</sup> Evelyn M. Acomb, *The French Laic Laws, 1879-1889* (New York, 1941), pp. 130-182.

<sup>76</sup> Leo Leonard Rummel, "The Conflicts Converging toward the Special Tax Legislation for the Religious Associations," in "The Third French Republic and the Religious Associations," manuscript, Ph. D. thesis (University of Wisconsin, 1945), pp. 110-179.

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 181-184.



jects were launched to solve the problem of freedom of incorporation.<sup>78</sup> In most of these attempts bitter prejudices against the religious associations frustrated the plans of the lawmakers. In reality the anticlericals would not tolerate freedom for the religious educators technically known as religious associations.<sup>79</sup> Finally Waldeck-Rousseau's association laws of 1901, passed only after the most violent parliamentary disputes, actually curtailed the activities of the religious communities, especially in education. Assuredly they gained no freedom of incorporation.<sup>80</sup> It was the ex-seminarian, Emile Combes, who, as the next premier, interpreted Waldeck-Rousseau's legislation so that it effected the legal death of all religious associations.<sup>81</sup>

But even at the height of the legal controversy concerning the freedom of Catholic education, a learned French Socialist, Georges Sorel, inquired about the collaboration of the Socialists and the Catholics on a humanitarian basis.<sup>82</sup> While a German prisoner in 1941 Léon Blum wrote *A l'Echelle humaine*, in which he advocated the role of the Vatican for promoting international peace<sup>83</sup> and stressed the *rapprochement* of the Catholic social program with Socialism.<sup>84</sup> Both these Socialist leaders, however, objected to a Catholic educational program. In fact, Georges Sorel attributed anticlericalism in France to this struggle: "In 1901 I wrote that 'if the Church were well advised, it would entirely suppress that part of its activities devoted to children; it would do away with schools and workshops; it would thus do away with the principal source of anticlericalism.' What has happened since 1901 surpasses my forecast."<sup>85</sup>

True to the Socialist's prediction the fight continued. At first the followers of Jaurès feared that after the separation of Church and State

<sup>78</sup> Paul Nourrisson, *Histoire légale des congrégations religieuses en France depuis 1789*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1928), II, 65.

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 66-70.

<sup>80</sup> Rummel, "The Legal Status of the Religious Associations under the Law of 1901," *op. cit.*, pp. 249-317.

<sup>81</sup> *Ibid.*, "Waldeck-Rousseau's Successor and His Use of the Association Law of 1901," chap. vii, pp. 339-418.

<sup>82</sup> *La Ruine du monde antique* (Paris, 1901), p. 16.

<sup>83</sup> Léon Blum, *For All Mankind*, translated by W. Pickles (New York, 1936), 1936), pp. 160-161.

<sup>84</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 180.

<sup>85</sup> Georges Sorel, *Réflexions sur la violence* (Paris, 1910), p. 267.

in 1905 the leftists would be deprived of their favorite program. However, the campaigners on rue Valois adopted the slogan "Save our lay schools" as their rallying cry.<sup>86</sup> When the Catholics persisted in denouncing the laic educational program of 1901 and 1904, their opponents utilized the protests to inflame anticlerical prejudices. Sorel admitted that Clemenceau had purposely whipped up popular feelings by conjuring threats of clerical return to power and he even quoted Anatole France's accusation that La Ligue française de l'enseignement had been inspired by fear.<sup>87</sup> Faithful Catholics naturally continued to object to the legislation. On June 25 and 30, 1908, when more drastic proposals were offered in the Chamber, the French bishops launched a campaign against what they considered an official violation of neutrality in education and publicly approved the Association of Fathers of Families to rescue their children from state domination.<sup>88</sup> They had already proclaimed the state textbooks to be propagandizing manuals.<sup>89</sup>

On the anticlerical side the laic school was the most frequently discussed subject in the Chambers. In spite of Aristide Briand's repeated assurance to his supporters that he had been obedient to laic laws and that the "laic school is the cornerstone of the Republic,"<sup>90</sup> his ministry fell within a year because of the anticlericals' displeasure.<sup>91</sup> He retaliated with the significant words: "When you want to kill your dog, you say he is mad. . . . When you want to overthrow a ministry, you accuse it of clericalism and of making a bargain with the religious orders."<sup>92</sup>

Just before the end of the ten-year period for the final execution of the July 7, 1904, decree to terminate all religious instruction in state schools, World War I brought the clash to a standstill. The majority of the exiled male religious teachers returned home to defend *la patrie* in the world battles. At that moment there was no question of an

<sup>86</sup> D. W. Brogan, *France Under the Republic* (New York, 1939), p. 434.

<sup>87</sup> Sorel, *op. cit.*, p. 276.

<sup>88</sup> D. Gurnaud, "Lettres de cardinaux, archevêques et évêques de France," *L'Ecole et la famille* (Paris, 1909), pp. 296-304.

<sup>89</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 1-66.

<sup>90</sup> *J. O. C.*, June 9, 1910, p. 119.

<sup>91</sup> *J. O. C.*, February 24, 1911, pp. 1196-1204.

<sup>92</sup> Brogan, *op. cit.*, p. 434.

illicit association. Immediately after the victorious conclusion of the war a wave of gratitude upsurged toward the war-scarred teachers. In his memorable discourse of November 7, 1917, for formulating the policies of the *bloc*, M. Millerand advocated that "religious should have the same right as lay persons to form associations under the regulations of the law for the purpose of defending and of spreading their opinion. . . . The Republic of victory is the property of all. It has the right to be generous, liberal, and tolerant."<sup>93</sup> But within three years there was a change. The Catholics missed their opportunity to safeguard legally their freedom of education. By 1924 the old fight was on. In his letter to "cher Blum," M. Herriot, the mouthpiece of the *Cartel des gauches*, promised to apply the old laic legislation without weakness<sup>94</sup> and guaranteed the execution of his pledge in his ministerial declaration.<sup>95</sup>

The same Léon Blum campaigned for a like purpose. In a speech at Mans on March 28, 1925, he brought the conflict into the foreground: "We wish to pursue the fight against the Church in the educational field, and we say today that for us freedom of education is not an intangible dogma. . . . We conceive that in our system of education the State has not only the obligation but also the exclusive right to teach."<sup>96</sup> The actual fulfillment of this anticlerical program was unsuccessful chiefly because of the courage of the Catholics in Alsace-Lorraine.<sup>97</sup>

In 1929 the Church's condemnation of *L'Action française* is credited as marking the end of aggressive anticlericalism in France.<sup>98</sup> Still in the midst of this lull there have been worries and disputes but always support for *l'école unique* on the part of the politicians.<sup>99</sup> In spite of the state paternalism toward its own system of education, however, the free school continued to prosper. At least the *Tablet*

<sup>93</sup> Yves de la Brière, "Chronique du mouvement religieux: Les lois laïques et le sort des congrégations," *Etudes*, CLXXX (September 5, 1924), 618.

<sup>94</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 606-609.

<sup>95</sup> *J. O. C.*, June 17, 1924, p. 85.

<sup>96</sup> Maurice Vallet, "Le Laïcisme d'enseignement actuel: Etapes et progrès nouveaux," *Etudes*, CLXXXIX (November 5, 1926) 266.

<sup>97</sup> "Une Voix Lorraine," *Etudes*, CLXXX (September 5, 1924) 599-604.

<sup>98</sup> Yves R. Simon, *La Grande Crise de la République française* (Montreal, 1941), pp. 74 and 81.

<sup>99</sup> Redmond, *op. cit.*, pp. 34-38.

as late as 1936 quoted from an article in *L'Education nationale* by a government teacher, J. Theo, that the free schools had increased to 11,665 with 965,000 students whereas the official schools had remained stationary. The author, a state employee, blamed the rowdy tactics of some Socialist and Communist teachers for this growth of the free school.<sup>100</sup> Naturally such violation of neutrality would foster national disunity. Moreover, the popular leaders of the Socialists, and especially of the Communists, have been unfortunately contradictory in their profession of friendliness toward the Church. Léon Blum would have difficulty in living down the epithet "dirty Blum" because of his immoral tract on marriage.<sup>101</sup> Maurice Thorez in a 1936 radio talk said: "We extend our hand to you Catholics." But within two months after the election he professed official atheism for his party.<sup>102</sup>

After the liberation the old conflict became more evident in the discussion on the new constitution. In the original form of the draft the first article was "La France est une République indivisible, démocratique et sociale." However, on August 29, 1946, the National Assembly voted by 274 to 272 against freedom of education, inserted the confusing word *laïque* in the first article, and in the preamble stressed that "the organization of free and laic education in all degrees is the duty of the State."<sup>103</sup> The socialists and communists were able to gain this laic victory only by appealing to the eleven Moslem deputies from North Africa to vote against the Catholics. Because the French government recognizes and subsidizes Moslem schools they acted against their own principles.<sup>104</sup>

This is the controversy that has divided the Third Republic, and the ambiguous word *laïque* is the source of the disagreements that threaten to badger the Fourth Republic. The French bishops in their *Declaration on the Human Person, the Family, and Society* of November 13, 1945, warned the State against attempting to paralyze religious activities. They pointed out that

only too recent examples, whether in France between 1903 and 1910 or in other countries where a statist doctrine has ruled, show us that when a

---

<sup>100</sup> *Tablet* (London), CLXX (July 2, 1937) 130.

<sup>101</sup> Simon, *op. cit.*, p. 139.

<sup>102</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 145.

<sup>103</sup> *Journal officiel de la république française*, (October 28, 1946), pp. 9167-9168, published the approved constitution.

<sup>104</sup> *Tablet* (London), CLXXXVIII (October 5, 1946) 175.

state thus betrays its true mission in order to make itself the instrument of a philosophical system, it quickly becomes totalitarian and persecuting. . . If a state professes an official atheism in order not to offend the unbelief of some, it wounds the belief of greater numbers of citizens—those who are members of the various religions, and the multitude of those who believe in the Supreme Being.<sup>105</sup>

This recognition is in the French tradition because “since the first written constitution of the French Revolution, three constitutions—1791, 1793, and 1795—have been declared or proclaimed in the presence of the Supreme Being.” Even Paul Reynaud, the ex-premier of the Third Republic, thinks that unless these old wounds are healed, the French are “not stripped of the totalitarianism that shackled them during the occupation.”<sup>106</sup>

*Madison, Wisconsin*

<sup>105</sup> “A Statement by the Archbishops and Bishops of France,” *op. cit.*, p. 288.

<sup>106</sup> Reynaud, *op. cit.*, p. 8.

## MISCELLANY

---

### THE TWENTY-EIGHTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE AMERICAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION, CLEVELAND, OHIO, DECEMBER 27-29, 1947.

The twenty-eighth annual meeting of the Association was held at the Hotel Cleveland, Cleveland, Ohio, on December 27-29, 1947. The various sessions were well attended and they would have drawn larger crowds had it not been for the blizzard which struck New York and the eastern seaboard the day after Christmas and compelled a number of our members to cancel their trip to Cleveland at the last moment. There were members registered from as far west as Denver and as far south as San Antonio, as well as from Toronto, Boston, and other distant cities among the 100 registrations received at the desk.

The meeting opened with the annual luncheon conference on Saturday, December 27, with President Engel-Janosi acting as chairman. There were eighty in attendance at the luncheon. All regretted that the New York storm had prevented Monsignor Thomas J. McMahon, national secretary of the Catholic Near East Welfare Association, from reaching Cleveland to read his paper on "Rites and Rights: Eastern Catholic Minorities in the United States." It would have been a fitting supplement to the fine paper of Father Stephen C. Gulovich, chancellor of the Greek Rite Diocese of Pittsburgh, on "The Byzantine-Slavonic Catholics of America." Father Gulovich traced the difficulties encountered by these immigrant peoples of the Byzantine Slavonic rites in the United States, and all were agreed that his paper opened up vistas never before realized by most of the Latin Rite Catholics who composed his audience. Illness kept Father Desmond A. Schmal, S.J., of St. Mary of the Lake Seminary, Mundelein, from serving as chairman of this interesting conference on the Eastern Catholics.

As a substitute for the speakers who could not be present Father George B. Flahiff, C.S.B., of the Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies at Toronto and new member of the Association's Executive Council, kindly agreed to explain the origins and character of the work of the Institute and its relation to the University of Toronto. Likewise Monsignor Michael J. Hynes of St. Mary's Seminary, Cleveland, was generous enough to speak about his work on the centennial history of the Diocese of Cleveland, and particularly of the outstanding accomplishments of Bishop Richard Gilmour (1872-1891). While everyone regretted the absence of Monsignor McMahon and Father Schmal, they found the extemporaneous talks of Monsignor Hynes and Father Flahiff highly informative and enjoyable, and these two men were publicly thanked by both the President and the Secretary for stepping into the breach and helping to fill the emergency in so generous and able a way.



The business meeting of the Association that afternoon drew between fifty and sixty members to hear the able presidential address of Professor Engel-Janosi, which was published in the January issue of the REVIEW, and to listen to the annual reports of the other officers and committee chairmen, which are published in this issue of our quarterly journal. In the absence of Monsignor Cartwright, the treasurer's report was read by Brother J. Robert Lane, F.S.C., of St. Mary's College, Winona.

The joint session of our Association with the American Historical Association on Sunday morning, December 28, was a great success, so popular in fact that from an original assignment of two small rooms the audience ultimately overflowed into four adjoining rooms and at no time throughout the session was there seating space to accommodate entirely the crowd of around 250 who wished to participate in the meeting. The general subject was "Protestants and the Council of Trent." Professor Kuttner of the Catholic University of America and Professor Pauck of the University of Chicago both acquitted themselves splendidly in their formal papers, and the discussion, led by Father Edward A. Ryan, S.J., of Woodstock College, and joined by Professor Conyers Read, new First Vice President of the American Historical Association, and others was lively and friendly. A death in his family caused the chairman of this session, Father Frederick E. Welfle, S.J., of John Carroll University, to be absent, but his place was capably filled by Mr. Donald P. Gavin of the Department of History of John Carroll. The success of these joint sessions between our two Associations in the last few years makes it obvious that in the future larger rooms must be engaged to accommodate the numbers who wish to attend them.

The final session of the Association's meeting was called to order at 2:30 P.M. on Monday afternoon, December 29, by Monsignor Hynes, the chairman. An audience of about seventy-five was present to hear the two solid papers of Father Clarence J. Ryan, S.J., of Marquette University on "Theories of State-Church Relationships in Seventeenth-Century England," and Professor Alvan S. Ryan of the University of Massachusetts on "English Catholic Social Thought and the Great Victorians." The discussion leaders of this session were Mr. Donald P. Gavin of John Carroll University and Mrs. Tibor Payzs of the University of Detroit.

At the closing session of the Association's meeting in Cleveland the chairman called for a vote on the two following resolutions which were read by the Secretary of the Association and unanimously adopted:

WHEREAS, the Right Reverend Peter Guilday was the founder and first permanent secretary of the American Catholic Historical Association, and,

WHEREAS, he gave unselfishly of his splendid talents for the advancement of the Association for a period of over

twenty-one years until ill health forced his retirement in February, 1941, and

WHEREAS, the membership of this Association wishes to give public recognition of its sadness in his death and its enduring appreciation of the inestimable benefits which this Association derived from his dynamic leadership for over twenty-one years, and its recognition, as well, for his memorable work as editor of the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW from the founding of the Association's quarterly journal in April, 1915, to his death in 1947,

BE IT RESOLVED, that this closing session of the twenty-eighth annual meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association register its sorrow and sense of loss in the death of Monsignor Guilday, and direct that this formal resolution be published in the account of the Cleveland meeting in the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW of April, 1948.

WHEREAS, the Diocese of Cleveland is this year celebrating its centennial and

WHEREAS, the American Catholic Historical Association was founded in the city of Cleveland on December 30, 1919, and has enjoyed Cleveland's hospitality again during the centennial year of the diocese,

BE IT RESOLVED, that the American Catholic Historical Association takes this opportunity to extend its greetings and congratulations to the bishops, priests, and people of the Diocese of Cleveland upon the completion of their first hundred years in the service of God's Church in northeastern Ohio.

The twenty-ninth annual meeting of the Association will be held at the Hotel Mayflower, Washington, D. C., on Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday, December 28-30, 1948. The 1949 meeting will be held in Boston and the thirty-first annual gathering will convene at the Hotel Stevens in Chicago in 1950.

The reports of the officers of the Association and of the committee chairmen for 1947 follow.

#### REPORT OF THE TREASURER:—

##### ACCOUNT I—GENERAL FUND

Investments—December 15, 1946.....	\$5,500.00
Cash on hand—December 15, 1946.....	\$2,713.95

## Receipts:

Annual dues .....	3,567.15	
Interest from investments.....	137.50	
	<hr/>	<hr/>
Total .....	\$6,418.60	\$5,500.00

## Disbursements:

## Office expenses:

Rent of office and telephone service..\$ 74.00		
Supplies and service 111.91		
Secretary—salary 829.12	\$1,015.03	
	<hr/>	
Meeting expenses—1946 .....	301.74	
Rental of safety deposit box....	7.80	
<i>Catholic Historical Review</i> ....	2,504.00	
Exchange on checks .....	2.17	3,830.74
	<hr/>	<hr/>
Balance on hand—December 15, 1947.....	\$2,587.86	
Investments— December 15, 1947.....		\$5,500.00

## ACCOUNT II—REVOLVING ACCOUNT

## PUBLICATION OF DOCUMENTS

Cash on hand, December 15, 1946..... \$1,181.36

## Receipts:

<i>United States Ministers to the Papal States</i> ....	\$150.00	
<i>Consular Relations between the United States and the Papal States</i> .....	161.50	311.50

Total receipts..... 1,492.86

## Disbursements:

None

Cash on hand, December 15, 1947..... \$1,492.86

## SUMMARY

Investments—Account I..... \$5,500.00

## Cash on hand:

Account I.....	\$2,587.86
Account II.....	1,492.86

Total cash on hand.....\$4,080.72

Respectfully submitted,

JOHN K. CARTWRIGHT, *Treasurer*

## REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLICATIONS:—

The Association did not promote any publication during the year 1947. The inventory on the past publications of the Association shows the following:

Document Series. Volume I. *United States Ministers to the Papal States*. Edited by Leo F. Stock. For the year ending June 30, 1947: thirty copies sold during the year; thirty-eight copies remaining in stock for sale.

Document Series. Volume II. *Consular Relations between the United States and the Papal States*. Edited by Leo F. Stock. For the year ending June 30, 1947: seventy-two copies sold during the year; 701 copies remaining in stock for sale.

Miscellaneous Studies Series. *The Formative Years of the Catholic University of America*. By John Tracy Ellis. 168 copies were sold during the year, 341 copies remaining in stock for sale.

The Miscellaneous Studies is, as the members know, a new series. In the publication of its first and to date only volume, the above work by the Reverend John Tracy Ellis, the series has made an excellent beginning. This series can be an important contribution to American Catholic history and the committee trusts that it will attract outstanding manuscripts for future publication.

The Committee on Publications would like to offer the Association a suggestion. There is a real need among college and graduate students and professors of history for a collection of documents on American Catholic history. Such a volume is needed not only for the study of church history but for a better study and understanding of the political, economic, cultural, and religious history of the United States. All of us have realized the deficiencies of the fine collection of *Documents of American History* by Henry Steele Commager on this score. A companion volume is badly needed. The Association is in the position to fill that need. This committee suggest that the Association consider the possibility of filling this need in the immediate future. It would, the committee thinks, be a contribution deeply appreciated by the members of the Association.

Respectfully submitted,

WILLIAM LEO LUCEY, S.J., *Chairman*  
J. RYAN BEISER  
J. WALTER COLEMAN

## REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON NOMINATIONS:—

The Committee on Nominations submits the following names for officers and committee personnel for 1948 on the basis of returns from the ballot sent out to the membership of the Association and of its own recommendation for the Committee on Program for the coming year:

President	Francis A. Arlinghaus, University of Detroit
First Vice-President	Henry S. Lucas, University of Washington
Second Vice-President	Edward T. Harrington, Regis College, Weston
Secretary	John Tracy Ellis, Catholic University of America
Treasurer	John K. Cartwright, St. Matthew's Cathedral, Washington, D. C.

## Executive Council (for a three-year term):

George B. Flahiff, C.S.B., Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto  
 Demetrius B. Zema, S.J., Fordham University\*

Committee on Nominations: Walter W. Wilkinson, Georgetown University, *chairman*  
 Sister Mary Borgias Palm, Notre Dame College, South Euclid, Ohio  
 Jasper W. Cross, Jr., St. Louis University

Committee on Program: William D. Hoyt, Jr., Loyola College, Baltimore, *chairman*  
 William J. Coleman, M.M., Maryknoll College, Lakewood, New Jersey  
 Bernard E. Ransing, C.S.C., Holy Cross College, Washington, D. C.

## Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize:

Francis X. Glimm, Seminary of the Immaculate Conception, Huntington

Respectfully submitted,

EDWARD P. LILLY, *Chairman*

SISTER THOMAS AQUINAS CARROLL, R.S.M.

CYRIL SMITH

\* Father Zema died on February 1, 1948.

## REPORT OF THE SECRETARY:—

It will be twenty-eight years next Tuesday since the late Monsignor Guilday gathered a small group of about fifty friends of Catholic history in this city of Cleveland to found our Association. I know the members

of the Association everywhere shared our sadness last summer when they learned that the distinguished career of our founder and first permanent secretary had been closed in death on July 31. In his inaugural address on that December 30, 1919, Peter Guilday traced the outlines which a society such as ours should take, and in reading again the closing sentences of his statement of purpose we believe we can honestly say that the Association has gone a long way in the last twenty-eight years to translate that ideal into reality. Monsignor Guilday said on that occasion:

... the one ultimate end of such an organization, the one doctrine upon which it is built, the only one upon which it may rest in all surety of purpose, is to promote among those who rejoice in the name of Catholic a more intimate knowledge of the history of the Kingdom of God on earth.<sup>1</sup>

To that ideal, sounded at our birth, I think we can claim in all modesty that we have been true.

My first word today is one of gratitude to Father Cardinal and Drs. Czajkowski and Fitzsimons for the attractive program which they have assembled for our instruction and enjoyment during these three days in Cleveland. Mapping programs of this kind entails a tremendous amount of correspondence and a serious expenditure of time and effort. The Committee on Program for 1947 gave generously of both their talent and time, even to the sacrifice of a trip to Chicago last February for a meeting of their group. I wish also to thank in a special way Mr. Donald P. Gavin of John Carroll University, who single-handedly carried out all the details concerning the local arrangements for our meeting and who acted as a most intelligent and resourceful liaison officer between our own Association and Professor Donald Grove Barnes of Western Reserve University and the other officials of the American Historical Association. I am sure I bespeak your sentiments when I extend our thanks as well to our President, Professor Engel-Janosi, to the speakers at the luncheon this noon, and to the authors of papers and the discussion leaders in the sessions of tomorrow and Monday afternoon. It is due to their care and pains that we are offered during these three days in Cleveland genuine intellectual stimulation, and we want them to know that we are grateful.

It is gratifying to be able to tell you that for the first time in our twenty-eight years of life our total membership has now passed the 800 mark.

The pertinent figures for the year 1947 are as follows:

Membership, December 15, 1946.....	788
Resignations .....	5

<sup>1</sup> Peter Guilday, "The American Catholic Historical Association," *Catholic Historical Review*, VI (April, 1920), 13-14.



Deaths .....	18	
Delinquents .....	34	
		<hr/> 57
		<hr/> 731
Renewals .....	4	
New members .....	73	
		<hr/> 77
Membership, December 15, 1947.....	808	

This final figure represents twenty above last year's total of 788, and a rise of 171 in the total membership of the Association since 1942. The growth during the last five years has been constant, although the loss of members in any single year continues to be heavy. When I remind you that during the year just closing we lost through resignations, deaths, and delinquencies in dues a total of fifty-seven members you will appreciate what a handicap we have to overcome each year before we can even begin to count an increase. The number of deaths in our ranks has been high during 1947. The following members were called in death since our meeting a year ago in New York:

Most Reverend John J. Cantwell  
 Most Reverend Michael J. Curley  
 Right Reverend Daniel Doody  
 Right Reverend Leo F. Gassler  
 Right Reverend Peter Guilday  
 Right Reverend Cornelius J. Kane  
 Reverend Cornelius J. Kirkfleet, O.Praem.  
 Sister Mary Celeste Leger, R.S.M.  
 Right Reverend James J. McCaffrey  
 Most Reverend Thomas H. McLaughlin  
 Reverend Francis A. Mullin  
 Right Reverend Henry J. Noon  
 Very Reverend J. Hugh O'Donnell, C.S.C.  
 Reverend James G. O'Neill  
 Reverend Hugh Radigan, O.F.M.  
 Most Reverend James H. Ryan  
 Right Reverend Joseph V. Tracy  
 Very Reverend Edward J. Walsh, C.M.

May their souls rest in peace!

The new members and their addresses are as follows:

- Reverend Joseph G. Bailey,  
232 Washington Street, Ogdensburg, New York
- Reverend Myles M. Bourke, St. Joseph's Seminary, Yonkers 4, New York
- Reverend Ignatius Brady, O.F.M.,  
Duns Scotus College, Detroit 19, Michigan
- Mother M. Byles, Manhattanville College of the Sacred Heart,  
Convent Avenue at 133rd Street, West, New York City 27
- Most Reverend L. Abel Caillouet,  
St. Joseph's Church, 423 Main Street, Baton Rouge, Louisiana
- Reverend Gerard Carluccio, O.S.B.,  
Librarian, St. Paul's Abbey, Newton, New Jersey
- Reverend Robert E. Carson, O.Praem.,  
920 Christian Street, Philadelphia 47, Pennsylvania
- Reverend Francis P. Cassidy,  
Catholic University of America, Washington 17, D. C.
- Sister Agnes Cecilia, S.N.D.,  
Notre Dame Convent, 22 Stone Street, Salinas, California
- Most Reverend John P. Cody, 3810 Lindell Boulevard, St. Louis 8, Missouri
- Reverend John P. Cook,  
Catholic University of America, Washington 17, D. C.
- Dr. Jasper W. Cross, Jr., . . . . . St. Louis University, St. Louis 3, Missouri
- Mr. Robert G. DeSantis, . . . . . 355 13th Street, Brooklyn 15, New York
- Reverend Nicholas W. Dohony, . . 317 S. Broadway, Baltimore 31, Maryland
- Reverend Edward J. Dunne, S.J.,  
Georgetown University, Washington 7, D. C.
- St. Elizabeth Teacher Training Institute,  
St. Elizabeth's Convent, Allegany, New York
- Mr. John J. Foley, . . . . . 22 Gifford Avenue, Jersey City, New Jersey
- Sister M. Anna Daniel Frawley  
College of Saint Joseph, Framingham, Massachusetts
- Mr. William L. Galvin,  
4407 Bedford Place, Baltimore 18, Maryland (life member)
- Reverend John J. Gavigan, O.S.A.,  
Merrimack College, Andover, Massachusetts
- Mr. Donald P. Gavin, . . . . . 12413 Vashti Avenue, Cleveland 8, Ohio
- Miss Betty Pat Graham, 2853 Washington Avenue, Granite City, Illinois
- Captain John B. Heffernan, 3029 Que Street, N.W., Washington 7, D. C.
- Mr. Louis J. Heizmann, . . . . . 218 N. 5th Street, Reading, Pennsylvania
- Dr. William D. Hoyt, Jr., . . . . . Loyola College, Baltimore 10, Maryland
- Brother Alexander Joseph, . . . . . Manhattan College, New York City 63
- Mother Mary Joseph, . . . . . Caldwell College, Caldwell, New Jersey
- Professor Stephan G. Kuttner, 1600 Otis Street, N.E., Washington 18, D.C.

Reverend J. N. Lutz.....514 Seymour Street, Syracuse, New York  
 Reverend Charles H. Lynch,

Our Lady of Providence Seminary, Warwick Neck, Rhode Island  
 Reverend Thomas F. Maher, 460 Madison Avenue, New York City 22  
 Most Reverend Joseph M. Marling, C.Pp.S.,

2800 Main Street, Kansas City 8, Missouri  
 Reverend Stanley G. Mathews, Cardinal Hayes High School,  
 650 Grand Concourse, New York City 51

Most Reverend Thomas J. McDonnell,  
 109 E. 38th Street, New York City 16  
 Reverend Francis Meehan, C.SS.R.,

Mount Saint Alphonsus Seminary, Esopus, New York  
 Mrs. Annabelle M. Melville, St. Joseph's College, Emmitsburg, Maryland  
 Mexico City College Library, San Luis Potosi 154, Mexico, D.F., Mexico  
 Reverend Frank P. Mikus,

Catholic University of America, Washington 17, D. C.  
 Mother Jane Miller,

San Francisco College for Women, San Francisco 18, California  
 Reverend James P. Moran,

600 Burton Street, S.E., Grand Rapids 7, Michigan  
 Sister Mary Doris Mulvey, O.P.....Rosary College, River Forest, Illinois  
 Reverend Francis X. Murphy, C.SS.R.,

Mount Saint Alphonsus Seminary, Esopus, New York  
 Sister M. Eleanor Nash, C.S.J.,

Fontbonne College, St. Louis 5, Missouri  
 Mr. J. J. Neville.....Apartado 167, Cali, Colombia  
 Mother M. O'Callaghan,

College of the Sacred Heart, Grand Coteau, Louisiana  
 Reverend Thomas D. O'Donnell, S.M.,

Marist College, 335 Ivy Street, N.E., Atlanta 3, Georgia  
 Reverend Clare J. O'Dwyer,

2801 N. Charles Street, Baltimore 18, Maryland  
 Professor William Aylott Orton,

135 Vernon Street, Northampton, Massachusetts  
 Professor John Perry Pritchett....Queens College, Flushing, New York

Reverend Arnold L. Rodriguez, O.F.M.,  
 29 Cedar Lane, N.W., Washington 14, D. C.

Mrs. Louise Carey Rosett.....171 E. 74th Street, New York City  
 Reverend William H. Russell,

Catholic University of America, Washington 17, D. C.  
 Mr. Donald F. Shea.....St. Joseph's College, Collegeville, Indiana  
 Reverend John A. Silvia,

Church of St. Peter the Apostle, Provincetown, Massachusetts

Professor Joseph F. Sinzer,

St. John's University, 75 Lewis Avenue, Brooklyn 6, New York  
Dr. Marshall Smelser.....Box 116, Notre Dame, Indiana

Professor Raymond J. Sontag,

6208 30th Street, N. W., Washington 15, D. C.

Reverend Paul M. Stimmler, M.S.C., Mission House, Sparta, Wisconsin

Mother Kathryn Sullivan, Manhattanville College of the Sacred Heart,

Convent Avenue at 133rd Street, West, New York City 27

Miss Mary Synon....1246 Monroe Street, N. E., Washington 17, D. C.

Reverend Vincent Tegeder, O.S.B.,

St. John's University, Collegeville, Minnesota

Mother M. B. Tenney, Manhattanville College of the Sacred Heart,

Convent Avenue at 133rd Street, West, New York City 27

Sister M. Teresa, O.S.F., SS. Peter and Paul Convent,

726 South St. Clair Street, Toledo, Ohio

Right Reverend William A. Toolen,

901 Poplar Grove Street, Baltimore 16, Maryland

Reverend Charles J. Travers,

St. Patrick's College, County Cavan, Ireland

Most Reverend John P. Treacy.....Box 795, La Crosse, Wisconsin

Right Reverend Louis C. Vaeth,

3812 Edmondson Avenue, Baltimore 29, Maryland

Reverend Richard Walsh, C.S.P.,

Newman Hall, University of California, Berkeley 4, California

Mother F. Weston, Dean, Manhattanville College of the Sacred Heart,

Convent Avenue at 133rd Street, West, New York City 27

Reverend Thomas A. Whelan, 1008 W. 37th Street, Baltimore 11, Maryland

Mr. Eugene P. Willging,

Catholic University of America, Washington 17, D. C.

Reverend Henry F. Wolfe, 888 King Street, Charleston, South Carolina

Mr. Francis J. Zimnoch,

College of New Rochelle, New Rochelle, New York

Each year the secretary reports to our business meeting the general condition of our quarterly journal, the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW. A year ago in New York I stated that on October 1, 1946, the deficit in the finances of the REVIEW stood at \$145.01. In the intervening months the costs of printing have in no way been reduced; in fact, they have increased. When I tell you that the October, 1947, issue of the REVIEW cost over \$800 for printing alone you will understand, I am sure, why the editors are compelled—much against their will—to assent to a rigid limitation of 128 pages per issue. This is the reason why you sometimes receive issues from which the brief notices are missing entirely and not infrequently an

issue with very few book reviews included. We feel that our readers wish to see at least two major articles in each issue, and for that reason we are forced—as will be true of the issue of January, 1948—to withdraw whole sections of the reviews in order to keep the entire issue within 128 pages and, too, somewhat within the limits of the REVIEW's pocketbook. It is for the same reason that the book review editor is often insistent with prospective reviewers that they remain within rather narrow limits in writing their reviews. No one desires more than the editors to see the costs of printing reduced so that we may go back to publishing a quarterly issue of around 150 pages, but I feel sure you will all agree it would be foolhardy in view of present costs for us to disregard the principle of trying to keep our finances in a sound condition.

In spite of the high costs of printing, however, we were able to bring the business of the REVIEW to a close at the end of the fiscal year last June 30, 1947, with a surplus of \$1,022.64. The present bank balance, however, shows a deficit of \$295.49, which we hope may be overtaken by next June 30 as was the case last year. These deficits are greatly increased, of course, each time we pay for the printing costs of an issue of the REVIEW. It is pleasant to report that the present number of subscriptions to our journal—apart from the 808 members of the Association—stands at a total of 405. This represents a gain of thirty-five subscriptions over the figure of 370 reported to you a year ago. With 127 exchanges at the present time, it means that the REVIEW now goes out four times a year to a grand total of 1,340 persons and institutions. Since 1942 the subscriptions to our journal have risen from 276 to 405, or a gain of 129 in five years. While this is encouraging it still does not represent nearly the total number of subscribers which the REVIEW should be able to command. Insofar as materials submitted for publication are concerned, during 1947 the editors received twenty-two manuscripts, the same number as reported for 1946. Of these twelve either are already published or will appear in the January and April, 1948, issues. Ten manuscripts were rejected. The rejection of manuscripts is never a pleasant task, but the editors feel that in general the membership of the Association is satisfied with the policies which they have been pursuing in insisting on a high quality of scholarship in the articles accepted for publication. In the delicate matter of rejection slips the managing editor of the REVIEW has always endeavored to be polite in declining such offerings, but he has not yet advanced to the refinement of our oriental brothers in this regard if Vincent Starrett's quotation of a sample Chinese rejection slip in his recent work, *Books and Bipedes*, be typical. This particular sample read as follows:

We read your manuscript with boundless delight. By the sacred ashes of our ancestors, we swear that we have never dipped into a book of such overwhelming mastery. If we were to publish this book it would be im-

possible in the future to issue any book of a lower standard. As it is unthinkable that within the next 10,000 years we shall find its equal, we are, to our great regret, compelled to return this divine work, and beg you a thousand times to forgive our action.

That, indeed, *is* editorial courtesy!

The committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize did not feel that there was anything of sufficient distinction published during the year by an American Catholic historian or on a subject relating to the Catholic Church to warrant giving the prize for 1947. It is to be hoped, however, that the coming year will produce several outstanding items in the field of Catholic history, or from the pens of Catholic historians, to justify the committee in awarding the prize for 1948.

In general our finances, as you heard from the report of Monsignor Cartwright, are in a sound condition. The present bank balance represents a sum of \$126.09 less than that of 1946 but, in a time of inflation such as we are now passing through, we can thankfully say it is still a healthy margin. Father Lucey, in his report of the Committee on Publications, has offered a very worthwhile suggestion which should engage the serious consideration of our members interested in publishing, as it is through means such as this that we can, in a really practical way, serve the hundreds of Catholic teachers of history throughout the nation. While the secretary has no power of himself to launch a project such as this for the publication of a volume of documents in American Catholic history he can say that the executive office will be glad to act as a clearinghouse of information and co-ordination of effort on the part of members interested in participating in a work of this kind. The report of the Committee on Nominations received a good response from the membership in the form of the ballots returned to the executive office during the past few weeks. In all there were 218 ballots returned which represent a high percentage of our membership who took the pains to function actively in this important matter of choosing our officers and committees for 1948.

My final word today must be one of gratitude to each of you for your continued loyalty and for your coming on here to Cleveland to help make our twenty-eighth annual meeting a success. Regardless of the labors which the authors of papers might expend and regardless, too, of the careful preparation given to their assignments by the discussion leaders, their efforts would seem in good measure a waste of precious time and talent did they not have the stimulus of your interested presence to greet them. To each of you, then, a blessed and happy new year with the hope that when we assemble in Washington at the Hotel Mayflower in Christmas week of 1948 we may see you all again!

Respectfully submitted,

JOHN TRACY ELLIS, *Secretary*



## BOOK REVIEWS

### GENERAL CHURCH HISTORY

*Documents of the Christian Church*. Selected and edited by Henry Bettenson. [World's Classics, Galaxy Edition, No. 2.] (New York and London: Oxford University Press. 1947. Pp. xvi, 457. \$1.75.)

Originally published in England in 1943 and reprinted in 1944, in the World's Classics (No. 495), this new and attractive edition of larger format at once proves the earlier popularity of this collection and assures its further success. Among the many manuals of this kind, no single volume offers the English reader this range of documents of universal interest from the origins of Christian history down to our own times.

The editor explains the aims and principles of his selection in a prefatory note: (a) "... to provide illustrations of the development of the Church and of her doctrines for the benefit of the general reader and the general student ..." (p. v); (b) "... to give a few documents at some length rather than a multitude of scraps, and to prefer ... groups of connected documents to an impartial sprinkling of discontinuous material ..." (*ibid.*) (c) "... here may be announced ... that this book is compiled from an Anglican standpoint, and that the Church of England receives a proportion of illustrations which is only in perspective from that point of view" (p. vi.). While texts are unaffected by an editor's position, the character of a collection as a whole is not, and to know the aims and spirit that guide the compiler, is to increase rather than lessen its utility. The editor is quite right in saying: "It is unlikely that any two persons could be found who should agree on what should be included in such a book and what omitted; nor ... on the arrangement to be imposed on the material once selected" (p. v). If this be true for those who share his position and the ecclesiology proper to it, which supplies the whole framework of the book, it is reasonably to be expected to hold of those who do not. But there is much more to commend than to criticize in the manner in which Mr. Bettenson has accomplished his clearly defined task.

The documents are drawn from some well known manuals, as well as from the large collections, with chief indebtedness to those of Denzinger, Mirbt, Kidd, and Gee and Hardy. In addition to the two last named, other earlier collections were used for the translations. The annotations, for which "the editor claims no originality, except for any errors or ineptitudes they may contain" (p. vii), are based chiefly on Bethune-Baker, *Introduction to the History of Early Christian Doctrine*, for Part I—to the Council of Chalcedon; and in M. Deanesly, *A History of the Medieval Church*, and J. W. C. Wand (presently Bishop of London), *History of the Modern Church*, for Part II. Within these main divisions the material

is arranged under topical sections, with doctrinal development given fullest illustration in Part I and English religious history occupying about a half of the longer Part II. Other sections here include: 'Empire and Papacy,' 'Monasticism and the Friars,' 'Conciliar Movement' (two excerpts), 'Reformation on the Continent,' 'The Roman Church from the Reformation to the Present,' etc. Post-Reformation English documents are the most notable additions to the earlier manual collections.

Readers of the REVIEW, familiar with the works mentioned, will find them faithfully used by the editor, who has done well to handle so neatly this mass of material embracing so much ecclesiastical history. Some details, however, merit attention, especially for possible use of the book among general students. St. Hippolytus is usually considered the first anti-pope, not Novatian (p. 117, n. 1). St. Benedict of Nursia was born there, not at Rome (p. 164). The phrase "... with one pope at Avignon and an anti-pope in Rome" (p. 192), cannot claim the authority of Miss Deanesly's erudition. An incredible translation of Gratian, *Decretum* I, D. 40. c. 6, where *primo mancipio gehennae* refers to the devil, not the pope,—as Luther himself, following the *Glossa*, understood the text, and is required both by grammar and Christian tradition—is handed on from Robinson (p. 276, n. 2). The statement that the promulgation of *Ineffabilis Deus* "... was one of the fruits of that Ultramontanism, encouraged by the restored Jesuits, which in the pontificate of Pius IX produced also the Syllabus of Errors and the Decree of Infallibility" (p. 380), reflects a bias rather than a standpoint and makes a tendentious introduction to those documents. In the *Syllabus* itself (pp. 381 ff.), *latitudinarismus* is poorly rendered by 'toleration' in § 3; 'Communism and Secret Societies' should have been left among the social plagues listed in § 4; *civilis principatus* and *civile imperium* are rendered by 'civil power' and 'temporal power' respectively in § 9, which are open to misunderstanding.

The introduction to the Vatican decree of infallibility points up the opposition to it in the Church, "... notably that of Döllinger of Munich, who voted against it at the Council" (p. 383). This slip gives an entirely false turn to Dr. Döllinger's much-discussed absence from Rome and his relations with the council, where he would have had no title to vote even had he been present. The conduct of those who did vote against it was historically more noteworthy.

In the excerpt from Leo XIII's *Apostolicae curae*, on Anglican Orders (p. 384), the opening sentence should read: 'In the rite of ... any sacrament we rightly distinguish between the ceremonial part and the essential part, which *is* (not *are*) usually called the matter and form.' Since matter and form constitute the essential part, the mistranslation introduces a doctrinal inaccuracy. It is not considerate of the reader to charge Leo's doctrine on the intention required of the minister with implicit Donatism (p.

385, n. 5), when the text given (from Denzinger) omits the pertinent passage on intention. St. Thomas, who is cited, clearly requires a 'right intention' which excludes perversity *respectu ipsius sacramenti* and adds: *Et talis perversitas tollit veritatem sacramenti, praecipue quando suam intentionem exterius manifestat*. Mock administration is introduced as an example (by *puta*), and not as the one case in which the principle applies. (*Sum Theol.* III, Q. 64, a 10, *Resp.*) The general reader will find an adequate corrective in the *Catholic Encyclopedia* article on Anglican Orders, especially I, 496 ff., where *Apostolical curae* is treated.

In Cosin's quotation from Maldonatus, the efficacy of the Sacrament of Penance is the point at issue and not the necessary matter of confession. The clear meaning of the text, that the remission of sins is not required 'every time the sacrament is administered' (*semper*), is obscured in translation (p. 425, n. 8).

In setting up the new edition, reference data were shifted to follow the texts. But in some cases the change was missed, in others the elements are split or misplaced, e.g., pp. 45, 46, 48, 74, 109, 156. In references to original texts, one or more editions are sometimes cited, but elsewhere none. The singular reference on page 223 should read, Anselm, *Epist.* III, 41. PL 159, 75. Removal of such minor inconsistencies, as well as the following slips (many of them survivals from the earlier edition), would improve a fourth printing. *Errata* in proper names and Latin words: for *Pelegii*, *Pelagii* (p. 76); for *Anagnani*, *Anagni* (p. 161); for *Sum. Theologia*, *Theologica* (p. 209); for *Cajaten*, *Cajetan* (p. 271); for *Eucahrist*, *Eucharist* (p. 370); for *Provincial Letters*, *Provincial* (p. 378); for *Angelicana*, *Anglicana* (p. 421); for *Nations*, *Notions* (p. 429); for *Psuedo-Popes*, *Pseudo* (p. 447); Index—for *Caesara*, *Caesarea*; for *Canon, Muratonian*, *Muratorian*; *Decretals*, *Psuedo-Isidonian*, *Pseudo-Isidorian*; for *De haeratico*, *haeretico*. *Corrigenda* (from a partial check): for *De Civ. Dei X 30* (p. 81), read XXII, 30; for *Denz.*, 3004 sqq. (p. 112), read 57b—at least since the 20th ed. (1932); for *Conc. Trid. v 996* (p. 370), read Mansi XXXIII, 80 (as in *Denz.*); for *C. Tr. viii, 699 sq.* (p. 372), read 959; for *Trent (Session VII, Canon II)* (p. 385, n. 5), read (Sess. VII, Canon, de sacramentis in genere, c. XI).

Of its very nature, a book of this kind has nothing ephemeral about it and will be widely read and referred to for a long time to come. Criticism is made with this fact, as well as the difficult circumstances of its first appearance clearly in mind. Its effect then, on the Christian faith and fortitude of a sorely tried people, I can only imagine. But to read it in a different setting, in 1948, is a forceful reminder of what is the true soul of our society; of the preponderance of the common things, which should unite, over the differences which tragically divide, those upon

whom, under God rest the fate of our common inheritance. On this tercentenary of the Peace of Westphalia, which "marks the end of Medieval Europe" (p. 306), as we become tardily aware of the menace to "Europe" *tout court*, no Christian is exempt from facing, with charity, humility, and prayer, the solution of problems which have never ceased to be at the very heart of the matter.

J. JOSEPH RYAN

*St. John's Seminary*  
Brighton

*Art in the Early Church.* By WALTER LOWRIE. (New York: Pantheon Books, Inc. 1947. Pp. xviii, 268. 153 plates. \$6.50.)

In a handsomely printed and copiously illustrated volume dedicated to Monsignor Joseph Wilpert, Walter Lowrie has given us a delightfully readable introduction to early Christian art. The production of an entirely rewritten, expanded, and rearranged version of his *Monuments of the Early Church*, published some forty-seven years ago, is an eloquent testimonial to Dr. Lowrie's diligence in approaching his subject in the light of the enormous advances made in the whole field of Christian art and archaeology during the last half-century. Writing primarily for beginners, the author emphasizes that he is not a professor but a clergyman, and that his interest in early Christian art is not that of the antiquarian or scientist, but rather the deep personal interest of the Christian as such. He treats the study of Christian art as a " 'sacred study,' like the study of the Bible," (p. 4) and insists "we must get rid of the notion that the study of early Christian art is a department of archaeology" (p. 19).

The author, with Wilpert, deplores the tendency of modern scholars to treat the productions of early Christian art without sympathy and without *pietas*, pointing out that one who would understand this art must recognize it as the expression of a new *Weltanschauung*, productive of a new *Kunstwollen* which could not fail to modify profoundly the traditions of pagan Roman and Hellenistic art, with which it is sometimes unfavorably compared. Preoccupied with the possibility of widely divergent interpretations in the field of Christian art and archaeology, Dr. Lowrie does not profess to have unshakeable convictions on many moot questions, but in the main he follows Wilpert as the most reliable guide he knows. An example of the latter is his espousal of the priority and predominance of Rome in the field of early Christian art, in contradistinction to the thought of Strzygowski and his followers, who seek in the East the cradle of Christian art.

The chapter on the catacombs of Rome is largely archaeological in

approach and does not pertain strictly to the main theme of the book, although the author rightly justifies its inclusion on the principle that the reader should have some background of familiarity with these nurseries of Christian art. With his treatment of frescoes and sarcophagi in the chapter entitled "Sepulchral Art" Dr. Lowrie enters upon the main body of his work. After a few general considerations under each of these headings the author proceeds to deal in greater detail with subjects which enjoyed particularly wide popularity, such as the orant, the Good Shepherd, and the fish among the frescoes, and scenes from the life of Christ on the sarcophagi. Throughout the author supplements his own descriptions with helpful references to the pertinent illustrations, which are grouped together at the rear of the book. Although on the whole Dr. Lowrie's informal, almost conversational, style makes for interesting reading, it tends at times to lead to personal asides which add nothing to his work and certainly will not be acceptable to his Roman Catholic readers. Such, for example, are his remarks about the secret parts of the Mass (p. 121) and the blessing of holy water (p. 122). Regrettable, too, is the author's gratuitous assumption that by instituting the feast of Christ the King Pope Pius XI "meant to substantiate the claim of the Roman Pontiff as the Vicar of Christ to universal jurisdiction of a political sort" (p. xvii). Dr. Lowrie will do well to reread the encyclical *Quas Primas* of December 11, 1925.

The 500 illustrations are arranged to correspond roughly with the chapter headings and provide a most satisfactory accompaniment to the text. Their quality of reproduction on the whole is good. An excellent select bibliography, a chronological table, a comprehensive index of the text, and many items in the illustrations go far toward making this volume a worthwhile possession for the student of early Christian art, as well as enlightening reading for the dilettante.

EDWARD J. DUNCAN

Newman Foundation  
University of Illinois

*Humanist as Hero: The Life of Sir Thomas More.* By THEODORE MAYNARD (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. viii, 261. \$3.00.)

This biography of More is based on primary sources, all of which, in printed form, are now available in this country. There is also due appreciation of modern biographies. A biographer of More cannot find new sources, but he can give us new interpretations of the man, and this Mr. Maynard often does. One feels he has studied and read More for a long time. He seems to correct and supplement earlier writing. The honesty and frankness with which he writes of More strengthen our appreciation of the latter's



saintliness and courage and show us by what self-discipline his strength of character was achieved. He comments truly that "there probably never was a man of more settled and orderly habits or one whose character changed less" (p. 54).

Mr. Maynard has not made adequate use of More's letters, many of which were easily available. A calendar of them, with dates and sources, appeared in the *English Historical Review* in 1922. One letter corroborates Erasmus' statement that More in his youth wrote comedies, which Maynard finds difficult to accept. More's first extant letter, written in 1501 to John Holt, schoolmaster in Chichester, begins "I have sent you what you wished, everything except the sections which I have added to the comedy on Solomon; those I could not send just now, since they are not with me." A letter to Wolsey supports Maynard's sentence, "Yet there may have been a hope in More's heart that Henry would apply to himself the satire shot at the King of France, and perhaps desist from the course upon which he had already begun" (p. 86). More reported to Wolsey, on September 21, 1522, that Henry hoped to be "governor" of the French after the campaign and he added "I pray God if it be good for his Grace and for this realme that then it may prove so, and ellis in the stede therof I pray God send his Grace one honorable and profitable peace."

One characteristic of the book is its appreciation of fine traits in those sharply criticized by other writers. Maynard judges Dame Alice More kindly, basing it on the good nature apparent in the sketch of her by Holbein in the "Basle drawing" of the family. More's letter to her after the burning of their barns, Maynard says, was "sure of her kindness of heart." He notes, too, as proof of her care of her step-children, "that none of them died—something very rare in that age of high mortality among the young."

There are good phrases used in description, which one remembers, as Dame Alice's "unimaginative common sense" and again, the "smiling piety" of More's *Dialogue of Comfort*.

Proof-reading missed several slips which cause misunderstanding. On page 145, the Bishop of London bought copies of the translation of the New Testament, "keeping Tyndale (not Tunstall) in funds." And on page 170 the sentence should read "now that Tunstall had been translated to Durham" (omitting *not*). Cranmer's doctrinal position probably changed some years later than the controversy stirred by John Frith (p. 184). But for the most part, the reader approves Maynard's interpretation, and particularly values the clear explanation of More's defence of papal supremacy. For its balance and imaginative common sense, the book should have generous appreciation.



*The Progress of the Jesuits, 1556-1579.* By JAMES BRODRICK, S. J. (New York: Longmans, Green and Co. 1947. Pp. viii, 337. \$3.50.)

This book, for which we have been waiting impatiently since the author's *Origin of the Jesuits* appeared in 1940, covers the crucial and formative years of the order under the generalship of Diego Laynez, Francis Borgia, and Everard Mercurian. Gratifying, indeed, is it to study an account like this, based chiefly upon the copious sources published since 1894 in the *Monumenta Historica Societatis Jesu*. Some writers, failing to study these sources, have fired away at the Jesuits, apparently thinking it open season with no rules applying. Few readers will find fault with the author's presentation of details or his general point of view. The captious critic might mention the slips of the pen on page 34, where *sited* apparently should be *suited* or *situated*, and on page 35 where *it* seems to lack clear reference. The reviewer, however, stresses these few slips to show the author's painstaking labor to eliminate the kind of mistakes that arise during the process of printing.

Like *The Origin of the Jesuits*, the style of this book is sententious, loaded with information presented with commendable ripeness of judgment, sympathetic understanding, and trenchant phrase. We note many brief to the point characterizations of complicated situations. Especially instructive is the portrayal of Paul IV, "a genuinely tragic figure, a Lear among the Popes" ruined by the defects of his own very great qualities, his unbounded courage, his boyish optimism, his high personal integrity and austerity." He could not forget incidents in which he had failed to carry his point. "He might bury the hatchet for a time, but he gave the impression of always carefully marking the spot." He failed to grasp the nature and ramifications of the political antagonisms of the day; their inconsistencies involved him in difficulties with Spain—in an attack by the Duke of Alba on the Papal States. "Tivoli and Ostia had both fallen by 19 November [1556], cutting off Rome to the east and west, leaving the Pope dependent for his safety on a band of Lutheran mercenaries hired by Carlo Carafa to defend the Holy See against the only genuinely Catholic monarch remaining in the world."

Many a curious matter receives illuminating comment at the author's hand. Most interesting, perhaps, is what we read of the effects of the enervating influence of the royal power on the action of the Church. In France many of the concordatary clergy entertained a view of their positions which was as much political as religious. Eustache du Bellay, Bishop of Paris, for example, was a thorn to the Jesuits while they were striving to establish themselves in France in spite of the opposition of the Collège de France and the Parlement of Paris. In Spain the Jesuits had to contend with the royal desire to control the new order. They successfully resisted the imposition of the *limpieza de sangre* whereby any person of

Jewish blood would be barred from membership. Admitting such people to their ranks was a Jesuit custom. They consistently refused to make their order a Spanish order. This point illuminatingly discussed by the author deserves to be noted, for one writer recently has endeavored to attach the stigma of anti-Semitism to the order during its formative days.

Father Brodrick has abundantly succeeded in his great task. We shall await with anticipation the next volume he has promised which should cover the trials and triumphs of the order during the generation after 1579.

HENRY S. LUCAS

*University of Washington*

*Jean Duvergier de Hauranne, Abbé de Saint-Cyran, et son temps (1581-1638).* By JEAN ORCIBAL. (Louvain: Bureau de la Revue, Bibliothèque de l'Université; Paris; Librairie Philosophique J. Vrin. 1947. Pp. xv, 685.)

M. Orcibal has undertaken to describe in five volumes the origins of Jansenism. The first volume contained the complete text of the extant letters of Jansenius, principally to Saint-Cyran, and was important because "en ce qui concerne directement la doctrine de Jansénius et sa genèse, la correspondance éditée n'apporte pas beaucoup de neuf; sous ce rapport la *Naissance* de Pinthereau n'a rien omis d'essentiel." (*Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, XLII (1947), 490.) Many had opined that the complete text of the letters would modify considerably Père Pinthereau's picture. Such fears are now dispelled. The present volume, the second in the series, studies Saint-Cyran and his times up to 1638, the year of the death of Jansenius and of the imprisonment of Saint-Cyran by Richelieu. Volume III will appear shortly with appendices, bibliography, and indices for the matter contained in the present volume. Volume IV will be devoted to the life of Jansenius and Volume V will be entitled: *La Naissance du Jansénisme: Saint-Cyran et Antoine Arnauld (1638-1644)*. All students of the period will recognise the great importance of this enterprise. It is, accordingly, a pleasure to report that the author shows a truly remarkable grasp of the details of the thorny problems involved. His *Origines du Jansénisme* should mark an epoch in the investigation of this vast movement.

Saint-Cyran is one of the enigmas in the history of the Church. Fast friend of saints, he was decried by the early opponents of Jansenism as an arch-conspirator and the principal author of the sect. On the other hand, the early Jansenists extolled him so fervently that many of his former friends, e. g., St. Vincent de Paul, were led to denounce him after his death as an ecclesiastical revolutionary. About a century ago, the distinguished critic Sainte-Beuve resurrected Saint-Cyran and painted him

in glowing pages as an incomparably great character, a sovereign genius, a sublime reformer, the rival of Richelieu, and above all as a master of the spiritual life and the prince of spiritual directors. The fact that Sainte-Beuve was not a good Catholic did not prevent his opinion from obtaining wide vogue.

Twenty years ago another writer of genius, Henri Bremond, reviewed the case of Saint-Cyran in the fourth volume of his celebrated history of modern French spirituality. Bremond will concede only one power to Saint-Cyran, that of fascinating and dominating women and men, and only one virtue, prayerfulness. Apart from this, Bremond considers Saint-Cyran worthy neither of the admiration of his friends nor of the censures of his foes. If he had genius, it was doomed to sterility because of his lack of mental balance; if he had virtue, it could never bear fruit because he lacked perseverance in good. Saint-Cyran's doctrine, which in Bremond's judgment was not Jansenism but something far more sinister, died with him because his sensitiveness and self-hypnotisation prevented him from developing into a leader. In short the Saint-Cyran of Bremond is a dreamy failure.

M. Orcibal eschews intuition and bases his picture of Saint-Cyran on the facts and the documents; he never forgets, however, the theories of Sainte-Beuve and Bremond. With the latter he distinguishes two Saint-Cyrans: 1) the man of fire, harder on others than on himself, grossly impolite even to exalted personages, demanding blind obedience from the élite he condescended to direct, lost in admiration for the first centuries of the Church and criticising everything and everybody connected with the Church of his day, claiming direct inspiration from on high, and proclaiming, *sub secreto* of course, but to a considerable number of people that the true Church had disappeared 600 years before; 2) the simple priest, the friend of little children, who forbade his disciples to practice excessive mortification, who fasted so much before he was forty that he had to eat many times a day thereafter, living comfortably as a commendatory abbot, an expert in friendship before Schleiermacher, generous to an extreme, directing souls according to the principles of St. Francis de Sales, sincerely submissive to the Church, devoted to the saints and to the Blessed Virgin, more interested in mysticism than in dogmatic theology and claiming to contemplate the mysteries of the next life as clearly as others did the events of this.

In his endeavor to find some unity beneath these contradictory appearances, M. Orcibal demolishes with Bremond the theory of Saint-Cyran as a heresiarch and conspirator. If he was a heresiarch, he was one who contradicted himself at every step and on the essentials of his system. As a conspirator he was decidedly weak because he entrusted some of his most revolutionary ideas to people he scarcely knew. Bremond explains the

contradictions of Saint-Cyran by his lack of balance. There was insanity in the family and the abbé was at times not completely master of himself. M. Orcibal admits that Saint-Cyran was prematurely old, afflicted in body and mind, and morbidly sensitive. But he rightly rejects insanity as the explanation of the enigma. His reasons for refusing to accept this tacit surmise of Bremond are more convincing than those which he alleges for denying another conclusion of that author, viz., that Saint-Cyran was incapable of persevering effort and that his life was spent in inefficacious velleities.

M. Orcibal finds the reason for Saint-Cyran's contradictions "dans l'essence même du cristianisme dont les mystères et les vérités prennent successivement deux aspects contraires." Saint-Cyran, like the wise and unwise St. Paul, chose his contradictory expressions deliberately. Instead of going to one extreme or the other as the Calvinists and Molinists, he went to both extremes successively. As developed by M. Orcibal this theory has much to recommend it although, of course, Saint-Cyran divagated on more than mysteries. Its weak point lies in the lack of any convincing proof that Saint-Cyran's vacillation between extremes was deliberate and not a result of his morbid sensitivity. But even if we hold that it was indeliberate, Orcibal offers the best explanation of the enigma of Saint-Cyran yet proposed.

M. Orcibal does not present his work as definitive even for the period of Saint-Cyran's life prior to 1638. He has loaded the book with references of all kinds "pour faciliter les recherches ultérieures dans un domaine presqu' inexploré et qui présenera, longtemps encore, des parties mystérieuses." There can be no doubt, however, but that he presents a picture of Saint-Cyran which will influence all future studies not only because of the erudition displayed but also by its penetration. Not all the problems have been faced; Bremond's charge, for example, that Saint-Cyran was a note-taker rather than a writer and that his works were composed in part by others is not examined. Despite this and other lacunae this life of Saint-Cyran up to 1638 is, perhaps, the most serious study which has appeared since *Port-Royal*. For the most part M. Orcibal's conclusions were foreshadowed in Bremond's facile chapters on the subject—another tribute to the acumen of that penetrating stylist. Perhaps Orcibal would have done better work if he had endeavored to be more impartial. His admiration for his hero is only another proof, however, of the fascination which Saint-Cyran exercised in life and after death. All who read these pages will join in the hope that the author will soon give the world his study of Jansenius and also that of the birth of Jansenism.

EDWARD A. RYAN

*Woodstock College*

*Pontificia Nipponica: Le relazioni tra la Santa Sede e il Giappone attraverso i documenti pontifici.* By LEO MAGNINO. (Romae: Officium Libri Catholici. 1947. Pp. xxiv, 188.)

The present opportunity for the spread of Christianity in Japan recalls the marvelous era when Christianity flourished in that country. The era began when Xavier landed in Kagoshima in 1549 six years after the discovery of the country by the Portuguese. During the next sixty-five years the Church made such rapid progress that there were high hopes the nation would become Catholic. However, with the promulgation of the definitive decree of persecution in 1614 dark days began for the Church, and by the middle of the seventeenth century Christianity had been dealt a fatal blow. This stirring history has been written more than once, but now for the first time we see it from the viewpoint of the official documents containing the relations of the Holy See with Japan. The volume here under consideration, the work of Professor Leo Magnino of the University of Rome, contains documents covering the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries. This last century is represented by only one document; thirty-nine cover the sixteenth century, fifty-six the seventeenth. While many of these documents have been published previously, they were sometimes difficult of access. Others existed only in manuscript and now are printed for the first time.

Through these documents, which begin with the brief to Francis Xavier for his missionary journey to the Indies, we see re-enacted the dramatic history of the evangelisation of Japan: the work of the religious orders, the serious disagreements among them, and the measures taken by the Holy See to secure harmony. We see the two Japanese embassies to the Holy See in 1585 and 1615, the efforts of the Holy See to create bishops and to establish a seminary to train natives for the priesthood, the decisions of Propaganda concerning marriage cases, deliberations and resolutions of the Holy Office, and the letters of the Sovereign Pontiffs to different princes. Last but not least we have a letter from Paul V in 1619 and five letters from Urban VIII in 1626 to the Christians in the darkest days of the persecution, in which the fatherly hearts of the Popes overflow with expressions of sympathy, admiration, and encouragement. Each document is preceded by an explanation and commentary and at times by a narration of the historical facts that occasioned its promulgation.

We must note here that this work is not merely of religious interest and importance. It is a contribution to the history of Japan in its contacts with western culture, for it was largely through Christianity that Japan was introduced to western civilisation and kept in close touch with it. In his introduction to the work Professor Magnino gives a brief history of the Church in Japan up to 1942. A short but helpful bibliography is

appended containing the principal works on the subject. It is regrettable that there is no index of the matter contained in the documents. Such an index would have made this valuable work far more practical and usable. At the bottom of page 88 "Cerqueira" is mistakenly put for "Diego Valente."

EDWARD HAGEMANN

*Alma College*

*Windows Westward. Rome, Russia, Reunion.* By STEPHEN C. GULOVICH.  
(New York: Declan X. McMullen Co. 1947. Pp. viii, 208. \$2.50.)

The author of this book wishes to offer "a brief and helpful guidebook" to the most important phases of the Byzantine-Slavonic Rite—"to those facts and events in the long history of the rites which are of special significance and can serve as a focal point for further study." Explicitly disclaiming exhaustiveness and making no pretensions to original research, Dr. Gulovich hopes by a dispassionate, factual presentation of the evolution of the Byzantine-Slavonic Rite and its relations with the Holy See to "arouse in my readers a desire to seek the sources and ascertain the truth." To this end, he supplies the reader with a valuable twenty-nine page bibliography of Catholic and non-Catholic references in the English language.

Whether the volume will achieve the author's "main purpose" of stimulating the reader to further study is a matter of conjecture, the consummation of which, in any event, is earnestly to be hoped for. But there can be no guesswork about the author's realization of his desire to present an introductory survey of the religious life of our brethren of the Byzantine-Slavonic Rite, Catholic and Dissident, both in Europe and in America. In this regard, although he adds little to the information supplied by Duchesne, Fortescue, and Attwater, Dr. Gulovich succeeds admirably in popularizing his weightier predecessors and in drawing a sympathetic sketch of his co-ritualists. His account of Byzantine-Slavonic Catholics in the United States will prove of special interest to all students of American church history. In brief, the author has produced a *travail de vulgarisation* in the best sense of the phrase.

But Dr. Gulovich has also done something more. He has called the attention of his American Catholic readers to what is, perhaps, the most promising solution of the problem of Russia's conversion. As the sub-title of the book suggests, a good portion of the 150 odd pages of the text is devoted to the discussion of Russia's reunion with Rome. In recounting Russia's religious development from the origins of Christianity through the schism to the present state of things, the author contributes nothing new to the tragic history of a tragic disunity. But he does place in bold



relief the role played by Constantinople in the defection of Byzantine-Slavonic Russia and its continued secession from the original faith of its fathers. He likewise stresses the work of Russia's great nineteenth-century convert and advocate of reunion, Vladimir Soloviev, from whose famous "Memorandum" to Pope Leo XIII on the identity of Catholic and Russian Dissident doctrines and on the essential basis of reunion he quotes at length.

The solution proposed by Dr. Gulovich for the healing of the schism between Rome and Russia is briefly this: aside from divine intervention, only Catholics of the Byzantine-Slavonic Rite—and particularly those in the United States who live far from the political intrigues of the old world—can bring back to the Church the separated brethren of Russia, because similarities of ritual, language, and historical tradition supply Uniate Catholics with the indispensably "eastern" key to the Russian religious mind and simultaneously provide suspicious and fearful Dissidents with "a living proof that they are able to be Catholics and at the same time retain their rites and customs." In this connection, the author remarks pointedly: "The more the Catholic Church of the Byzantine Rite will flourish, the sooner will the reunion of these separated peoples be effected. Conversely, any injury inflicted on that Church will indefinitely postpone reunion."

It is almost unavoidable that in a work often dealing with controversial matters and treading on delicate ground, the author should have his preferences on certain moot issues—e.g., details of liturgical genealogy and the Cyrillo-Methodian mission. But it is regrettable that several chronological and numerical lapses have escaped his attention to mar the book's claim to full trustworthiness. It is also a pity that in one or two instances the author sins by omission—notably, in his discussion of the Union of Brest-Litovsk which brought the Catholic Church of the Byzantine-Slavonic Rite into existence. Some small acknowledgement of the Polish contribution to this important achievement seems quite in order and is conspicuous by its absence.

JOSEPH V. SWASTEK

*SS.Cyril and Methodius Seminary*

*De Dageraad van de Emancipatie der Katholieken de Nederlandsche Katholieken en de Staatskundige Verwickelingen uit heb laatste Kwart van de achttiende Eeuw.* By MARINUS JOSEPHUS MARIA VAN DER HEIDEN (Nijmegen: Drukkery W. Vosselmans, Zundert. 1947. Pp. xxxi, 370.)

The author of this volume presumes in the reader a knowledge of the political and religious events in western Europe during the second half

of the eighteenth century as well as a thorough knowledge of the political and religious situation in the Netherlands during that same period. If a reader does not bring that knowledge to the book this highly documented history of the quarrels between the nuncio, archpriests, and lower clergy, as well as the rivalries between the Democratic Patriotic Party and the Orange Party in that era of confusion in the Netherlands, will leave him quite confused.

The idea of religious toleration based upon natural law, as advanced by Grotius, Locke, Pufendorff, and Bayle exercised its influence upon a number of the intelligentsia in the Netherlands in the last quarter of the eighteenth century. They formed the Democratic Patriotic Party. Their writings and activities drew violent replies from the Orange Party, the champions of the so-called predominant church (Calvinist) which was still the state religion. Quite naturally the Catholics lined up with the advocates of religious toleration and the social equality of man. Many of the better educated Catholics, and among them a number of priests, took active part in the politics of the Patriotic Party, for which the Catholics paid dearly after the Orange reaction of September, 1787. The Orange triumph caused most of the leading figures of the opposing party to take refuge in Belgium and France. Here they continued their activities and at the same time were indoctrinated with the ideas of the French Revolution. The dangers for the Church and religion contained in the new French ideology could have hardly escaped notice by the Netherland Catholics. However, it is a certainty that a great number of them were moved more by the advantages the new French doctrine offered to their cause than by the dangers connected with it. In the meantime the approaching French armies frightened the ruling Orange Party. In an effort to regain the loyalty of the Catholics they began to make concessions. The higher ecclesiastical authorities seeing the good dispositions of the government and realizing the dangers from the French promptly condemned the new ideas. However, their views and especially those of Brancadoro, the nuncio, were not always well received, especially by the lower clergy. A good number of Catholics hailed the invading French armies, and immediately benefited from the invasion. The Catholics now enjoyed political equality and social discrimination was abolished. Efforts were made to restore the ecclesiastical hierarchy, and seminaries for the education of future priests were erected. At the same time the government declared the separation of Church and State.

The last chapter of this work is entirely devoted to the squabbles between government and priests, and especially among the clerics themselves concerning the oath required by the government on the rights of man and citizen, which later was changed into a declaration of aversion for the stadholdership, aristocracy, federalism, and anarchy. The endless

disputations were concerned rather with theological accuracy and even theological scrupulosity than religious orthodoxy. When, after a few years, the Catholics lost all the gains they had made, the reason was found in the lack of a central ecclesiastical authority. After the daybreak of emancipation, it still took a long time for the sun to appear. The work of Van der Heiden is a remarkably accurate story of an almost hopelessly ensnarled period in the history of the Netherlands.

EDWARD P. CALLENS

*Sacred Hearts Seminary*  
Washington, D. C.

#### GENERAL HISTORY

*The Story of the Ukraine.* By CLARENCE A. MANNING. (New York: Philosophical Library. 1947. Pp. 326. \$3.75.)

The title, the eleven-item English bibliography (placed after the index at the end of the volume), and the absence of scholarly apparatus indicate the essentially popular character of this book—popular, however, in the best sense of the term. The work of a Columbia Slavist who has published translations from and studies on Ukrainian literature, it is based largely on Hrushevsky and Doroshenko, and is a frankly sympathetic presentation of the Ukrainian nationalist cause.

Accepting the thesis of the historical continuity of Ukrainian national consciousness, Professor Manning constructs his story upon the theme that Ukraine is "a nation with its own geographical area, its own population, and its own history" (p. 9). In a broad historical panorama stretching over 1000 years, he describes Ukraine's emergence in ninth-century Kievan Rus', its gradual decline and political submersion by the end of the fourteenth century, its subsequent unsuccessful struggles for freedom under Kozak hetmans Khmelnitsky and Mazepa, its nineteenth-century cultural efforts fostered by Shevchenko and the Society of SS. Cyril and Methodius to maintain its national identity, its short-lived independence at the end of World War I, and its present unification under the Ukrainian Soviet Republic of the U.S.S.R.

Modern Ukraine with its some 200,000 square miles between the Carpathians and the Don, according to Professor Manning, "exists today on the territory of ancient Rus'" (p. 30). Stripped of its rightful original name by Moscow-Russia, which has appropriated the title just as it has annexed Ru Rus' territory and Rus' history of pre-Tatar times, the country has managed to survive in the hearts of its some 40,000,000 people under another local name, Ukraine, which it presently employs.

By his emphasis on the historical, linguistic, cultural, and geographic differences between Rus'-Ukraine and Moscow-Russia and by his stress on

the continuity of Ukrainian history, Professor Manning contributes to a better understanding of the Ukrainian problem and justifies the Ukrainian claim to full independence. Equally enlightening are his pages which describe the cultural revival of Ruś-Ukraine and its influence upon Moscow-Russia in modern times. His treatment of Ukrainian struggles with neighboring powers, set against the background of eastern European development, is also illuminating.

The discussion of Polish-Ukrainian as well as Russo-Ukrainian relations, which (particularly in the Polish instance) became extremely complicated by political, social, cultural, and religious factors through the centuries, is dispassionate and calm. The author speaks of the Polonization and Russification of the Ukrainian nobility, of frequent friction among the three Slavic groups, and the disadvantageous position occupied by Ukrainians in the contest, pointing out at the same time that Ukrainians have generally fared better under Polish than under Muscovite or Soviet rule.

Yet in spite of the book's many fine qualities, this reviewer feels obliged to make certain reservations. Perhaps the most important of these touches Professor Manning's one-sided treatment of the Uniat movement in Poland and his narrow interpretation of it as a political weapon devised by Poles to weaken Ukrainian Orthodox solidarity. Next, his glorification of Kozakdom, its democracy, its religious zeal, and its relation to the Ukrainian population at large, seems more than a little overdrawn as does also his evaluation of Khmelnytsky as the purposeful "architect of Ukrainian conscious independence" (p. 104) and "the real founder of the Ukrainian national movement" (p. 85). And finally, a fuller treatment of Polish-Ukrainian co-operation, instanced by such incidents as the Union of Hadiach in 1658 or the Polish recognition (the first officially granted by any government) of the independent Ukrainian National Republic in 1920, is desirable in a volume which discusses at length difficulties that have embroiled both nations.

JOSEPH V. SWASTEK

*SS. Cyril and Methodius Seminary*

*Colony to Nation. A History of Canada.* By A. R. M. LOWER. (New York and Toronto: Longmans, Green and Co. 1947. Pp. xiii, 600. \$5.50.)

This is one of the most widely publicized, and probably most widely read of a number of short histories of Canada that have appeared in recent years. Its popularity, attested by much newspaper comment in the past few months, is not difficult to understand. It is obviously based on wide learning, and it is written in a manner that is certain to attract notice. Mr. Lower is a man of decided, if not always of very clear opinions on a great variety of subjects; and he evidently does not sub-

scribe to the convention which requires the historian to interpret his records as objectively as possible and to refrain from pressing his own opinions, or it may be, his own prejudices upon his readers. In the course of his survey of Canadian history he has found abundant material upon which to express his opinions; and these are set down with a warmth of feeling, and occasionally with a pungent wit, that will probably appeal to a wide public.

The specialist is unlikely to find in the book much with which he is not familiar. On a number of important issues the interpretation is striking and provocative; and many well-known themes are here presented in a new, and frequently in an illuminating form. There are occasional references which reveal the author's use of an extensive monograph literature that has become available in the past thirty or forty years; but the book is not likely to be regarded as a work of profound or original scholarship. It is rather the familiar material of Canadian history presented from a new, and often from a highly personal point of view. It has the appearance of a textbook, organized on the orthodox chronological pattern. But in many sections narrative is subordinated to commentary; and this commentary, often diffuse and occasionally a little banal, is shot through with the author's personal predilections. This will not be to the taste of all his readers; but Mr. Lower's method at least imparts to his work a stimulating quality that has too often been lacking in earlier histories of Canada.

As the title indicates, the central theme is the growth of Canadian nationality; and on that subject Mr. Lower has something to say which both racial groups in the Dominion would do well to ponder. Institutional development is given less space than in many earlier books. The Quebec Act and the Constitutional Act of 1791 are not so much explained as employed for the purpose of focusing the author's criticism of British imperialism. The struggle for responsible government receives fuller and more objective treatment. That is, perhaps, the most satisfactory section of the book; and very few writers have succeeded in presenting so clear and interesting an analysis of the complex situation in the Canadas and in Great Britain at the period of the rebellions and the Durham Mission. Mr. Lower pays the customary tribute to the great report. He describes it, indeed, as "the best and most readable book" ever written on the Canadas of that period. But he recognizes what many others have failed to recognize, that its only constructive proposal, the plan of establishing a responsible executive in the colony, came not from Lord Durham or any of his associates, but from the Upper Canadian reformer, Robert Baldwin.

Less careful consideration is given to the movement for confederation and to the Act of 1867. So much has been written on the development of national status, especially since the beginning of the present century, that



there will be little criticism of Mr. Lower's rather brief summary of the question. But here, as elsewhere throughout the book, his over-developed suspicion of British imperialists, and of the large and indefinite class of persons whom he stigmatizes as colonial-minded Tories, is a little too evident.

Mr. Lower is primarily interested in the growth of a Canadian people, in the development among them of a sense of national unity, and in the obstacles, partly physical, partly psychological, which have retarded that unity and created the tension and discord that have been all too evident in Canadian life. The central problem, as he describes it, is "the vast conflict of philosophies" which resulted from the British conquest of a French community and the consequent mingling of the two races. He has some severe strictures on the commercial imperialism of the eighteenth century, and on the cult of "acquisition as an object in itself," which too often provided the English business man with the only philosophy which he knew; but his analysis of the rival social philosophies of the French Catholic and then English Protestant groups is, on the whole, fair and illuminating. Not many historians have written of the outlook of the French-Canadians on the morrow of the conquest with greater sympathy and understanding.

In the chapters dealing with more recent history Mr. Lower's personal opinions are too obtrusive. Rumor and conjecture are sometimes employed almost as substitutes for authenticated evidence. His speculations on the influence of Canadian textile manufacturers during the Ottawa Conference in 1932 may have some substance in fact; but without the clearest documentary evidence to support his statements, the historian is not entitled to pronounce such dogmatic judgments as are here set down. Even more striking is his account of Canada's government during the recent war, an account which will, perhaps, surprise a good many Canadian citizens who lived through that conflict.

Responsibility for what is described as a "complete plunge into the police state of the European type" is attributed to the present Prime Minister. "He found Canada a free country," says Mr. Lower; "his administration went far towards destroying the basis of that freedom." Yet a few pages further on an entirely different view appears; and Mr. Lower concludes with the statement that, despite some stringent measures of regimentation and some arbitrariness on the part of individual ministers, "Canada remained a free country; her press remained free; her citizens substantially retained their freedom of speech and their representative institutions." This same confusion appears in his handling of other topics. His preferred solution for present difficulties would seem to be some form of planned economy similar to that advocated by the Cooperative Commonwealth Federation. How such a plan is to be made acceptable



to the people of Quebec, how the constitutional difficulties are to be overcome, or how it is to be put into effect without something like the war-time restrictions which the author so strongly condemns, are questions to which no answer is attempted.

This book will no doubt stimulate interest in Canadian history, but it will not supersede earlier works on the subject. It contains some excellent character sketches, and some passages of vivid narrative. But there are too many passages in which the author has allowed himself to slip into careless forms of colloquialism, and there is too often a tendency to discourse at large on points which attract his special interest. If the book is to take the place which the publishers claim for it, the numerous misprints, grammatical errors, and vagaries of spelling which at present mar its pages will need to be eliminated.

DONALD J. McDOUGALL

*University of Toronto*

#### MEDIEVAL HISTORY

*"The Illiterate Anglo-Saxon" and other Essays on Education, Medieval and Modern.* By JOHN WILLIAM ADAMSON. (Cambridge: At the University Press; New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. 167. \$2.75.)

This thin volume consists of ten essays by one of the foremost authorities on the history of education in England. The greater part of the book deals with mediaeval education, but two chapters are concerned with modern topics and the last paper is a plea for the historical study of English education. Six of the essays appear here for the first time, but three others are reprinted from earlier publications, and one was originally given as a lecture in 1936.

The chapters vary considerably in their nature and purpose. One gives a general survey of mediaeval education; one is concerned with the extent of literacy in England in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries; another is a commentary on the *De recuperatione terre sancte* of Pierre Dubois, written early in the fourteenth century, while the sixth chapter is a commentary on a mediaeval student's handbook (the *De disciplina scholarium* once attributed to Boethius), and the *Didascalicon de studio legendi* of Hugh of St. Victor is the subject of the seventh chapter. It is pleasant to record that the edition of Hugh's work that is here used is a volume published by the Catholic University of America in 1939.

Although the careful scholarship of the author is everywhere evident in these essays, his skill in historical analysis and criticism is, perhaps, best evidenced in the first two chapters, one entitled "The Illiterate Anglo-Saxon," and the second, "Who Was Asser?" In the first of these there is a careful consideration of the preface written by King Alfred to Pope

Gregory's *Liber regulae pastoralis*. The internal evidence of this document is used by Adamson as it throws light on the question of the educational level in England at the time. He also gives a modern English version of Alfred's preface. The much-debated question of the authorship of *Asser's Life of King Alfred* is given the attention that it deserves. The general interpretation of the mediaeval period in our educational history is that this was not nearly so unprogressive a time as the common opinion would have it. Although Adamson is well aware of the weaknesses in mediaeval education, his researches tend to the same conclusion as that reached by most other modern scholars who have revised the earlier judgment of this as a sterile and ignorant period.

If only there were more students, not only in England but also in the United States, who would follow Adamson's lead in the historical study of educational problems we should be saved, on the one hand, from educationists who have no moorings because of their ignorance of our educational development, and, on the other hand, from historians who fail to see the interrelationships of our cultural growth and the work of the schools.

BERNARD J. KOHLBRENNER

*University of Notre Dame*

*Anglo-Saxon Saints and Scholars*. By ELEANOR SHIPLEY DUCKETT. (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. x, 488. \$5.00.)

Some years ago the late Professor Rand wrote with reference to the present author's *Gateway to the Middle Ages*, "We hope that having brought us to the gateway of the Middle Ages, Miss Duckett will next show us what is within the portals." In response to that invitation, *Anglo-Saxon Saints and Scholars* purports to trace the road "straight and shining, that should lead the peoples of Europe, old and new, from the gateway of the sixth century to that house of many windows which we call the Middle Ages."

The chief builders of this road are, of course, Aldhelm, Wilfrid, Bede, and Boniface. Saints all, and contemporaries, these men by their lives and writings dominate our view of English society in the late seventh and early eighth centuries. They represent, in flesh and blood and varied personality, what we mean by the mingled heritage of classical antiquity, barbarian nationhood, and Christianity. Through their eyes we witness the struggles of their countrymen: for political rule and overlordship, for the mastery of Latin grammar, and most of all for the attainment of the heavenly kingdom. Together, they have served to link fruitfully Celt and Roman with the continental German and Frank.

Miss Duckett has entered sympathetically into the spirit of these monks

and bishops, falling under the spell not, indeed, of the wordy Aldhelm, but of the kindly Bede. Like him she has eschewed the breaking of entirely new paths, and instead has directed her scholarship to the production of an accurate, well written, and pleasing synthesis. With no thesis, whether of Marx or Freud, Catholic or anti-Catholic, and little prejudice (save the modern discomfiture with the miraculous), she does not press her texts for more than they will bear, but so far as may be, she presents them at face value, interpreting, when necessary, with feeling and generosity.

Perhaps, herein lies the slight weakness of Miss Duckett's method—it produces panorama rather than deep penetration of character. Aldhelm especially fails to emerge very distinctly. In the case of Wilfrid the author realized keenly the problem of the disparity of views of the bishop and his activity as set forth by Bede and Eddius. Rather than attempt to harmonize the conflicts in a recognition of the complexity of Wilfrid's character (if such a harmony is indeed possible!) she has relied chiefly on Eddius to present Wilfrid in a very favorable light. We like this Wilfrid very much, we realize something of Miss Duckett's own charity of outlook, but we are not quite sure that it is the real Bishop of York.

Continuous contact with the sources, mastery of the secondary literature, and an appreciation of the natural background amidst which these noble Anglo-Saxon men and women worked make this book pleasant for the scholar of the period, and a vivid and trustworthy survey for the intelligent general reader.

SISTER M. THOMAS AQUINAS CARROLL

Mount Mercy College  
Pittsburgh

*Dante Alighieri. Citizen of Christendom.* By GERALD G. WALSH, S.J.  
(Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing Co. 1946. Pp. viii, 183. \$3.00.)

The particular type of Christian humanism to be found in Dante and its relevance to the achievement of an orderly, peaceful, and unified world, both in Dante's and in our own time, form the main subject of Father Walsh's study. His essay on "Dante's Philosophy of History" in *The Catholic Philosophy of History* (New York, 1936) and the chapter on "The Divine Comedy" in his *Mediaeval Humanism* (New York, 1942) may be considered as *prolegomena* to the present more comprehensive book.

Dante as "Citizen of Christendom" is heir to the earlier mediaeval ideal of Christian unity under the two-fold guidance of spiritual and temporal leadership and he was, too, a contributor of new and important elements of unification at a time when the concrete antagonism between these two leaderships had reached a phase of deadly fury. He was born shortly before

the last representatives of Hohenstaufen imperialism were annihilated by the papacy, he had grown to maturity when the new power of France made "Christ Himself a captive in His Vicar" Boniface VIII, and, when he died, the popes had gone to Avignon into what seemed to him and many of his contemporaries a Babylonian Captivity; also, in his personal life, he was a victim of the political disruption and moral degradation wrought in his own Florence and in all Italy by these conflicts and catastrophes. The contribution which Dante made in this situation—the only one he could make as an exile from his native city and the only one he thought worthwhile making as a thinker and poet—this contribution, as Father Walsh shows, was an attempt to reform the relationship between temporal power, grounded in law, but vitiated by tyranny, and spiritual authority, rooted in grace, but corruptible by human nature. He did so by setting up in unforgettable imagery concrete standards of human virtue, with the means at his disposal, the purifying and healing forces of wisdom and art. Father Walsh touches the core of Dante's doctrine, the living center of his efforts for the unification of a torn world, when he says that Dante "called in Athens" (beauty and truth), "to redress the balance between Rome and Jerusalem" (the temporal and the spiritual order). To use Dante's own Aristotelian terminology, only "*humana civilitas*" (*Conv.* IV, 4; *Mon.* 1, 3), that is only a morally, intellectually and aesthetically civilized human community, can bring about the unity and happiness of man on this earth, whose supernatural goal, nevertheless, remains the Augustinian City of God. Dante's concept of "*humana civilitas*," incidentally, has been made the subject of two important special studies: F. Kern, *Humana Civilitas* (Leipzig, 1913) and F. Ercole, "Per la genesi del pensiero politico di Dante: La base aristotelico-tomistica e l'idea dell'umana civiltà" in *Il pensiero politico di Dante*, Volume II (Milan, 1928). It may, perhaps, be regretted that all reference to modern literature on Dante is omitted in Father Walsh's book. Quite obviously there is no other reason for this than the author's desire to maintain the original character of the lectures and his reluctance to burden them with the intricate problems of "Dantology." Yet, the reader might have gained much by a discussion, e.g., of Etienne Gilson's great book *Dante et la philosophie* (Paris, 1939), with its synthetic treatment of Dante's philosophical and political thought.

In comparison with the idea of *humana civilitas*, the practical—or rather "unpractical"—means by which Dante hoped to see it made a reality, in other words his dream of a renewed world-empire, are of secondary importance. Politically and in its philosophical and theological consequences, Dante's imperial monarchism, tinged with Joachimite utopianism, is, in fact, a weak point in his system of thought. Here Father Walsh seems to go too far in attributing to Dante democratic ideas because he bases monarchical power on popular consent: this was an old *topos* of

political theory, which, before Marsilius of Padua, affected only speculation on the origins of monarchical government, but not its nature and working. It emerges very clearly from Father Walsh's book—and this to the reviewer seems one of its intentions and its merits—that Dante's greatness as a citizen of Christendom lies not in his personal solution of the political and ecclesiastical problems of his time, but rather in his much more deeply personal "love of the universe," which enables him to be a poet and prophet of *humana civilitas*, of true humanism, and true unity. This love is manifest, first, in a previously unheard of "sublimation" of his personal love, to Beatrice; second in the conception of an image of possible human happiness even on this earth, conditional upon love of truth and beauty and corresponding hatred of unpardonable ignorance and dullness in the "leaders" (*Purg.* XVI, 66: "The world is blind . . .," *ibid.*, 102: ". . . bad leadership is the reason"), in short, in the conception of *humana civilitas* which supplements the Augustinian doctrine of the Two Cities and opens up an original and somewhat more optimistic view of Christian history; and, third, in his ecstatic vision of "the love that moves the sun and all the other stars." Thus world-citizenship for Dante presupposes world-civilization, morally reformed and supernaturally informed through love—and this Father Walsh with good reason considers to be the chief import of Dante's thought for our time.

Space forbids the reviewer to deal with the author's discussions of various minor topics. With some of them—such as the identification of the gentle and compassionate lady in the *Vita Nova* with Dante's wife—it will be hard to agree; others, like the distinction between artistic and mystical experience in Dante, are of great interest. The principal, and considerable, value of Father Walsh's book seems to this reviewer to lie in an original and concentrated interpretation of Dante's life and work as a whole.

GERHART B. LADNER

*University of Notre Dame*

#### MODERN EUROPEAN HISTORY

*Bordeaux and the Gironde, 1789-1794.* By RICHARD MUNTHE BRACE.  
(Ithaca: Cornell University Press. 1947. Pp. xi, 279. \$3.00.)

Before undertaking a full-scale study of the Girondins and Girondism, Dr. Brace decided to organize the rich material he had gathered from the archives of Bordeaux. The result is this sane and lucid monograph which "reconstructs the history of Bordeaux and Gironde during the first five years of the Revolution" (p. 234).

Developments in the Gironde from 1789 to 1794, to be presented intelligibly, must be correlated with the portentous events then crowding

upon the national and the international stage. Such a presentation is the more difficult because provincial politicians seldom understood their real place in the larger picture. Dr. Brace opens his study with an analysis of the social and economic problems that engaged the Bordelais on the eve of 1789. He then traces (Chapters II-V) the revolutionary innovations at Bordeaux from 1789 to 1792, a period during which the local leaders obeyed the currents affecting all France. Chapter VI, "Gironde in War and Politics (1792)," criticizes the Girondin group in the Legislative Assembly and dissects the errors and miscalculations that undermined its leadership. Chapter VII, "The Fall of the Gironde (1793)," reappraises that tragic episode with sober impartiality. The two remaining chapters record the triumph of the montagnard forces and the effects of the Terror in Bordeaux during 1793 and 1794.

The forces shaping public opinion are so skilfully weighed that the reader is prepared for the failure of the "plan absurde" which called for a departmental force to oppose the centralizing policy of the Committee of Public Safety. The outstanding virtue of this well-compressed and finely written study is the patient, documented diagnosis it offers on a tangled plot. There is no sharp revision of historic values and no attempt at a novel interpretation. But Dr. Brace's sane assessment of the revolutionary pressures, especially of the economic motives, reveals his acquaintance with the latest research and his gift for historical synthesis.

A detailed index and a fourteen-page bibliography of manuscript and printed works complete the volume. The preparation and proof-reading have minimized errors, but "by" should be corrected to "be" (p. 25) and "acts" to "actes" (p. 255). Tribute is due the Cornell University Press for the exemplary editing, attractive layouts, and pleasing format.

GEOFFREY BRUNN

Columbia University

*Apologia pro vita sua; A Grammar of Assent; The Idea of a University.*

By JOHN HENRY CARDINAL NEWMAN, Edited by Charles Frederick Harrold. (New York: Longmans, Green and Co. 1947. Pp. xxii, 400; xxxviii, 413; xxii, 394. \$3.50 each.)

One of the most welcome statements to be made by an American publisher in 1947 was the announcement by Longmans, Green and Company that they would issue a selection of the works of Cardinal Newman in some twenty volumes, at the rate of three or four titles a year, beginning immediately with *The Idea of a University*, *A Grammar of Assent*, and *Apologia pro vita sua*. The complete works of Newman, long kept in print by the same publisher, have been unobtainable following the destruction



by fire and bombing in 1940 of the remaining sets stored in London. With the fortunate exception of three serviceable college texts edited by Father Daniel M. O'Connell, S.J., for the America Press, almost all the individual works, including some of great importance—*The Grammar of Assent* among them—have also been out of print for a considerable time, and increasingly difficult to secure from second-hand dealers. It is no exaggeration to say that this situation has in recent years tended to retard the advancement of Newman studies on this continent. Teachers desirous of extending the knowledge and the appreciation of Newman's writings, and librarians anxiously contemplating the ragged and disintegrating copies on their shelves will, therefore, be cheered by the timely publication of these three volumes which are, incidentally, printed and bound in a most attractive style, for which the designer, Robert Josephy, is very properly credited by name.

The publisher has secured the editorial services of Dr. Charles Frederick Harrold, professor of English at Ohio State University and well-known as the author of the biographical study of Newman which was so valuable a contribution to the centenary publications of 1945. Since it is not proposed to reprint the entire original collection of forty volumes, Dr. Harrold is called upon to make decisions which will eliminate nearly half of Newman's writings, a result to be secured, apparently, by the omission of certain theological treatises, of the collected correspondence, and of many of the essays and the sermons which will in this edition be reduced to two collections, of three and two volumes respectively, to appear later this year. In this matter the editor has adopted a reasonable plan, within the limits set for him, which will still allow him to include the most significant works. However, one does not envy him the task of making a selection of the sermons within the compass of two volumes, for many of them are noteworthy in style and content, and are receiving renewed attention, and deservedly so.

For each volume Professor Harrold has contributed a preface, explaining editorial questions, and a brief introduction setting forth the relevant literary and historical considerations. He has added as well a select bibliography, and an index, a most useful innovation in Newman's volumes. All this has been accomplished in the competent and learned manner which is now associated with the work of the editor. Admittedly the editorial problems which arise in connection with these three works are not particularly complex, but there is room for considerable variation in the amount of subsidiary material to be included. In this respect the editor is generous, especially in the case of the *Apologia*, supplying the text of the correspondence between Newman and Kingsley, as well as the two original pamphlets issued by Newman.

The wisdom of one decision seems to the present reviewer to be open to question. To supplement *The Idea of a University* the editor has printed the text of Discourse V of the first edition of 1852. This chapter, entitled "(Universal) Knowledge Viewed as One Philosophy" was withdrawn by Newman in the revision of 1859, and was not restored in the later impressions. It is, indeed, an interesting addition which few students of Newman have ever had the opportunity of reading, but in order to make room for it, the editor has omitted two chapters of "University Subjects," entitled "Elementary Studies," and "University Preaching," with the observation that "their lack of relevancy for our time, at least from a comparative standpoint, would seem to justify their omission." (p. ix). Even so, and there remains room for discussion, one is left with a feeling of regret that in the case of this very important volume completeness has been missed by so narrow a margin.

Dr. Harrold's most important contribution is to be found, of course, in the introduction. He writes in a judicial manner, giving even-handed consideration to the controversies and to the criticisms which have been associated with each work. On first reading, some admirers of Newman may find his presentation too cool and detached for their taste, but there is about it a directness and an honesty which is full compensation, especially for those who have historical interests. An excellent example of these qualities may be observed in pages xix-xx of the introduction to the *Apologia*. As the editor considers in an acute way the extent to which that work is not only a defence of Newman's sincerity but also an accurate portrayal of all the factors which played a part in the conversion, having in view the contrary opinion of certain Anglican writers that rebuffs and disappointments after the publication of Tract XC, rather than relentless logic, drove Newman into the Catholic Church.

The present volumes, and those to follow, will doubtless remain the standard American edition for many years. As opportunity offers, it is to be hoped, that the editor will be allowed to expand and to revise the useful bibliographies, keeping them up to date. It remains only to emphasize again the value and the importance of the new collection, for as the successive volumes take their place upon the shelf, Newman, to a like extent, should become better known and appreciated in our schools and colleges.

J. F. LEDDY

*University of Saskatchewan*

*Lady Gregory's Journals, 1916-1930.* Edited by Lennox Robinson. (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. 342. \$3.00.)

Begun in 1916, probably to record her efforts to get the Lane Pictures for Ireland, the *Journals* of Lady Gregory ran to approximately 500,000

words before ending in 1930. Lennox Robinson has reduced them to about 140,000. That "she wrote in a dreadful hand" adds to his merit, for some of the material had not been typed. Working with Lady Gregory in the Abbey Theatre qualified Lennox Robinson to edit these *Journals*, but his method has not been felicitous. He has divided the book into these sections, Coole (her estate), Persons and Places, The Abbey, Irish Politics, and The Lane Pictures, and then simply supplied elliptically the relevant matter at the cost of continuity and fulness. The incomplete index, compiled on the principle, "'twere well it were done quickly," is annoying, for a good index is a serviceable guide to a book of this type.

In 1852, Lady Gregory was born Augusta Persse, the daughter of a wealthy Irish landowner. Her husband, Sir Walter Gregory, served as M.P. and Governor of Ceylon. A major figure in the Irish literary renaissance, her love of country wrought many volumes of Irish folk-lore and history. Her best identification is the title, "Godmother of the Abbey Theatre," for she wrote or translated many of its plays and contributed in some fashion to every Abbey activity.

Finishing this book, one questions the importance of what was read. Just how important today are the *Journals*? Although possessing historical interest, for the trained historian they lack documentation, systematization, and a professional interpretation of events; e.g., "That plumber that comes here told me he heard one of them say——" (p. 144). The discussion of the Abbey will be welcomed by the litterateur, but he will criticize so heavy a percentage in the vein—I went to the theatre, talked to the actors, had tea, watched the play, and noticed the audience reaction. This backstage chit-chat and literary bric-a-brac catch too well the commonplace monotony of much of life. Valuable as the inside story of the Lane Pictures is, repetitiousness creeps into these attempts to arrest her nephew's pictures from the National Gallery of London on the basis of the moral right of a letter codicil to his will. In Persons and Places, we enjoy meeting George Bernard Shaw, Emily Lawless, Sir Horace Plunkett, W. B. Yeats, Sean O'Casey, and kindred notables. Yet not enough is written about any of them. We regret their being whisked away after a mere artistic handshake.

Enjoyable as they are, the *Journals* will never assume a classic position in the genre of autobiography, journalism, or letter writing. There is none of the three dimensional reportorial genius of Rebecca West, nor the color and sweep of the *Letters* of Walpole. Here is the weaker pleasantness of Fanny Burney, and Lady Gregory never sinks to the pathos of Pepys.

Though not an important book, the *Journals* possess a certain charm with their nostalgic and plaintive pleasantness. Mirrored is the gentle, peaceful, tragedy of a woman growing old among the flowers of a beloved home, as dear friends pass to the grave, and activity faintly restirs her

life-long enthusiasms. On Irish politics, and on all else, there is an admirable fair-mindedness. Her humane *noblesse oblige* outlook contrasts happily with the power politics of history's every day. Her zeal for the worthwhile, so quiet and composed, mirrors the essential striving for goodness so natural in the human person. A rich urbanity and deep politeness grace her sound dramatic and literary judgments.

In our current desert of racy, clipt speech, needled best-sellers, here is a delightful oasis. And faint praise is not intended in borrowing Addison's judgment of the *Rape of the Lock*—"a merum sal."

EDWARD F. KENRICK

Cardinal Hayes High School  
New York City

#### AMERICAN HISTORY

*The American Experience. An Interpretation of the History and Civilization of the American People.* By HENRY BAMFORD PARKES. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc. 1947. Pp. xiv, 343, viii. \$3.50.)

Professor Parkes proposes in the introduction to this study of American civilization to estimate the interaction between the European cultural tradition and the American "agrarian" world to which it was transplanted. However, he scarcely ever considers this great cultural conflict in the millions of individuals who carried on the drama but deals in terms of generalized persons and literary concepts. He gives far too much importance to American literary productions, implying that their authors were deliberately trying to express American experience. In the first place, his generalizations about the European culture are not dated or localized. European culture did not come to the present United States at any one time, or in books only, but in a continuous flow of people. To apply a sweeping generalization to the millions of English, Irish, Germans, French, Italians and peoples of other nations as they came to our shores at various times and in various economic conditions might be acceptable if the generalization had been tested by careful sampling and testing. But the countless exceptions that must be made to Professor Parkes' generalizations make the lack of such sampling very obvious. He has read widely in American historical literature, but he shows little experience in personal research into the complexities of American social history.

Neither does Dr. Parkes know the actual history of the American frontier except as it has appeared in Turner's essay, Parrington's volumes, and in a few more literary studies. The American "agrarianism" of which he speaks is bookish generalization of all American frontier experience. Much of the theoretical force of the frontier disappears when the char-

acters of the lower class people who went west are scrutinized. And we are not so sure—nor is Dr. Parkes—that, given time and the ending of large population movements, Americans will not return to the ideals of western Europe and, perhaps, to the social and religious ideals which he too quickly rejects. The individualism of the Americans is not very intellectual nor is it cultured; and the pessimism which he finds in Americans of later generations can be explained in great part, not in the failure to attain the ideals, but in the essential defects of those ideals which came with Americans from a Europe thrown into turmoil by discovery and expansion. Like Dr. Parkes, those who are so boastful of American superiority and those who are so disdainful of American low ideals have reached their judgments primarily because of the premises with which they began their investigation.

THOMAS T. McAVOY

*University of Notre Dame*

*The Record of American Diplomacy: Documents and Readings in the History of American Foreign Relations.* Selected and Edited by RUTH J. BARTLETT. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1947. Pp. xx, 731, xvii. \$6.00.)

The appearance of a single volume containing necessary source material for a course in American diplomatic history is a stroke of good fortune. There has never been any lack of useful printed materials for the greater part of our diplomatic record—in fact, nearly every selection from official documents in this volume is taken out of a printed collection—but few libraries possess all of those necessary for full reference. Now Professor Bartlett has brought into smaller compass most of the documents to which any student must direct his attention before he has completed a proper survey of the subject. Beginning with the Treaty of Whitehall of 1686 and continuing down to the Truman Doctrine of March 12, 1947, there is no topic without an adequate documentary representation. It represents an achievement of organization and, by testimonial of Professor Samuel Flagg Bemis, "Once this volume is available and in use teachers will wonder how they ever got along without it."

The editor admits that he foresaw it would be impossible to satisfy completely in a work of this kind, and that every teacher of the subject would find missing some illustration of importance to his course. For a subsequent edition there might well be taken some consensus of reader opinion. Perhaps others besides this reviewer might like to see a larger presentation of the "Plan of 1776" to embrace more than the maritime policy which preoccupied the Continental Congress. If texts, treatises, and editorials are to be included, a sample from Stephen's *War in Disguise*



or the *Frauds of the Neutral Flags* might be preferred to the extract from Henry Adam's *History* (p. 126). Section XVI could well be improved to include illustrations of Commodore Perry's views on Far Eastern bases, and here one also misses any reference to Seward's expressions on the importance of commercial empire. Anson Burlingame does not even have a place in the index to this volume, and Chinese immigration might never have been troublesome to judge by this alone. For the twentieth century any further refinement might reflect a bias, but nevertheless the reports of the Pearl Harbor investigation by Congress have at least a place in our consideration, while economies of space could be effected by the elimination of much of the double-talk put out in the 1930's as statements of "principles." This would make room for the Johnson Act. However, and in spite of this evidence that the editor spoke truly about not pleasing everyone, the book as it stands deserves to receive a general acceptance.

JOHN T. FARRELL

*The Catholic University of America*

*The Atlantic Frontier. Colonial American Civilization, 1607-1763.* By LOUIS B. WRIGHT. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf. 1947. Pp. xi, 354 \$4.50.)

The colonial period has been the most intensively studied of all periods of American history; hence there is no shortage of good books on it. But it is always hard to find a synthesis of the history of any age which successfully organizes the most useful results of recent research for laymen. Mr. Wright's book approaches this ideal.

The book is organized geographically by sections and chronologically within the sectional narratives. Following each treatment of the settlement and development of a section is an account of its socio-economic life, and then, usually, a rather longer (and rather better) analysis of its intellectual life. For many readers this will mean that the place of the colonies in the empire is not clarified; a topical organization might have remedied this. Many topics that deserve as much attention as the narratives of settlement are taken up for final disposition in the thirty-three pages of the last chapter (Chapter VII, "The Colonies Come of Age"); among them are: mercantile policy, immigration, land policy, Anglo-French wars, the need for inter-colonial co-operation, Indian problems, the class system, urbanization, and the Great Awakening (most of which also receive incidental sectional treatment in earlier chapters). The book closes with a view of America seen through a traveler's eyes, 1759-1760, and a final comment on forces making for unity among the colonies.

All the apparatus is good. The notes and bibliographies (both accumulated at the end of the book) are clear and useful. The whole work is orn-



amented and illuminated by eighteen wisely chosen centemporary maps and prints from the Huntington Library, which avoid the common misfortune of being more curious than instructive. And there is the usual fine job of collaboration between the Knopf editors and the Kingsport Press book-wrights, to produce a work of art between covers.

In viewpoint Mr. Wright is a Whig in English history, and Protestant-Modernist in religion. For an example of a Whig view: he grudges any merit in the government of New York under James II, a government which compared very well with the first twenty years under the Hanoverian appointees. His religious frame-of-reference is shown by a generous salting of the text with words such as "theocracy," "priestcraft," "pious oligarchy," "yoke of the clergy."

In his usual way, the author draws freely on English and American literature, hardly separating the study of literature from the study of history. A particular merit of this approach is that it helps to etch a clear picture of the intellectual and social life of the tobacco aristocracy, which is the strongest (and most diverting) part of the book, although his assay of the ore of New England history, separating truth from pious legend or cynical debunking is to be recommended. It is particularly pleasant to read at last, in a general work, a clear statement of New England's "Covenant theology;" Perry Miller's analysis of this modified Calvinism has too long been ignored by synthesizers, with college textbook authors the worst offenders. Wright's exposition of the seepage of middle class ethical concepts into the minds of the seventeenth-century gentry is also a first rate job.

Certain statements are simple assumptions of the correctness of one or the other side of hot controversies: was Massachusetts Bay really a "theocracy" (p. 118)? Did the Massachusetts "Body of Liberties" lean heavily on the common law? (p. 119.—R. B. Morris' monograph is not mentioned in the bibliography.) Was the French "encirclement" of the English colonies in America really the policy of "Louis XIV's imperial schemers" (p. 269)? To these and other propositions Mr. Wright says "yes" where the reviewer and others (more respectable than the reviewer) say "no." And in the European aspect of the story (principally in Chapter I) where the reviewer does not presume to speak as one having authority, there seems much room for dispute.

These disagreements are emphatically not grounds on which the book is to be condemned. On the contrary, the reviewer was instructed by the book, and hopes that it finds a large audience.

MARSHALL SMELSER

*University of Notre Dame*

*The Wilderness Road. (1644-1947).* American Trail Series. By ROBERT L. KINKAID. (Indianapolis-New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1947. Pp. 392. \$3.75.)

Originally an Indian trail, the Wilderness Road remained a rude pack-horse route until 1796 when Governor Isaac Shelby converted the section from Cumberland Gap to the settlements in Kentucky into a modern wagon road. Joseph F. Bosworth, a Lexington lawyer of Kentucky, fathered the hard-surfaced highway for automobiles. Streamlining the old trail for speed began in 1908 and has extended to the present day. Federal Highway Number 11, or the Robert E. Lee Highway, follows the path of the original romantic trail and introduces the hurrying traveller to the historic sites reminiscent of the hardy pioneers who moved slowly amid countless hazards from the piedmont region to the wilderness of Kentucky and Tennessee.

From a wealth of material the competent author has selected the events and personalities necessary to give unity and coherence to a vivid narrative. The appended bibliography is one of the most valuable features of the book. The reader is guided in acquiring a perspective of geographical sites by thirty-one carefully chosen illustrations. An adequate map of the old trail includes the pioneer settlements and modern cities and villages in its environs.

Roughly the story of westward expansion may be divided into preliminary exploration, settlement or colonization, the struggle for freedom from Great Britain under the leadership of General George Rogers Clark, the formation of the states of Kentucky and Tennessee, the Civil War period, and the era of industrial development of the local resources. General Abraham Wood and his subalterns, Captain Thomas Batts and Thomas Wood (1671-1673), were the pathfinders in Kentucky. Typical of the land speculators of the early period was Thomas, the sixth Lord Fairfax of Cameron, who in 1747 established a manor of 10,000 acres in the Shenandoah Valley of Virginia. In 1748 he engaged the sixteen-year-old George Washington to survey his property.

The power of the eastern Indians was broken by the defeat of Opechancanough, brother of King Powhatan, in 1644, but the menace of the ambuscading, vindictive western tribes was ever present along the trail until 1794 when the "Guardian of the Road," Colonial William Whitley, developed a new technique in fighting the savages by pursuing the redmen to their hidden retreats and attacking them *en masse* with adequate forces and weapons. The gallant old warrior, at the age of sixty-four, was slain in the War of 1812 in a military exploit against the Shawnee chief, Tecumseh. Cumberland Gap, strategic entrance to Kentucky from Tennessee, long deluded the Unionists with false hopes. The Confederates,

happily, could not employ it to their advantage. "For both the Blue and the Gray, it was only a trail of dead horses, broken wagons, blasted hopes." The local campaigns to save Kentucky and Tennessee for the federal Union are graphically represented with emphasis upon the loyalty of the non-slave holding residents of eastern Tennessee.

An economic bubble which was fostered by English money and blown by Alexander Alan Arthur, a distant relative of President Arthur, dissolved in mist following the panic of 1893. The mountain missionary, the Reverend A. A. Meyers, Congregationalist, opposed the unhealthy financial pyramiding in vain with his sane philosophy: "Better to get wisdom than gold." The indefatigable labor of the Reverend Meyers, aided by General Howard, included the salvaging of some of the property involved in the financial debacle of Arthur and led to the institution of a permanent monument to education and progress, the Lincoln Memorial University.

Daniel Boone, the romanticized explorer, road-builder, and long hunter, is given due space and credit in the narrative, but he is presented in correct historical proportion in deference to many other equally famous personalities linked to the old trail.

THOMAS F. CLEARY

*St. John's Rectory*  
Bradford, Illinois

*History and Bibliography of American Newspapers, 1690-1820.* By CLARENCE S. BRIGHAM. (Worcester: American Antiquarian Society. 1947. Two Volumes. Pp. xvii, 757; 758-1508. \$15.00.)

Bibliographers, fortunately, often lack foresight. Had the director of the American Antiquarian Society realized in 1913 that his resolve to locate the files and write the bibliographical history of the 2120 newspapers published in this country prior to 1821 would have resulted in the loss of thirty-four vacations and the expenditure of considerable sums in traveling to 400-odd cities and towns he might have hesitated. In these days of co-operative enterprises, such as Gregory's *American Newspapers, 1821-1936* and her indispensable *Union List of Serials*, an individually compiled union list as Brigham's is all the more astounding. However, even Brigham's *History* is co-operative; 15,000 letters attest to outside help. Therefore, those who may not be acquainted with the previous installments in the *Proceedings* of the American Antiquarian Society might approach this volume with scepticism, soon changing, however, to admiration at the accomplished fact.

Brigham was fortunate that the American Antiquarian Society, thanks to the prescience of its founder, Isaiah Thomas, holds files of 1495

newspaper titles, 560 more than its nearest competitor, the Library of Congress, and over double that of Harvard's collection. "For the period previous to 1821, a conservative estimate would be that the Society owns nearly half a million issues of newspapers available for the use of the investigator" (p. xiv). The broad arrangement of these volumes is similar to Gregory, i.e., by states, then by city. The history of each paper is given in one or more paragraphs; each change of title, editorship, printer, and publisher is in the record, often with quotations from a prospectus, the first issue, or some bibliographical record in case no copy is available.

Symbols for libraries and individuals holding volumes or copies are not used; Brigham prefers a full or slightly abbreviated name, e.g., "Lib. congress." This practice helps prevent errors sometimes resulting from copying the closely printed entries in the various *Union Lists*. Appendices listing public and private owners and a list of printers, editors, and publishers complete the set. In the Catholic field, at several points Brigham supplements or corrects Baumgartner, Foik, and Parsons, e.g., in the data on the *Courier de Boston*, the (New York) *Shamrock, or, Hibernian Chronicle*, the (New York) *Military Monitor*, published by Thomas O'Connor and Stephen Wall, and the (Philadelphia) *National Gazette and Literary Register*. However, one does not find that the Catholic magazine, announced in the *Laity's Directory* of 1817, was ever published.

Brigham and Gregory have now become the silent partners in newspaper research of every student in American history. It is a pleasure to use the word "definitive" and "indispensable" in connection with this set.

EUGENE P. WILLGING

*The Catholic University of America*

*Thomas Jefferson: American Humanist.* By KARL LEHMANN. (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. xiii, 273. \$4.50.)

Since practically every aspect of Thomas Jefferson's life and thought has at sometime or another been submitted to the public, it is interesting to inquire what justification Mr. Lehmann finds for his study other than the great devotion he has shown his subject since 1933. He believes he has found a common denominator for the "Apostle of Americanism's" galaxy of tastes and talents in what he calls Jefferson's "attitude toward mankind." He has succeeded in producing another monograph which might aptly be named "Jefferson and Historical Method."

Although Jefferson was not unacquainted with mediaeval and modern history, his preference lay strongly with the world of the Greeks and Romans. By combining a thorough study of antiquity with daily ex-

perience he was able to develop what was for him a satisfactory general outlook on human affairs. Mr. Lehmann sees this "philosophy of history" as three parts empiricism to two parts pessimism and positivism. To Jefferson history was merely an extension of personal experience and was to be written by "conjuring up the ghosts of the past and making them come alive." In its most radical form his empiricism produced a violent aversion to all theories and systems; in the field of historical progress preconceived theories could only erect unnecessary barriers to truth. His skepticism led him to conclude that "history, in general, only informs us what bad government is." The function of historical studies was thus seen to be that of delimiting the course of the channel which flows toward the harbor of an improved society by pointing out the rocks and shoals. His pessimism led Jefferson to conclude that since there were no great men in the political history of antiquity, biography was an unreliable type of historical study. "Traditional greatness was [too] dependent on mental standards of posterity."

In the field of historical method, Jefferson advocated the use of four tools: the use of original sources, the use of analogy based on personal experience, a study of the living remnant of the past, and "the grasp of singularity of the specific facts," as Mr. Lehmann expresses it. Mr. Lehmann cites Jefferson's "critical approach to the original sources of Christianity" as an outstanding example of his approach to writings on history in general. (That Jefferson's critical approach led him to conclude that St. Paul was "the great Coryphaeus [of] a band of dupes and imposters" raises no question in Mr. Lehmann's mind as to the adequacy of this approach.) Jefferson insisted that students should read the original Greek and Latin authors instead of compilations and digests. Locke and Bolingbroke had already treated witnesses and testimony in relation to critical method, and Jefferson was following in their train. Jefferson himself had every reason to deplore the bias of contemporary judgments and was no more willing to exonerate his antique models of the charge of willful distortion of historic fact.

The use of analogies between past and present historical experience led Jefferson to as many startling conclusions as the same practice produces for some of our contemporary philosopher-historians. But Mr. Lehmann believes that, notwithstanding the bizarre quality of these analogies, Jefferson made a real contribution to the scientific history of the nineteenth century. Certainly his emphasis on excavation before the specialists discovered it is worthy of note.

Mr. Lehmann's book should have a market in view of the recurring interest taken in the subject of historical approach. It is marred by some serious defects, if it is to be judged by the standards of the more pretensions works in the field. His sources are limited in every case to those



already published. The novel arrangement of his footnotes by page and paragraph leaves much to be desired, since the body of the text gives no indication whatever that such notes exist. Mr. Lehmann says in his preface that he does not attempt to point out the parallelism of Jefferson's ideas with those of others and then proceeds to point out, at great length in some cases, the parallelism between Jefferson and Goethe, Locke, Cabanis, Lord Kames, Jacob Burckhardt, etc. In conclusion, we might wish that Mr. Lehmann, who is professor of fine arts at New York University, had devoted more than one of his twelve chapters to the field in which he would naturally be most competent to make serious judgments.

ANNABELLE M. MELVILLE

*St. Joseph's College*  
*Emmitsburg*

*The Great Northwest.* By OSCAR OSBURN WINTHER, Assistant in History, Indiana University. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc. 1947. Pp. xv, 383. \$4.50.)

The scope of this book is stated in the preface: it is "a historical survey" of the Pacific Northwest. Consequently one must not look here for an exhaustive study of any of a number of leading topics touched upon by Dr. Winther. Obviously each of them, if given adequate treatment, would itself require a full-length book. The work, accordingly, must be reviewed in the light of the author's intention.

The organization of this book is excellent. The first two chapters fix the setting and open the country to white exploitation. Then come four chapters on the fur trade, followed by three more on its natural sequence, settlement and boundary disputes. From this point the volume concentrates on "what are today the states of Oregon, Washington, and Idaho" with some references to Montana west of the Rockies and British Columbia. One chapter (X) on the formation of Oregon state and Washington territory introduces the discussion in nine chapters of developments in various fields within the above areas: agriculture, mining, transportation, industry, politics, and home-making. The final chapter is at once a summary and a forecast; albeit a very enthusiastic one.

The conception of this work, then, is praiseworthy; the execution, however, is marred by an annoying succession of inaccuracies which are most regrettable and unnecessary. Furthermore, the Catholic reader, besides careless statements, will note serious omissions. He will find no mention of the Catholic "Reinforcements" of 1844 under DeSmet, or of 1847 under both Archbishop Francis N. Blanchet and his brother, Bishop A. M. A. Blanchet, or of the notable band of Oblates of Mary Immaculate from Marseilles in France, who accompanied Bishop Blanchet over the Ore-



gon Trail from Westport Landing. Nor is there a single word on the organization of the Catholic hierarchy in the Far West, although Oregon City was the second metropolitan see erected in continental United States. These events, so it seems to this reviewer, should have some mention even in a survey.

A surprising defect is in the bibliography; it is not only uncritical, it entirely omits mention of a number of works, some of which are important sources and others are standard guides in the field of the author's research. Neither Manning's work on the Nootka Sound controversy nor Stanley's on the Red River settlement are listed, nor are the writings of Alexander Ross, of Robert Stuart (Rollins' edition), or of J. Q. Thornton. There is no reference to Chittenden and Richardson, to the *Annales de la Propagation de la Foi*, whether Quebec or Lyons, or to the *Rapport de L'Archiviste de la Province de Québec*. The monumental edition of Wagner-Camp's, *The Plains and the Rockies*, and other excellent guides such as Smith's and Judson's are not mentioned, nor are any of a number of excellent government publications. A word, too, on the Gonzaga University archives and on the Reed College "Armitage Competition in Oregon Pioneer History" would have been appropriate.

I am sorry to have to close this review with the statement that the present edition of his work cannot be recommended. As Professor Winther does have a sincere love for the great Northwest, one can confidently hope that a future edition will correct the shortcomings of this one and will make a definite contribution to the growing literature of this expanding area. Until then, George W. Fuller's, *A History of the Pacific Northwest*, though out-dated, is the safer guide for the critical reader.

WILLIAM L. DAVIS

Gonzaga University

*Richard Hildreth*. By DONALD E. EMERSON. [Johns Hopkins University Studies in Historical and Political Science, Series LXIV, Number 2] (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press. 1946. Pp. 181. \$2.00.)

The name of Richard Hildreth is generally recognized by students of American history as that of the author of one of the larger histories of the United States produced in the middle of the nineteenth century. Who he was, what he did, and how he came to write his six-volume work, few could say with certainty. Dr. Emerson has attempted to provide the answer to these questions in his biographical study of Hildreth. Unfortunately, the sources for information in this case are definitely few; there are no masses of correspondence, and even the papers of Hildreth's friends and contemporaries contain only minor items. The result is a

narrative based largely on newspapers, a commonplace book, a notebook of literary memoranda, and several odds and ends. It is not altogether the author's fault, therefore, that in this account Hildreth fails to appear as a flesh-and-blood man. It is unfortunate, too, that circumstances prevented Dr. Emerson from rounding out the biography with the historiographical analysis which was originally intended to be a part of the study. Some critical estimate of Hildreth's work and his place among American historians would have increased immeasurably the value of this monograph.

Dr. Emerson follows with care the main events of Hildreth's life, including something of the family background, the years as a Whig journalist and leader of anti-slavery sentiment, the purely literary period, the writing of the *History*, the work on the New York *Daily Tribune*, and the final period of deterioration in Trieste. The fact that so much of the material on these matters comes from the printed pages of the newspapers and of Hildreth's own productions makes the narrative almost entirely factual. There are glimpses of the man's struggle to make a living and to maintain his family; otherwise, the human element is lacking. Perhaps it is captious to want to know more about the actual methods used by Hildreth in writing his *History*—the sources may be blank on this score—yet since it is for the *History* that Hildreth is known today, it would be interesting to have some fuller account of the composition of that work. The picture gained from Dr. Emerson's study is one of an industrious man endowed with a gift of concentration, working on the history amidst flurries of anti-slavery activity.

One appendix is a brief essay, "A Note: Hildreth on Bancroft's *History*," and a second appendix provides a chronological listing of Hildreth's writings. A bibliographical note at the end is mainly negative in character and serves to point out the sources which were consulted, but which do not have material on Hildreth.

WILLIAM D. HOYT, JR.

Loyola College  
Baltimore

*Diplomat in Carpet Slippers.* By JAY MONAGHAN. (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill Co. 1945. Pp. 505. \$4.00.)

Mr. Monaghan's volume is merely another item in the long list of books devoted to the dubious task of developing the Lincoln legend. It seems difficult for anyone writing on Lincoln to refrain from using superlatives to describe the manner in which he solved the many serious problems that arose during the period of his presidency. As a politician he is always depicted as adroit and farseeing. Political storms did arise, but like some cloud-compeller Jove, Lincoln controlled the elements and brought eventual

sunshine and serenity to a deeply worried America. It is admitted that his bold expansion of the President's war powers brought him into sharp conflict with a jealous Congress, but there is the prompt explanation that his genius for personal manipulation never failed to prepare the way for inevitable victory. On the domestic scene he was without a real rival.

In the field of foreign policy, however, most biographers have assumed that Lincoln leaned heavily upon Secretary Seward for support. After a bad start in April, 1861, Seward is usually supposed to have developed into a real statesman whose conduct of foreign relations is one of the brightest spots in Civil War history. Mr. Monaghan's book is a lengthy challenge to such a viewpoint. Lincoln is now depicted as a master mind who formulated our major foreign policies and instructed Seward as to the manner in which they should be executed. In support of this novel viewpoint Mr. Monaghan does not present any new data. There are no new Lincoln papers that support his contentions. He merely makes strong assertion take the place of historical documentation, and Lincoln becomes the great diplomat in carpet slippers because evidence to the contrary is overlooked. In order to increase the stature of Lincoln, the author makes Seward a mere stooge who readily responds to direction. Such a low estimate of Seward will not be accepted by many students of American foreign policy.

Mr. Monaghan's style is breezy, his pen portraits are colorful, and his narrative moves like a Hollywood scenario. There is something big and dramatic on every third page. There are lots of villains stalking through these pages and there are many dark plots in the wings of a wide stage, but Lincoln is always able at the right moment to walk majestically into the spotlight and assure the anxious audience that he has the situation well in hand. A typical example of this technique is found in the treatment of the crisis that arose in the summer of 1862. The military situation had grown seemingly desperate after McClellan failed in his drive upon Richmond. Palmerston and Napoleon III were making plans to intervene in the Civil War on behalf of the South and something drastic was needed to keep these marplots in check. Lincoln rose to the emergency by summoning Seward to the White House and instructing him to send an "unofficial letter" to Bigelow in Paris in which dark hints were thrown out concerning a possible "defensive alliance" with Russia. The very thought of such an alliance made the most "hardened diplomats in Europe quail as from a ghost. Kind, awkward, fumbling, defeated Lincoln appeared to be standing over Europe, holding back an avalanche that threatened to crush civilization." In the face of this fearsome threat, Palmerston changed his policy and the Union was saved.

Mr. Monaghan is confusing the present-day Russian threat to civilization with the very different situation that existed in 1862 when the Muscovite tide had small chance of engulfing a powerful Europe. Palmerston gave little thought to the informal letter from Seward to John Bigelow. His decision against intervention in the Civil War was based upon Lee's defeat at Antietam and it was not influenced by any threatening gesture by Lincoln.

There are many novel and dubious statements in this volume on Lincoln as a diplomat, but one has to remember the audience to which Mr. Monaghan is evidently appealing. The Lincoln as portrayed in these pages would make a "movie" that would stir millions of American hearts. Although the author may not have been making a deep bow in the direction of Hollywood it is certain that there is a lot of gold in the endless hills of the Lincoln legend.

CHARLES CALLAN TANSILL

Georgetown University

*Horace Greeley and the Republican Party.* By JESTER ALLEN ISELY. (Princeton University Press. 1947. Pp. xiii, 368. \$4.50.)

Horace Greeley was doubtlessly one of the most dramatic and enigmatic figures in American history. Mr. Isely's study, therefore, takes its place in a collection of *Greeleyana*. It is a noteworthy contribution. The author has wisely chosen to limit the scope of his work. This was a necessity, partially imposed by the staggering volume of Greeley's own writings, both in print and in manuscript collections.

Isely is chiefly concerned, as he tells us, with "the background and causes of the Civil War" (p. ix). He sets out to explain how this most influential of all nineteenth-century newspaper editors actually helped to bring about a war which he had labored to prevent. The paradoxical feature lends color to the monograph.

It is a truism to remark that the various humanitarian movements of the early century found a common denominator in the anti-slavery crusade. Many an idealist laid aside particular *desiderata* and plunged headlong into the great moral issue that was dividing the American body politic. It was, perhaps, inevitable that politics would feel the force of the impulse, for it is patently true that "The cohesive force of the anti-slavery movement created the Republican party and held it together during the vociferous years preceding the Civil War" (p. 3). Members were certainly at odds in almost all other respects.

In no case was this evolution of the reforming impulse more far reaching in its importance than in Greeley's. His Horatio Alger-like youth had, not unnaturally, contributed to a certain self-righteousness. But who can

quarrel with the sources of his socio-economic ideas which were compounded of a "belief in the equality of opportunity, in a just distribution of the economic benefits of the industrial revolution, and in the fraternity of man as taught by Christ?" (pp. 19-20). One hardly needs, therefore, to enter into an extended explanation of his antipathy toward the "peculiar institution." Suffice it to say that his social program also ran counter to the aims of the slavocracy. The Kansas-Nebraska Bill striking him in the heart, he jettisoned all of his other reforms and "marched with screaming headlines against the apologists for human bondage, and helped inaugurate the Republican party" (p. 30).

The bulk of the book is devoted to Greeley's influence in this party. No doubt it is true that, however heterogeneous the party's roll call may have seemed, its rank and file of Illinois farmers, New England spinsters, and ultra-respectable clergymen, were for the most part avid readers of at least the *Weekly Tribune*. Though Greeley was an honest man, his responsibility for the Civil War was great. He had decided that the South would never fight, but that it was only gambling to secure a Republican withdrawal of principles. He saw his error too late.

No reader can fail to be impressed with the thoroughness of this work. The chief sources cited are the *Tribune* editorials, the Greeley-Colfax correspondence in the New York Public Library, the Greeley Papers in the Library of Congress, and the collections of letters of other prominent Republicans of the era. However, Isely makes ample use of other newspapers, periodicals, pamphlets, and official publications. Apparently no possibility has been overlooked in the realm of secondary sources. He does not follow the over-sympathetic traditional treatment by James Parton (still adhered to evidently in Henry L. Stoddard's recent work), but neither does he become an iconoclast. The image is criticized, but not destroyed. Together with Parton, this work should rank as a *sine qua non* on Greeley.

The Princeton University Press has done a superior job of binding and craftsmanship for this worthy addition to their promising series of studies.

GEORGE L. A. REILLY

*Caldwell College*

*The South during Reconstruction, 1865-1877.* By E. MERTON COULTER.  
[A History of the South, Volume VIII.] (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press. 1947. Pp. xii, 426. \$5.00.)

In this realistic study of the South during Reconstruction, Professor Coulter has made a notable contribution. He has brought forward much new material and he has written in a very pleasing style. The revisionists may regard his treatment of the period as dominated by a traditional



viewpoint. In the judgment of this reviewer, however, he has come closer to realism than any writer who has dealt with the period. His investigation has strengthened the conclusion of the Dunning school concerning the bitter partisanship, the folly, and the corruption of the radicals. It is unfortunate that the author frequently uses the term northern "tormentors" in referring to the radicals, but he has faithfully represented contemporary opinion, which he has studied carefully in the southern press, travelers' accounts, and diaries of the period. His picture of the Negroes during this period is entirely human, although one might wish that he could have viewed them in the light of their future destiny and progress.

In many ways Professor Coulter challenges the conclusions of the revisionists. In an excellent chapter on education, he points out that the radicals made little effort to carry out their educational programs and that in many cases used school funds for corrupt purposes. Also they nearly ruined the reviving universities in most of the southern states (Arkansas being a notable exception). He has pointed out the failure of the radicals to do anything constructively for the Negroes, especially in aiding them to secure land. A great mistake was made in the failure of the radicals to seek the support of the intelligent and respectable elements of southern society, a course of action that resulted in the Republican Party below the Potomac becoming a Negro party, instead of winning the allegiance of whites as well as blacks.

Mr. Coulter's chapters on the social and economic organization of southern society during this period are a delineation of a depressing stage of southern life. Agriculture, with the exception of the raising of cotton, had not revived to pre-war levels of production until after 1880. One important weakness of this section of the book is the inadequate treatment of the rise of tenant farming and its social effects. In discussing the southern newspapers, it is remarkable that the author has neglected the work of Henry Watterson. It is interesting to observe the new importance of women in the literature of the South during the decade following the Civil War. Yet the literary record is full of sentimentality and provincialism. Professor Coulter ends his study with two admirable chapters on the "Disintegration of Radicalism" and "The New South."

This volume is the first one published in the long-awaited *History of the South*, a co-operative work of southern scholars. It has a distinguished format, a good critical bibliography, and is carefully edited. This study of Reconstruction undoubtedly represents a southern viewpoint, and should be read side by side with the work of the revisionists. The truth probably lies between the two opposing viewpoints. Certainly Professor Coulter has taken a strong and forthright position in discussing a controversial subject and in expressing historical judgments that are worthy of respect.

*University of Kentucky*

CLEMENT EATON



*The Progressive Movement of 1924.* By KENETH CAMPBELL MACKAY.  
[Columbia University Studies in History, Economics and Public Law,  
No. 527.] (New York: Columbia University Press. 1947. Pp. 298.  
\$3.75.)

The two party system is so firmly established a feature of American political life that historical sketches of presidential campaigns naturally emphasize the successes and failures of the major parties in their regularly recurring struggles for control of the government. Third party movements, being short-lived, are often treated as temporary digressions from the main story. But to the political scientist and to the historian of democratic life third party movements have real significance. Nowhere are the technical problems of organizing, managing, and preserving a political party so clearly exhibited as in the history of a third party. Nothing reveals more clearly to the historian the character, extent, and intensity of discontent.

To a very considerable degree this analysis of the Progressive movement of 1924 does what such a study should do. There are good short descriptions of the reactionary trends in national governmental policies under Harding, of the economic troubles of the farmers, of the dissatisfaction of railroad workers with the Esch-Cummins Act, of the defeats suffered by labor because of court decisions, especially the use of sweeping injunctions to break strikes. Naturally enough, however, the work is more valuable for its development of the several steps by which the various elements of discontent were brought together to support a common candidate and a common platform.

The central agency which brought these groups together for common action was the Conference for Progressive Political Action formed at a meeting held in Chicago at the call of the heads of the fifteen standard railroad brotherhoods. Three hundred delegates representing labor, farmers, and progressives of all complexions attended, but four elements or groups were really combined by this CPPA, not into a political party, but into a combination working for modification of laws affecting economic life. Labor, especially represented by the brotherhoods, traditionally non-partisan in its political activities, farmers of the Northwest, Socialists anxious to form a new party with a revolutionary program, and the Committee of Forty-Eight, who had kept the name and spirit of the Progressives of 1912, despite the disappointments of 1916 and 1920. Noteworthy and important was the participation of the Socialists, who alone had any real political organization in many states. Equally significant was the unwillingness of the CPPA to foster a party unless election results seemed to warrant it.

When the Democrats, torn by the Smith-McAdoo vendetta, nominated the very conservative John W. Davis, thus matching rather than challeng-

ing the Republicans, the moment seemed distinctly opportune for a third candidate. Nor was there much doubt as to who he should be. LaFollette was so definitely the choice, that the convention naming him gave him free hand to write his own platform and pick his running mate. The campaign was not very old before it became evident that the Progressive candidate and platform offered not only the real challenge, but a definite opportunity to the Republicans. In calling not only for the crushing of monopolies, government ownership of railroads, high surtaxes, abolition of injunctions in labor disputes, encouragement of farmers' co-operatives but also for direct election of the President, national initiative and referendum, election of Supreme Court judges, and the right of Congress to override decisions of that tribunal LaFollette presented a series of proposals that were pointed to successfully by the Republicans as threats to the American way of life. Obviously the defense of that way of life must be left to the Republicans.

The Progressives suffered from the drastic nature of several of the proposals, from the support of radical groups (though Communists were rigidly excluded from their councils), from the war record of its candidate. Lack of funds, of state and local organizations, of supporting state tickets, and inexperienced management all militated against Progressive success. As the campaign wore on, labor support in particular fell off. LaFollette carried but one state, although he ran well in the Northwest. But the results were not up to expectations, and when he died the next year the movement died with him, even though the progressive spirit carried on to influence considerably the New Deal.

The study is based on extensive research, and is generally well written, but it is marred by many careless slips. To say, in a book published in 1947: "There is no one today, unless it be Franklin D. Roosevelt . . ." (p. 124), or that the network assembled in 1924 was the "largest network ever assembled . . ." is careless. Proof-reading was poor; "advisers" and "advisors" in the same paragraph (p. 259), extra words "in in." and "it it." (p. 30 and 239), "principle" for principal (p. 108), a line left out (p. 221) are some of the slips. Nor should one ascribe to a donkey what is true of a mule (p. 109).

The study would be better if more attention and space were given to the content of LaFollette's speeches to reveal better the temper and tone, and if more attention were given to the treatment of labor's proposals at the conventions of the major parties. But it is a worthwhile account, even if not on a par with Hick's *Populist Revolt*.

P. RAYMOND NIELSON

*Creighton University*

*Prosperity Decade: From War to Depression: 1917-1929.* By GEORGE SOULE. (New York: Rinehart & Co. 1947. Pp. xiii, 365. \$4.00.)  
*Depression Decade: From New Era through New Deal: 1929-1941.* By BROADUS MITCHELL. (New York: Rinehart & Co. 1947. Pp. xviii, 462. \$4.00.)

The historian, always seeking understanding, must be grateful to the editors of this much-needed series, *Economic History of the United States*, and in a particular way to the authors of the present Volumes VIII and IX of the series for their very significant contributions to the understanding of the perplexing years between the two World Wars.

As both Mr. Soule and Mr. Mitchell show, the depression of the 1930's was not started by the stock market crash of 1929. But the intensity and extent of that crash, the psychological as well as the economic shock it induced, the persistence of the depression that followed, together with the methods used, both in the United States and in foreign lands, to combat that depression have made that crash, its antecedents and consequences, the material of a prodigious amount of investigation and analysis. The explanation of these phenomena has been a challenge many economists have accepted. If their explanations have differed, have often been contradictory, they have yet added both zest and confusion to the search for the understanding the historian wants.

Mr. Soule's *Prosperity Decade* is particularly helpful for his analysis of the several theories of laws of economics, as they did not explain satisfactorily the succession of booms and recessions of the years he covered. His approach and attitude remain always essentially historical. Describing the circumstances and activities of the decade, he looks for the explanation, balancing and judging the theories proposed. He does not hesitate to criticize persons, laws, or institutions, but he does not indulge in speculation on what might have been, nor does he plead a cause unless it is that one cannot rely on the factors that are supposed to maintain balance in a free economy when that economy is not in fact free. Mr. Mitchell, while not all uncritical, is more pronounced in his views, in his advocacy of a social consciousness, that should modify individualism, and a concern for human values that should ameliorate the operation of rigid economic rules.

The significance of the relation between governmental policy and economic behavior is apparent in both volumes, but, of course, it dominates the study of the depression years. Mr. Soule treats of economic activity only relatively bothered by government; Mr. Mitchell the varying efforts of the Hoover and Roosevelt administrations to give relief and stimulate recovery. Both indicate the international setting of our economy but while Mitchell blames World War I for all that followed, Mr. Soule

maintains that the New Era "was the outgrowth largely of going institutions in the United States." (p. 335).

Both volumes are very well written; one might note especially Mr. Mitchell's introduction to his discussion of TVA (pp. 339-341). The method of treatment, common to both, is an overview, analysis of particular topics, and a chapter of conclusions. The photographic illustrations are truly documentary, the charts and tables revealing, and the appraisals of the literature very helpful.

The volumes are to be recommended to the historian and to the general reader.

P. RAYMOND NIELSON

Creighton University

#### IBERO-AMERICAN HISTORY

*O descobrimento do Brasil estudo crítico de acordo com a documentação historico-cartografica e a nautica.* By THOMAS OSCAR MARCONDES DE SOUZA. [Biblioteca Pedagógica Brasileira, Série 5.<sup>a</sup>, Vol. 253.] (São Paulo: Companhia Editora Nacional. 1946. Pp. xiv, 381.)

Pedro Álvares Cabral "officially" discovered Brazil on April 22, 1500, in the course of a voyage to India under Portuguese auspices. Was his Brazilian landfall accidental, as it was thought for centuries, or was it part of a preconceived plan based on a prior knowledge of South America? The belief that Cabral reached Brazil by chance, and that the existence of a southern continent was unknown to the Portuguese before 1500, was seriously challenged for the first time in 1850, when Joaquim Norberto de Sousa e Silva, at a meeting of the Brazilian Historical and Geographical Institute, advanced the argument that Cabral's Brazilian voyage was intentional. Subsequently the thesis was taken up by historians in Portugal, and in the monumental *História da colonização portuguesa do Brasil* (3 vols., Porto, 1921-1924) an ambitious effort was made to prove it. So insistent was the claim that Cabral knew what he was doing, and so plausible the evidence marshalled in its support, that historians generally began to doubt the traditional view of the expedition. The problem, of course, was by no means simple. If it was true that Cabral's voyage was intentional, he must have had some knowledge of Brazil before he left Lisbon. Was this likely in 1500? Some Portuguese historians thought so. On the basis of a mooted passage in *Esmeraldo de situ orbis* (written between 1505 and 1508 but only published in 1892), they agreed with Henry Vignaud that Duarte Pacheco Pereira, the man who had been with Bartholomew Dias on his expedition of 1487 and accompanied Cabral in 1500, actually discovered Brazil in 1498. For the intellectual chauvinist this

explanation had another advantage. With Pacheco it would no longer wound national pride to hold, as many have held, that foreigners were in Brazil in 1499 and again in 1500, that is to say, before Cabral. Portuguese priority in the matter was at least assured. Even so the authors of the *História*, who were also patriotic, denied that Alonso de Hojeda, Amerigo Vespucci, and Vicente Yáñez Pinzón arrived in Brazil before Cabral, and in the course of their pages gave the Italian a thrashing such as he had not had since the publication of the volume on the Vespucci voyages by Sir Clements R. Markham. The *História*, however, despite its wonderful display of erudition, did not satisfy everybody, and since its appearance a number of books and articles have been published by such men as Alberto Magnaghi, Samuel Eliot Morison, William B. Greenlee, Frederick J. Pohl, Armando and Jaime Cortesão, A. Fontoura da Costa, and Admiral Gago Coutinho which have added a great deal to our knowledge. Truly the interest in the discovery of Brazil has been much alive; yet these later scholars, although they have showed in some ways that the *História* cannot be swallowed whole, have not always reached the same conclusions. Much of the old confusion still remained.

This was the posture of things when Sr. Marcondes de Souza wrote his book. In its four sections the work covers more ground than the title suggests. The first part deals with North America in the light of what is known about Diogo de Teive, Pedro de Velasco, João Vaz Côrte-Real, Fernão Dulmo, João Alfonso de Estreito, and João Fernandes; it conforms pretty closely to Morison's *Portuguese Voyages to America in the Fifteenth Century* (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1940). The second part has to do with South America. Here the author discusses the reputed discovery of Brazil before 1448 and touches upon João Ramalho, the letter of Estêvão Fróis, and Pacheco. The third part is a brief treatment of the false and true precursors of Cabral, i.e., Jean Cousin, Hojeda, Vespucci, and Pinzón. The fourth and largest section is devoted to the discovery of Brazil by Cabral. In a convenient appendix there are 121 pages of transcriptions of documents and other sources of interest for the study.

The chief value of Sr. Marcondes de Sousa's book lies in the fact that it is a sober attempt to weigh the evidence that exists on one of the most complex aspects of Brazilian history. He has done this so successfully that his book is certainly the best summary to date of the Cabral problem. The author discovered no new sources—what a sensation it would have been if he had!—and the book from this narrow point of view is not original. But original or not, we are exceedingly grateful to him for a sane analysis that has swept away many cobwebs and put things in their proper place. He has made clear that until other documentary materials are brought to light, Brazilian and Portuguese historians must be content to admit that Cabral, after all, reached Brazil by accident. He has con-



cluded that Pacheco was not in Brazil in 1498 and that Hojeda was not a precursor of Cabral. Vespucci may be the real precursor of Cabral; Pinzón definitely was. These questions are, to be sure, wholly academic as the author himself realizes. Just as the pre-Columbian discovery of America does not affect the history of the new world, so the pre-Cabralian expeditions to Brazil do not have any influence on the history of that country. But since the questions have been raised so often, and in such high places, a scholar like Sr. Marcondes de Sousa has done well to answer them.

The errors in the book are few and of minor importance, but they could have been easily avoided. The bibliography suffers from a number of omissions, many of the entries are incompletely given, and in all cases volume numbers are missing. Periodicals are also loosely listed. The author is not clear in regard to the discovery of Iceland and Greenland (p. 4). In his section on the Azores he might have used more of the works of Ernesto do Canto. Edgar Prestage is incorrectly called "professor de camoniana" (p. 53). In treating of João Ramalho the author might have cited the work of Tito Lívio Ferreira, *Gênese da Gente Bandeirante* (São Paulo, 1944). As usual in the volumes published in the *Brasiliana* series, the paper is abominable. It is a pity that an important book was not given a better dress.

MANOEL S. CARDOZO

*The Catholic University of America*

*Pichardo's Treatise on the Limits of Louisiana and Texas.* Translated and Annotated by CHARLES WILSON HACKETT and CHARMION CLAIR SHELBY. Volume IV. (Austin: University of Texas Press. 1946. Pp. xiii, 514. \$6.50.)

This volume, the fourth in the series, completes what is without question a monumental and most valuable contribution to Spanish-American historiography. About half of the volume under review (pp. 1-249) finishes in four chapters Part III of *Pichardo's Treatise*. It embodies his presentation and discussion of eighteenth-century documents relative to the Louisiana-Texas boundary dispute and it concludes with a discussion of French penetration into the lands south-southeast of Natchitoches. The second half of the volume (pp. 253-476) contains in two chapters Part IV of *Pichardo's Treatise*. The first chapter refutes the objections of Anglo-Americans and the second those of Spaniards "to the boundary between Louisiana and Texas as Proposed by D'Anville" on his celebrated map of the region in question.

In point of method and arrangement the editor adheres strictly to the one which he employed in the previous three volumes and which the present



reviewer declared twelve years ago, (*Catholic Historical Review*, XXI [January, 1936], 491), and which he now repeats "may well serve as model for similar enterprises."

The value and importance of *Pichardo's Treatise*, itself a rich storehouse of historical materials, both primary and secondary, is immensely enhanced by Professor Hackett's own contributions—corrections here and there of the original text on the basis of historical findings since the days of Father Pichardo and exhaustive references to books both in the running footnotes and in the appended bibliographies; while the translation from the Spanish is exceedingly well done in point of style and diction. *Pichardo's Treatise* as we now have it in English dress is not only soundly historical but also eminently literary.

To Professor Hackett and Miss Shelby a word of commendation is in order for having courageously undertaken in 1931 the tremendous task of translating and annotating the 3000 folio page treatise of Pichardo, for having patiently and tenaciously pursued their enterprise these many years, and for having succeeded so well in giving us a work of sound scholarship that will be consulted and referred to by students for generations to come. A word of congratulation is due also to the University of Texas, notably to its Bureau of Research in the Social Sciences, for having sponsored the work of its two distinguished scholars and published it in so durable and attractive a form.

As the present reviewer stated a few years ago in his *Tentative Guide to Historical Materials on the Spanish Borderlands*, we have in *Pichardo's Treatise* "A work of inestimable value and a lasting credit to the high scholarship of editor and translator, a rich storehouse of bibliographical and historical data" (p. 14). Students of Spanish American history, notably of our Spanish borderlands, will do well to consult when occasion offers the four handsome volumes of *Pichardo's Treatise on the Limits of Louisiana and Texas*.

FRANCIS BORGIA STECK

Quincy College

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

---

With the new Volume XXXIV we introduce to our readers three new advisory editors in the Reverend Robert F. McNamara, professor of church history in St. Bernard's Seminary, Rochester, Thomas P. Neill, associate professor of history in St. Louis University, and the Reverend George J. Undreiner, professor of history in the Pontifical College Josephinum at Worthington, Ohio. Father McNamara's principal interest is the history of the Church in the United States, Father Undreiner's is the Church in Europe and Latin America, and Mr. Neill has specialized in the history of modern Europe.

At the quarterly meeting of the board of editors of the REVIEW on February 9 it was decided that in the future the doctoral dissertations in history published by the Catholic University of America Press would be reviewed in our journal. This change in policy was made in compliance with a request of the Executive Council of the American Catholic Historical Association framed at its meeting in Cleveland on December 27, 1947. Announcement is hereby made of the change so that those authors who sent in review copies of their doctoral dissertations done at the University in years past will have a satisfactory explanation of the change of policy when they see in future issues the reviews of historical studies published by the University Press.

The full Committee on Program of the American Catholic Historical Association met on February 14 in Washington to plan the details of the Association's annual Christmas gathering for 1948. William D. Hoyt, Jr., of Loyola College, Baltimore, Chairman, presided and the plans as drawn by the committee give promise of highly attractive offerings for the meeting at the Hotel Mayflower in Washington next Christmas week.

The fourth summer training course in the preservation and administration of archives will be held at the National Archives in Washington from July 26 to August 21, 1948. The fee for the course, in which veterans may enroll under Public Laws 16 and 346, will be \$40.00. More detailed information can be obtained by writing to Professor Ernst Posner, 1901 F Street, N. W., Washington 6, D. C.

The *Thirteenth Annual Report of the Archivist of the United States* for the year ending June 30, 1947, has been printed by the United States Government Printing Office. This is the last annual report that will contain a list of accessions for the year. A quarterly list of accessions, which in the past has been distributed chiefly within the government, will continue to be issued and the four issues covering a given fiscal year will constitute a sup-

plement to the annual report of the Archivist for that year as well as to a new *Guide* to records in the National Archives, which will soon be for sale by the Superintendent of Documents, Government Printing Office.

Father John Tracy Ellis spent the week of January 23-30 on a tour of the archives of several of the southern dioceses. The archives of the Archdiocese of New Orleans have a considerable body of material. It consists of photostats of the New Orleans material in the archives of the University of Notre Dame, a good number of papers for the diocesan business from the time of Bishop DeNeckere to Archbishop Rummel, and several large cases of documents of Archbishops Chapelle and Blenk which have importance for the Church in the Philippines, Cuba, and Puerto Rico in the years after the Spanish American War. The archives of the Dioceses of Mobile and Charleston likewise have considerable material, although the papers in these archives are pretty generally confined to business of a diocesan character. The tour netted in all about forty letters which will be useful for the biography of Cardinal Gibbons, along with copies of about twenty-five letters for use by several graduate students for projects on which they are at work at the University.

In June, 1944, the late Bishop of Buffalo, the Most Reverend John A. Duffy, requested his pastors to submit histories of their parishes, according to a uniform outline; and he appointed a Diocesan Historical Commission to collect these sketches and any other papers that would be of service to an as-yet-undesignated diocesan historiographer. The Reverend Edward S. Schwegler, archivist of the Commission, has meanwhile been collecting pertinent correspondence from the New York Archdiocesan Archives, Rochester Diocesan Archives, Archives of the University of Notre Dame, and the archives of St. Bonaventure College and Niagara University.

In commemoration of the centenary of the Diocese of Buffalo, Father Schwegler published, in the diocesan paper, *The Union and Echo*, each week from January 3, 1947, to January 2, 1948, a miscellaneous historical column, containing select parish histories, pastorals and other extracts from old diocesan papers, and a series of letters by or pertaining to Bishop John Timon, C. M., Buffalo's first ordinary, and his successors. The Timon papers include two from Bishop Timon to the Reverend Edward Sorin, C.S.C., one to the Right Reverend Francis P. McFarland, Bishop of Hartford, and five to the Most Reverend Anthony Blanc, Archbishop of New Orleans. The originals of these eight letters are in the Archives of the University of Notre Dame.

The Commission also promises the early publication of the two extant volumes of Bishop Timon's Diary, which cover the period from November 9, 1855, to February 24, 1867.

The Rush Rhees Library of the University of Rochester, Rochester, N. Y., for some time the temporary depository of the Thurlow Weed Collection, has now become owner of the collection, thanks to three descendants of Mr. Weed: Mrs. Harriet Weed Hollister Spencer, Mrs. Elizabeth Hollister Frost Blair, and Mrs. Isabelle Hollister Tuttle. Thurlow Weed (1797-1882), powerful New York State Whig and Republican politician and lobbyist, and promoter of William H. Seward, participated, with Archbishop John Hughes of New York and Protestant Episcopal Bishop Charles P. McIlvaine, of Ohio, in a mission sent by Abraham Lincoln in 1861 to dissuade England from breaking peace with the United States after the *Trent* affair. Archbishop Hughes, whose task it was to visit the Emperor Napoleon III, kept Mr. Weed, working in England, informed of his progress. The Weed Papers contain five original letters from Hughes to Weed, dated: New York, October 29, 1861; Paris, December 11, 1861; Paris, December 24, 1861; Paris, January 11, 1862; Paris, January 29, 1862. There is also a letter from the Reverend Francis McNeirny, secretary to the archbishop, to Mr. Weed, dated, Paris, December 18, 1861; and the collection possesses a microfilm copy of a letter from Hughes to Weed dated, New York, April 21, 1861, of which the original is in the archives of the New York Historical Society. The letter of October 29, 1861, and that of December 11 were reproduced in Hassard's *Life of the Most Reverend John Hughes, D.D.*, at pp. 451 and 461-2, respectively, the second letter only in part, and erroneously dated December 10.

The only other letters in the Weed Collection which seem to be of Catholic interest are two business letters from Nicholas Deveraux to Thurlow Weed, dated May 20, 1836, and January 14, 1847; and one undated letter from Sister M. Joseph Deveraux, a daughter of Nicholas, asking a favor of Mr. Weed.

The Rush Rhees Library has, for some forty years, been the depository of the papers of Louis Henry Morgan (1818-1881), Rochester lawyer, noted ethnologist, and the "Father of American Anthropology." Mr. Morgan's interest in Indian folkways brought him into contact with two famous Catholic missionaries, the Right Reverend Frederic Baraga (1797-1868), first Bishop of Sault Sainte Marie and Marquette, and Father Pierre-Jean DeSmet, S.J. The Morgan Papers contain one small note by Bishop Baraga, a covering letter addressed to Mr. Peter White of Marquette, and dated, Sault Sainte Marie, March 3, 1859. There is also one letter from Father DeSmet to Morgan, dated, "Washington City," September 10, 1862. This second letter indicates the existence of a cordial friendship between the Jesuit and the ethnologist, and makes one suspect that the bulky, unpublished *ms.* journals of Morgan's field trips west of the Mississippi, would reveal that the missionary rendered him valuable assistance in his work. The notes

of his many trips to Marquette may possibly disclose a similar relationship with Bishop Baraga.

Through a bequest of its owner the library of William M. Elkins has been given to the Free Library of Philadelphia. The collection is particularly rich in early *Americana*.

A phase of Catholic activity in this country which needs better historical investigation and recording is the progress of scientific studies in our educational institutions. Catholic institutions generally have lacked the financial resources for elaborate experiments; yet Kirsch, Zahm, and Niëwland at Notre Dame, the Jesuit seismologists, and the scientific work at Villanova and the Catholic University of America are just the highlights of Catholic efforts to advance scientific knowledge and to eliminate the supposed contradictions between religious and scientific truth.

With the death in recent years of Bishops McDevitt, Howard, and Peterson and Father Burns, the remarkable group of Catholic cultural leaders at the turn of the century who founded the National Catholic Educational Association have all gone except John J. Wynne, S.J. Probably no group in our American Catholic history has had so deep an influence on the development of the Church in this country as these founders. Each of these men made a distinctive personal contribution to the cause of Catholic education, and efforts should be made, before it is too late, to have their endeavors and accomplishments, individual and collective, properly chronicled.

The recipients of the Hearst Scholarships in American history at the University of Notre Dame for the year 1947-48 are Earl Breault of the College of St. Thomas, St. Paul, Richard Noonan of the College of the Holy Cross, Worcester, and Robert Reinders and Charles Poinsett of Notre Dame. James J. Green of Mt. Clemens, Michigan, and William Gwinn of Bristol, Wisconsin, both returned veterans, received the Bishop John F. O'Hara, C.S.C., fellowships in history.

The History Teachers' Club, formed among Catholic high school teachers of history at Notre Dame, has begun again to issue its quarterly *Bulletin* in mimeograph form. The editor is Sister Mary de Sales, S.N.D., of Notre Dame Academy, Toledo. The president of the club is Father Adrian McLaughlin of Delborton School, Morristown, New Jersey. The *Bulletin* consists of articles by teachers and students on the history teacher's problems, book reviews, and correspondence. The club plans to hold a second conference on the teaching of history in high schools at Notre Dame in July.

The annual report of John B. Tenny, S.S., as secretary of the Commission for Catholic Missions among the Colored People and the Indians,

entitled *Our Negro and Indian Missions*, is always a matter of interest to the American Church. The report shows the total Catholic Negro population of the United States at 343,830, a gain of 22,000 over the figure reported for 1946. The number of Catholic schools for Negro children now stands at 292, nine above the total reported for the previous year. These schools are staffed by 1800 religious and lay teachers and the total attendance is 64,000, which represents a gain of three per cent over last year's record. Of the total of about 280,000 Indians in the United States reported by the United States Indian Office, 90,388 are Catholics. These Catholic Indians are attended from 110 mission centers of which sixty-four are large enough to maintain schools with a total attendance of 7720 children. Approximately 150 priests are engaged exclusively in work for the Indians and they are assisted by 727 sisters, lay brothers, scholastics, lay teachers, and catechists.

The Diocese of Lafayette has the largest number of Catholic Negroes, with 60,000 reported, followed by the Archdiocese of New Orleans with 48,899, and the Archdioceses of Baltimore and Washington with 38,341. For Catholic Indians the Diocese of Rapid City leads with 10,360 and in second place is the Diocese of Gallup with 10,000. During the course of 1947 the office of the Commission appropriated \$753,500 to the Negro and Indian mission enterprises.

In *Revista de Indias* (Año VIII, Num. 27: Jan.-Mar., 1947, pp. 7-52) Father F. Mateos Ortin, S.J., gives a description of the Collections of Documents Relating to America and the Philippines made by Father Pablo Pastells y Vila, S.J. (1846-1932). Father Pastells's monumental *Historia de la Compañía de Jesús en la Provincia del Paraguay* (Argentina, Paraguay, Uruguay, Peru, Bolivia, and Brazil), which began to appear in 1912, is being continued by Father Mateos; Volume VI, covering the years 1715-1731, appeared in Madrid, 1946. Father Mateos is also the editor of *Historia General de la Compañía de Jesús en la Provincia del Perú*, an anonymous chronicle written in 1600 (2 volumes, Madrid, 1944). In the same issue (pp. 69-102) Hipólito Sancho de Sopranis presents some data concerning Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca, with special reference to his youth, his birthplace, and his ancestors.

In *Revista de Indias* (Año VIII, Nums. 28-29: Apr.-Sept., 1947, pp. 509-520 and 521-537), in the section of *Miscelánea*, there appear two short items of American interest. The first, by Angel Losada, deals with a forgotten history of Spain's discovery of America: *De orbe novo* of the Spanish humanist, John Ginés de Sepúlveda (ca. 1490-1573). The other item, by Bartolomé Garcés Ferrá, gives an extract from a manuscript volume that formerly belonged to the Jesuit Archives of the Province of Aragon. This extract furnishes the names of the Jesuits who had been sent



to the Indies from that province. The whole volume is described in *Boletín del Reino de Mallorca*, 1946, nums. 1 & 2, pp. 17-32 and 70.

The Household Archive of the Imperial Family of Brazil, now in the Château d'Eu in France, has been given to the Brazilian Government and will soon be transported to Brazil.

The fifteenth volume of the *Jahrbuch für Liturgiewissenschaft* edited by Odo Casel, O.S.B., which appeared in 1941, has the following articles: Das Sanctoreale des ältesten ungarischen Sakramentars by Karl Kniewald; Mittelalterliche Kommunionriten by Peter Browe; Liturgie und Barock by Anton L. Mayer; and Glaube, Gnosis und Mysterium by Odo Casel. In addition there are 250 pages of critical bibliography for the year 1935.

Placide Bruylants, O.S.B., publishes a verbal concordance of over 300 pages (A-L) of the Leonine Sacramentary in tome XVIII (1945) of the *Bulletin Du Cange*. He writes a brief introduction on the unique Verona manuscript of the text and gives a bibliography.

The question of the authenticity of Hroswitha's works has been reopened by Z. Haraszi in his article "The Works of Hroswitha" in *More Books*, Boston, March and April, 1945. He calls attention to the fact that in spite of the discovery of three new manuscripts containing parts of Hroswitha's works, the variants of which were incorporated in Strecker's revised edition of 1930, no attempt has been made to subject the manuscripts to palaeological and photo-chemical tests to determine their age and authenticity. Until the results of this critical examination have been made known, Haraszi maintains that he will be unconvinced of the authenticity of Hroswitha's writings.

E. H. Zeydel of the University of Cincinnati in a series of articles regarding Hroswitha (*MLN*, 1944, 1945, 1946 *Phil. Quar.*, 1944, and *Speculum*, 1945) admits that it would be rash to decide the question of the authenticity of Hroswitha's works without this critical examination of manuscripts urged by Haraszi. Yet he poses fourteen embarrassing questions to scholars who would hold these writings to be the forgeries of the humanist Celtes and his group.

Abbé Louis Jadin, professor of philosophy of the University of Louvain, has been working on the correspondence between the Belgian bishops and the Vatican for the Institut Historique Belge de Rome. His latest study, "Les actes de la Congrégation Consistoriale et les procès d'information pour la nomination des évêques des Pays-Bas depuis 1567 jusqu'à 1848," appears in the *Bulletin de l'Institut Historique Belge de Rome*, tomes VIII-XVI.

For the first time since the war, the Congress of History and Archaeology of Belgium, which formerly was held every two years, took place at Ant-

werp on July 27-30, 1947. Mr. J. Sabbe, state archivist of Antwerp, served as secretary-general of the gathering.

The *Rivista di storia della chiesa in Italia*, published three times annually by the Istituto Grafico Tiberino, via Gaeta, 14, Rome, began publication in January, 1947. The editorial board consists of Pio Paschini, Angelo Mercati, Hubert Jedin, and Pietro Pirri. A foreign subscription is 1600 lire yearly. The first issue contains articles by G. Soranzo on the antecedents of the so-called Gelasian Theory; by P. Paschini on Cardinal Guglielmo Sirleto in Calabria (1566-67); and by P. Pirri on the mission of Monsignor Corboli Bussi in Lombardy and the crisis of Pius IX's Italian policy, April 1848. A. Campana edits two unpublished letters of St. Peter Damiani. In the May issue D. Mallardo writes on the Campania and Naples during the Arian crisis; O. Bertolini, on the fall of the primicerius Christopher (771) according to contemporary accounts and the anti—and philo—Lombard currents in Rome at the close of the pontificate of Stephen III (771-772); L. Olier, on Paolo Regio, Bishop of Vico Equense, a forgotten hagiographer (1541-1607). This number also has a note on a trial of Piedmontese Waldesians in 1335 and a document on Reformation postulates in Upper Italy. The *Rivista* gives an extensive bibliography on Italian Church history by regions.

The first two sumptuous issues of *Scriptorium* (International Review of Manuscript Studies) have appeared. Their rich contents are listed in our Periodical Literature. The fascicles are to be issued twice yearly to form a volume of 360 pages and 48 plates. The subscription price is twelve dollars per year (S. A. Standaard-Boekhandel, Avenue de Belgique, 151, Anvers, Belgique).

In the October and January issues of *Folia*, Ludwig Bieler writes interestingly and learnedly on textual criticism. (We can have no objection to Mr. Bieler's calling himself a grammarian if he prefers; we do wish he had not disguised his valuable article as "The Grammarian's Craft.") Joseph Marique, S.J., has a note on Platyna's *Decent Pleasures and Health* (October), and A. Nehring discusses the word *numen* (January). The subscription price of *Folia* is \$1.00 per year of three issues (Mr. Daniel Woods, 136 West 13th Street, New York City).

The November number of the *Journal of Politics* has a number of articles by various authors concerning post-war governments in the Orient.

A new fortnightly publication called *Archive* appeared in its first issue on December 15, 1947. It is published by the New Europe Publishing Company Limited at 6 Denmark Street, London, W. C. 2. and sells for \$42.00 per year. It is an international documentary research service of twenty-four sheets per issue, and is designed to provide a factual, authen-

ticated record, free of comment, on the most significant problems and personalities in current international affairs. The editor is Russell McKinnon Croft.

The Outline Press, Inc., at 2308 W. Van Buren Street, Chicago 12, Illinois, has recently brought out a new translation of Pius XI's encyclical, *On Reconstructing the Social Order* of May 15, 1931. The outline and index have been prepared by Professor Francis J. Brown of the Department of Economics in the University of Notre Dame. The brochure is eighty-four pages in length and sells for \$.50.

It is reported that plans are under way for establishing a Catholic University of Germany at Paderborn.

The Catholic Commission on Intellectual and Cultural Affairs will hold its third annual meeting on May 16 at the College of New Rochelle. Edward V. Stanford, O.S.A., executive director, will represent the Commission at the meeting of the International Catholic Movement for Intellectual and Cultural Affairs in London on August 11-17.

Lewis Hanke, director of the Hispanic Foundation, Library of Congress, is the new secretary of the American Council of Learned Societies.

John J. Meng, chairman of the Department of Political Science in Queens College and president of the American Catholic Historical Association in 1945, has been promoted to the rank of Associate Professor.

The Reverend Maynard Geiger, O.F.M., archivist of Mission Santa Barbara, California, and member of the historical commission of the Diocese of Monterey-Fresno for the beatification of Fray Junipero Serra, received the Cervantes medal award, annually bestowed by the Hispanic Institute in Florida to one who has fostered friendly relations between the Spanish or Portuguese and English speaking peoples in the field of history, literature, or civic affairs. Father Maynard is the author of *The Franciscan Conquest of Florida* and a *Biographical Dictionary of the Franciscans in Spanish Florida and Cuba*; he translated and annotated Ore's *The Martyrs of Florida*. More recently he published a *Calendar of Documents in the Santa Barbara Mission Archives*. He is currently working on a life of Serra and a biographical dictionary of the Spanish Franciscans in California.

William L. Davis, S.J., read a paper, "The Diocese of Walla Walla, 1846-1853," at the annual meeting of the Pacific Coast Branch of the American Historical Association at Berkeley, January 2 and 3, 1948.

Francis Xavier Murphy, C.S.S.R., is attending a meeting of the Redemptorist historians in Rome this spring. He will remain in Rome for a considerable period to do research in the Vatican Library and Archives.

Thomas B. Falls, professor of church history in St. Charles Borromeo Seminary at Overbrook, was elected President of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia on December 16. Father Falls holds his doctor's degree from the Pontifical Lateran Athenaeum in Rome. His two-volume translation of the works of St. Justin Martyr will appear soon in the series, *Fathers of the Church*.

Eris O'Brien, author of *The Foundation of Catholicism in Australia. Life and Letters of Archpriest John Joseph Therry* (2 volumes, Sydney, 1922) and *The Dawn of Catholicism in Australia* (2 volumes, Sydney, 1927) has been named auxiliary bishop to Norman Cardinal Gilroy, Archbishop of Sydney. Monsignor O'Brien took his doctorate at the University of Louvain and has been a lecturer in history at the University of Sydney for some time. While we rejoice in the honor which has come to him, we hope that his new duties will not prevent his completing the long-awaited biography of Cardinal Moran of Sydney (1830-1911) upon which he has been working.

Walter Ullmann who has been teaching at Ratcliffe College, Leicester, England, has been appointed a lecturer in mediaeval history at the University of Leeds. He has also been appointed this year's Maitland Memorial Lecturer at Cambridge. His volume on Lucas de Penna was reviewed in our April, 1947, issue.

G. N. Clark gives a brief account of the life of Charles William Previté-Orton in the October issue of the *English Historical Review*. Professor Previté-Orton died on March 11, 1947.

American Catholic scholarship lost a real friend in the death on November 23, 1947, of the Most Reverend James H. Ryan, Archbishop of Omaha. Archbishop Ryan, who died at the comparatively early age of sixty-one had been actively engaged in the field of education for a quarter century as a professor of philosophy in St. Mary-of-the-Woods College (1911-1921) and as a member of the faculty and fifth Rector of the Catholic University of America (1922-1935). Moreover, he had served as director of the Department of Education of the National Catholic Welfare Conference from 1920 to his election as Rector of the University in 1928. During his time as rector he gave the impetus for raising the standards of graduate instruction within the University and when he departed from Washington in November, 1935, to become Bishop of Omaha he willed to his successor a much strengthened institution. During his administration of the University Bishop Ryan did not cease to interest himself in the immediate problems of scholarship and it was due in large measure to his effort that *New Scholasticism*, the quarterly journal of the American Catholic Philosophical Association, came into being in 1927. He likewise assisted in the founding of

the Mediaeval Academy of America. His last years were again active ones in the cause of Catholic education, when he filled the position of episcopal chairman of the Department of Education of the National Catholic Welfare Conference from 1946 to his death. He was raised to the archiepiscopal dignity in August, 1945, at the time that his see became an archdiocese. Among his published works were *An Introduction to Philosophy* (New York, 1924), and an edition and English translation of *The Encyclicals of Pius XI* (St. Louis, 1927). Archbishop Ryan was decorated by the governments of Italy, Yugoslavia, and Poland and in 1935 was made a Cavaliere Magistrale of the Order of Malta.

In the death on January 5 of Sister Francis Jerome O'Laughlin, C.S.C., St. Mary's College, Notre Dame, lost one of its strongest personalities and Catholic higher education a pioneer in Catholic collegiate education for women. Sister Francis Jerome, the daughter of Michael O'Laughlin and Mary Ann Carey, was born in Seneca, Illinois, on December 14, 1877, and entered the Congregation of the Sisters of Holy Cross on August 15, 1902. She received her master of arts degree from Notre Dame and her doctorate from Fordham. Her chief field of interest was Latin and Greek literature and at St. Mary's she supervised the production of several of the ancient Greek dramas. She had completed a translation of Dom Aelred's *Spiritual Friendship* with a commentary, which will be published shortly. Closely associated with the builders of the present-day St. Mary's College, she prepared a biography of the second foundress under the title, *This is Mother Pauline* (Notre Dame, 1945), and contributed essays to other historical publications prepared on the occasion of the centenary of the Sisters of Holy Cross in 1941.

Demetrius B. Zema, S.J., professor of mediaeval history at Fordham University, died in New York City on February 1, 1948. A native of Reggio, Calabria, Italy, where he was born on August 29, 1886, Father Zema came to this country with his parents in 1898. In 1912, he entered the Society of Jesus at Roehampton, England. After studies in various houses of the Society he was ordained in 1923. He taught at Loyola College, Montreal, College of the Holy Cross, and Fordham University. The years 1936-1939 were spent in study and research in Europe. In 1939 he received his doctorate from Cambridge University. His dissertation, "The Economic Aspects of the Gregorian Reform," has been partly published in articles; it is reliably reported that the remainder will now be prepared for publication. Father Zema was working on a translation of St. Augustine's *De Civitate Dei* when he died.

A man of sterling integrity of character and a scholar of the highest ideals, Father Zema will be greatly missed by a host of friends and associates. He was a member of the American Catholic Historical Association



and had been elected to a three-year term on its Executive Council at Cleveland on December 27, 1947. He was a Fellow of the Royal Historical Society.

On January 27, 1948, the Redemptorists of Belgium celebrated the centenary of the death of one of their greatest American missionaries, Mathias de Poislevache. He was born November 27, 1812, in Eben-Emael in the Diocese of Liège. After highly successful studies at the seminary of Rolduc he entered the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer, in which he made his profession in 1835 and received sacerdotal ordination in 1842. For ten years several Redemptorists, who had come from Austria to the United States, consecrated themselves to the numerous colonists coming from Europe but they had to fight against enormous difficulties and extreme misery which made their apostleship hazardous. An appeal was made to the Redemptorists of the Belgian province, and young Father de Poislevache was one of the first to enlist. He arrived in the United States on April 20, 1843, with Father Gillet, the future founder of the Congregation of the Sisters Servants of the Immaculate Heart of Mary of Detroit. After a mission, the coadjutor-administrator of Detroit, Bishop Lefèvre, himself a Belgian, besought the fathers to establish a residence in Monroe. Father de Poislevache was appointed there with Father Gillet. They had to face dreadful hardships. Nine mission stations depended on the parish of Monroe. There were hundreds of French people of Lower Canada in the region who for years had been deprived of priests and lived in ignorance of their religion. Their children were not baptized and their deaths often occurred without the sacraments. Father Gillet kept the ministry of the English-speaking colonists and Father de Poislevache busied himself with the Canadians. This ministry entailed remaining whole days in the confessional without drinking or eating and traveling miles through forests in order to administer the last sacraments. He obtained results which astonished the anti-Catholic press. He succeeded in making around 4000 Canadians abstainers who before had been slaves of alcoholism, one of the great plagues of the migrants at this epoch. Notwithstanding this ministry at Monroe, he traveled over the neighborhood, preaching missions everywhere. In the midst of his labors, he fell victim in an epidemic of spotted fever during which he had devoted himself without relaxation to his patients. At his funeral where most of the population was present, the bystanders spontaneously sang after the "Requiescat in pace": "Father François Mathias pray for us." A biography of Father de Poislevache was published in 1890 by Monsignor Charles Currier, Bishop of Matanzas, Cuba.



*Documents:*

Un *Auto da fé* à Chieri en 1412. M. Esposito (*Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, Vol. XLII, No. 3-4).—"The Moderne Forme of the Parliaments of England". Catherine Strateman Sims (*Amer. Histor. Rev.*, Jan.).—Philadelphia and the Revolution. Trans. by Jules A. Baisnée and John J. Meng (*Records of the Amer. Cath. Histor. Soc. of Philadelphia*, Dec., 1947).

## BRIEF NOTICES

---

ALLEN, JAMES G. *Editorial Opinion in the Contemporary British Commonwealth and Empire*. [University of Colorado Studies, Series C, Vol. I, No. 4] (Boulder: University of Colorado, 1946. Pp. xxii, 297-605. Cloth \$2.00; paper \$1.00.)

Here is a valuable edition of source materials that performs a definite service for students of the British Commonwealth of Nations. Because Great Britain is constantly at work on her problem of imperial order, it is essential to know just how the various commonwealths react to issues effecting the framework of the empire. Thus, this study is devised to meet that necessity.

Constant imperial changes and modifications, constitutional and political, social and economic, are reflected in various commonwealth editorial opinions. Limiting himself to five significant contemporary issues, the author indicates these dominion and colonial reactions. The carefully selected issues are: the Smuts-Halifax Proposals, the Imperial Council of 1943, the Prime Ministers' Conference of 1944, the Canberra Conference and the Australia-New Zealand Agreement of 1944, and, lastly, the New Jamaica Constitution. Thus the work is a source book of editorial opinion on principal developments within the empire from 1943 to 1945. All the editorials are reprinted in full and they represent only local opinion relative to the selected issues. The range of opinion and geographical location are excellent.

What are some of the findings and tendencies unearthed by the study?

There is an almost universal appreciation of the Commonwealth and Empire as a modern political organization and of the plan which each occupies in the international affairs. Most editors realize the advantages, but recognize the limitations and responsibilities. There is no unreasoning sentimentalism; the Commonwealth and Empire are regarded simply as practical aids.

It is important to note that this practical approach has resulted in a healthy, critical attitude towards all problems of empire concern. Mr. Allen notes that the more mature members are the more critical; that opinions range from the highly critical to the highly imperial view; that there is a genuine interest in problems peculiarly English; that an almost universally liberal, editorial attitude marks the approach to empire social and economic questions; that the interest in regional affairs, within the framework of both empire and world organization, is very evident.

The selections also display the "underlying spirit of unity" made so imperative by the recent global conflict and which so strongly resembles a similar unity after World War I. Will unity suffer the same fate in the 1940's as in the 1920's? Possibly, and yet the manifest concern in empire problems and the highly critical attitude show the empire's evolution to a new stage where, not a junior, but a full partnership is the only basis of concerted imperial action. (JOHN J. FOLEY)

ARAND, LOUIS A., S.S. Translator and Annotator. *St. Augustine: Faith, Hope, and Charity*. [Ancient Christian Writers. The Works of the Fathers in Translation. No. 3.] (Westminster: Newman Bookshop. 1947. Pp. 165. \$2.50.)

*St. Augustine. Faith, Hope and Charity* is a translation of a work popularly known as *Enchiridion*. The longer title is retained because this is how St. Augustine usually referred to it. Besides being much more attractive, concrete, and tangible, this title gives a better indication of the contents of the book. Asked by Laurentius for a compendium of Catholic teaching, Augustine proceeded to do so by commenting on faith, hope, and charity against the background of the Creed and the Our Father. The result is that Augustine, in a general way, runs the gamut of Christian doctrine from creation to the rewards of heaven or the punishments of hell, from the life of the Christian *in via* to his life *in patria*. Not only is the work a panorama of Catholic theology, it is likewise a digest of Augustinism. Written in the last decade of his life, Augustine introduces into the work the many theological controversies in which he was involved, the settlement of which made him such a shining light of wisdom.

Dr. Arand deserves congratulations for a work well done from the informative introduction to the thorough index. The translation is clear, concise, and easy flowing. At the same time it retains the freshness and flavor of the original. The translator has the knack of making Augustine's long involved sentences easily readable. In the introduction (p. 9), where texts and translations of the work are indicated, attention should have been called, because of the importance of the notes, to the edition of J. Faure published at Rome in 1775, and republished by C. Passaglia at Naples in 1847. In justice to the translator it must be mentioned that he uses this edition in his notes. Despite the generous notes, this reviewer would like to have seen further discussion, both textually and theologically, of the thorny passage "*si vellet [vellent]*" of ch. 24, par. 95, pp. 89, 139f.

The notes, which clearly betoken the trained theologian, are also very helpful for cultural and historical problems. In the opinion of this reviewer it is the notes which help to make of these books works of lasting value. Written by men trained in scholarship and filled with the same faith that animated the writers of the originals, the notes give a reliable commentary on these treasures from the ancient Church and, at the same time, they furnish a sure guide to Christian antiquity. It is partly owing to the notes that the series, Ancient Christian Writers, has received such enthusiastic acclaim, both nationally and internationally. (ALFRED C. RUSH)

BOISARD, CHANGINE P. *Le Cardinal Verdier, Archevêque de Paris*. (Paris: Flammarion, Editeur, 1946. Pp. 358. 150 frs.)

Jean-Pierre Cardinal Verdier departed this life over seven years ago. To produce a definitive life of the archbishop so soon after his death is obviously something not to be looked for. When, therefore, Father Boisard undertook to write this book, which is one in the collection "Notre Clergé," he was laboring under no illusions about the character of his work. Nor did he permit his

readers to build up any false hopes or entertain misconceptions concerning his ultimate purpose. In the first sentence of his introduction he tells us that it is much too soon to aim at saying the last word about an archbishop who has so recently played one of the most important roles in the history of the Church and the nation of France of his times. Moreover, he frankly confesses that, due to the strained relations among nations, he did not have free access to various archives, without which, of course, a history in the best sense of the word of the late Cardinal of Paris is entirely inconceivable.

While, therefore, Father Boisard's aims were necessarily limited in scope and modest in reach, they are nevertheless entirely valid. Over a long period of intimate association, during which he had altogether exceptional opportunities to observe Father Verdier closely, a picture of the man, the priest, the Superior General of the Society of St. Sulpice, and of the Cardinal Archbishop of Paris became an intensely living reality in the mind of Father Boisard. It is this picture which, he knew, could never be made to live again by merely piecing together the fragmentary records stored away in the world's archives, that he sought to preserve for future historians. It is the picture of one who, he sincerely believed, will one day be ranked among the truly great in the annals of the French Church. (LOUIS A. ARAND)

BUTTS R. FREEMAN. *A Cultural History of Education: Reassessing Our Educational Traditions*. (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., Inc. 1947. Pp. ix, 726. \$4.00.)

Recent months have seen the publication of several textbooks in the history of education of which this is one. Its emphasis is noted in the title. Of these various volumes the present one supplies by far the greatest amount of information related to the social setting of education in the periods and countries surveyed. It is concerned with Western education and covers the whole chronology from ancient times to the immediate present. There are selected references for each chapter but no other teaching aids. There is a definite sequence of parts in each chapter including the institutions of the period, the dominant ideas, the organization and control of education, and educational aims, curriculum, and methods.

This is a substantial textbook, formally organized and clearly written. The student who follows it will amass a considerable body of knowledge of the historical development of education and of the cognate social sciences. One may be permitted to doubt the value of much of the encyclopaedic array of names and events in the fields related to education. A more thoroughgoing functional synthesis may be anticipated. There is always the possibility of disagreement over generalizations and interpretations made in a work of such proportions as this, and the reviewer would question a number of those made by this author. But the most serious weakness of the book would seem to lie in the author's habit of evaluating historical theories and practices of education in the light of his own day and its scale of values. (BERNARD J. KOHLBRENNER)

DITZION, SYDNEY. *Arsenals of a Democratic Culture: A Social History of the American Public Library Movement in New England and the Middle States, 1850-1900*. (Chicago: American Library Association. 1947. Pp. x, 263. \$5.00.)

A growing importance has been attached in recent years to the history of professions. Doctors, lawyers, engineers, and other professional men have devoted more and more time to the study of their predecessors and their accomplishments, finding therein a deeper appreciation of their work, a keener professional insight, and an inspiration and incentive to add to the stream of accumulated experience and knowledge. Dr. Ditzion's comprehensive and scholarly study of the foundations and the building of our great public library movement is one of the more significant contributions toward a needed literature in the historical field of American librarianship. Much more than a mere description of great book collections, a listing of important librarians and library patrons, and a mere recounting of progress in library technology, services, organization, and administration, the author looks deeper into the concept of a free library and sees it as the result of a complex of social ideas, conditions, and forces. He reveals the important role played in American social history by the tax-supported municipal library from the time of its real foundation to a date when its permanent place in the national life was assured. The regional limitation of the study allowed for more intensive examination of much hitherto unused source material, and gives a more detailed picture of what was borrowed for similar library movements in other parts of the country.

Dr. Ditzion traces in this work the cultural heritage that paved the way for the stormy transition from the "social" library to the free public library. He takes account of and attempts to evaluate the factors of politics, pressure groups, religious intolerance, nativism, and the various philosophies that characterized nineteenth-century America as they variously affected the movement, and he quite correctly highlights as major influences, the democratic, humanitarian, and philanthropic ideals, and the growing conviction of the library's function as the educator of the people, as a source of instruction, inspiration, and recreation for men of all ages and from all walks of life. Proper notice is given to the leaders in education, in librarianship, in publishing, and in philanthropy who were the pioneers responsible for the conception, the early organization, and the financing of the book collections and the services to meet readers' needs which we now take pretty much for granted.

*Arsenals of a Democratic Culture* will appeal to students of American civilization as well as to professional librarians. The excellent documentation, comprehensive bibliography, and full index enhance its value. (JAMES J. KORTENDICK)

DUMOND, DWIGHT LOWELL, *America in Our Time, 1896-1946*. (New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1947. Pp. xi, 715. \$3.50.)

This excellent text, covering the specified half-century, is designed by the author to supply the need of young people for what cannot be derived from their own personal experience, i.e., a knowledge of "World War I, the rampaging twenties, or the Great Depression," as a prerequisite for intelligent citizenship.

*America in Our Time* is a revision of Dr. Dumond's publication of 1937, *Roosevelt to Roosevelt*. This earlier work has been "completely reorganized, the history of the last decade has been added, and greater emphasis has been placed upon the role of the United States in world affairs." The professed aims of the author are achieved in large part in his presentation of recent and contemporary movements in American history. The segmentation involved by separating these fifty years from their predecessors is capably handled by the author in his introductory chapters, in which the continuity of the historical movements of the twentieth century is briefly, but definitely, set forth, both relationships and contrasts being adequately established.

In his preface, the author writes that he "has not shirked his responsibility to interpret as well as record, knowing full well that it is difficult to interpret correctly the events of one's own generation." Much of the necessary interpretation covers controversial matter; the significance of so many of the factors and movements of recent American history is still obscure; the causal relationship of the recent past and of contemporary events to the future is still undetermined; particular interpretations are conditioned by the attitudes and viewpoints of those who interpret. Because of these qualifications, much that is interpretative in *America in Our Time* will be challenged, will be modified, or will be denied. Nevertheless, it has value insofar as it is provocative of discussion and stimulating to thought. In this characteristic, there is found another advantage as a college text, especially since Dr. Dumond is never arbitrary in the imposition of his judgments.

On ethical considerations, it is regrettable that the author approves the dissemination of birth control propaganda as a laudable aspect of reform, as he apparently does (pp. 191-193), or that he would seemingly justify the prohibition movement because of evils connected with the saloon and liquor interests (p. 193). Interesting to Catholic readers will be Dr. Dumond's high estimate of the economic and social philosophy of Monsignor John A. Ryan of the Catholic University of America. (ALFRED G. STRITCH)

DU NOÛY, LECOMTE. *Human Destiny*. (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1947. Pp. xix, 289. \$3.50.)

The author of this work was an internationally known French scientist. Before his death, which occurred last autumn, he embraced the Catholic faith. That gift was a fitting reward for the good intentions which are everywhere apparent in this last product of his pen. He wrote to oppose "the paralyzing scepticism and destructive materialism which are by no means the inevitable consequences of the scientific interpretation of nature as we have been led to believe. Atheism cannot be destroyed by using the sentimental and traditional arguments of the past. Science was used to sap the base of religion. Science must be used to consolidate it." To accomplish this purpose he analyzes the nature of scientific thinking in a prefatory section to his two chief themes: the evolution of life and the evolution of man.

Using the materialist's own great law of chance, du Noüy demonstrates the scientific impossibility of the evolution of life by chance alone and hence the



necessity of the opposite hypothesis of finalism to explain the progressive, ascensional development of life forms. Much more insistent is the admission of finalism, or intelligent conception of end directing evolution when we come to the evolution of man with his free will, his moral and spiritual values. So far so good. It is at this point that the inadequacy of the scientific method exclusively breaks down. His science, by its very nature, is unable to establish the existence of an infinite personal Intelligence who conceives and directs the whole evolution of the universe which He has created. Du Noüy considers God simply as another name for anti-chance. "Moreover belief in God, today as in the time of St. Paul and St. James, consists in very little. A beautiful definition was given by a great Christian writer, Miguel de Unamuno: 'To believe in God is to desire His existence, and what is more to act as though He existed, (p. 134). "It is not the image we create of God which proves God. It is the effort we make to create this image" (p. 135). God, in making man free, surrenders His omnipotence (p. 197).

It is no wonder then that the whole historical reality of the fall of man, the Incarnation and Redemption should be explained away along the outmoded lines of modernism. "The story of original sin can be interpreted as the symbol of the dawn of human conscience in a still primitive being" (p. 136). Jesus Christ is simply a man, even if a perfect one, who along with the prophets and martyrs performs a special role in human evolution. We can all cut down the time of the evolution by our personal contributions. Indeed, this is the one and only great purpose of individual existence. "Every man can, if he wishes, leave a more or less brilliant trace behind him which widens or prolongs the existing path and contributes to its fan-like expansion. This is the kind of immortality of which we are sure. True, individual immortality escapes rational conception, but is hardly questionable if we admit the reality of the wake" (p. 254) i.e., take out all rational traditional meaning from the term 'personal immortality.'

In a word this scientist of good intentions seeks to answer his materialist brethren's attack upon natural and revealed religion by depriving the latter of all their long accepted meaning and all their historical reality, and by putting a vague, subjective symbolism in their place. The root difficulty under which du Noüy labors is his attempt to make science and the scientific method yield that total view of reality which the sciences by their very nature and professed objective are incapable of giving. Not changing existence, but existence as such, apart from both the physical and the mathematical, in a word, the metaphysical approach proper to the intellect alone, considering its own proper object, can give that necessary integration of reality man needs to begin his judgment on human destiny. Thereafter the history of the human race as contained in the records of authentic divine revelation and in man's own records of his human acts must provide further understanding of man's goal. Du Noüy leaves out both ultimate philosophy and history although he readily admits the importance of the latter. "Universal history, which is the only truthful one, must be taught as science is taught, by putting aside all national vanity, by eliminating the sentimental element which has become dangerous and archaic in our time" (p. 221). In deciding what is human destiny du Noüy gives no evidence himself of the importance of actual historical facts.

Nothing we have said here is meant to belittle this honest and sincere scientist's lofty motives. But it is ridiculous to say that he has produced a new natural theology in terms of science, as one recent reviewer maintained. Du Noüy may have been attempting such a task but his work simply demonstrates the impossibility of achieving what in the respective natures of both natural theology and science cannot be attained. (CHARLES A. HART)

ELSENJOHN, SISTER ALFREDA, O.S.B. *Pioneer Days in Idaho County*. Volume I. (Caldwell: Caxton Printers, Ltd. 1947. Pp. xx, 527. \$7.50.)

Idaho County, the largest county in the panhandle of Idaho, has had its share of frontier glamor. Visited by Lewis and Clark, ravaged by Indian wars, swarmed over by prospectors, disturbed by the cattlemen—sheepherder feud, stimulated by the opening of new Indian territory, Idaho County is really a microcosm in which one can see the history of the far western frontier.

To write the history of Idaho County has been a labor of love for Sister Alfreda. Descendant of county pioneers, she has been for years librarian and curator of the museum at St. Gertrude's Convent, Cottonwood. To the work the author has brought a patient industry and unflagging zeal which enabled her to assemble so huge a pile of facts relating to one sparsely settled if extensive county. Volume I deals with the history of the towns and settlements within the county, Volume II, not yet published, will deal with the physical characteristics of the county.

This fat volume filled with facts from many sources is impressive evidence of the author's industry. Unfortunately, however, there has been too little selection. Colorful incidents, details of significance for the historian of the West are, indeed, present, but they have been swamped by a flood of petty facts about families and persons. This ocean of small details, however interesting to descendants and friends, leaves the ordinary reader dismayed and the scholar bored. Perhaps the book would have been more readable if the author had consigned to appendices those unimportant details which possess only the most local interest. The handling of source material could have been a little more critical. There is no evidence of an attempt at evaluation. Government documents, newspaper accounts, old-timers' reminiscences all provide equal grist for this mill.

*Pioneer Days in Idaho County*, however, is the result of devoted study. It should be welcomed by those who are especially interested in the far western frontier. The format is excellent. The book has what is very important in a work of this type—a good index. There is a map of Idaho County on the front and back covers. Numerous photographs help to enliven the text. (JOSEPH S. BRUSHER)

FARNUM, MABEL. *American Saint: The Life of Mother Cabrini*. (New York: Didier Co. 1947. Pp. x, 151. \$2.50.)

The prodigious accomplishments of St. Francesca, in Europe and the Americas, deserve to be known by our Catholic youth. In *American Saint* is contained the story of this extraordinary woman, told in a way that should

prove as entertaining as it is informative to young readers. Francesca's arrival in the United States in 1889 with six sisters, and her determination to remain despite many obstacles, was a significant factor in the saving of the faith of countless Italian immigrants crowded into the New York slums. A tireless administrator, she went from city to city establishing orphanages, schools, and hospitals for the poor, both here and in Latin America, Spain, France, and England. At the time of her death in Chicago in 1917, a community of nearly 4000 sisters knew her as superior. She was mourned by men of all nationalities and creeds, but most of all by the many Italo-Americans to whose welfare she had devoted her life.

The book is limited in scope to Francesca's more important work, and Miss Farnum has taken the pardonable liberty of inventing dialogue, always helpful in a book for the young. She has consulted the primary sources and the biographies by Borden and Maynard; the resulting work is fundamentally accurate. The volume is illustrated by a series of twelve sketches by LaVerne Riess. In providing young readers with this biography of the first American citizen to be venerated as a saint, Miss Farnum has fulfilled a definite need. (ROBERT E. CARSON)

FERRETTO, GIUSEPPE. *Note storico-bibliografiche di archaeologia cristiana*. (Città del Vaticano: Tipographia Poliglotta Vaticana. 1942. Pp. xi, 484.)

The present volume containing a history and bibliography of Christian archaeology developed out of the lectures which the author gave at the Lateran Ateneo in Rome. The first part (chapters 1-3) is of an introductory character dealing with the concept of archaeology in general and of Christian archaeology in particular. The second part (chapters 4-20) treats the itineraries and the early descriptions of the catacombs and ancient Christian basilicas, the rediscovery of the catacombs in the Middle Ages, and the progress made in the field of Christian archaeology. The volume is profusely illustrated and a detailed index is added. (JOHANNES QUASTEN)

FINN, WILLIAM J. *Sharps and Flats in Five Decades*. (New York and London: Harper and Bros. 1947. Pp. x, 342. \$3.75.)

For some decades American music lovers have known and appreciated the work of Father Finn, whose superlative Paulist Choristers have set high standards in the performance of Catholic Church music. In addition to his purely musical activities, he has written ably on the technical aspects of choral music and more recently has taught extensively. Now he has summed up the experiences of a distinguished career, analyzing the story of his life and art in a brisk and unaffected way.

The result, a readable autobiography, is a good cut above many current books by musicians, largely because of its lack of pretense. The personal narrative inevitably becomes a chronicle of the development of the Paulist Choristers and anecdotes of their concert tours. The first American Catholic musical organization to gain international repute, the choristers had a modest beginning in

Chicago in 1904, when Father Finn's assets consisted of two boy sopranos, great determination, and solid musicianship. The group grew in size and artistry until their parish church had to release them for annual professional concert tours. They sang abroad, amazing the European experts; and the success of their performance in Rome caused much unpleasant comment by professional colleagues. Almost always they sang superbly, but the United States was not big enough to endow them on a permanent basis, like similar European institutions.

Father Finn's literary style is somewhat arch for complete comfort, and his persistent metaphor of the "Ground Bass" does not come off quite successfully. These are comparatively minor flaws in a book which sketches admirably, often in hilarious detail, the Catholic life and mores of a half century ago. Historians may be irked to find the author drawing the veil of charity over certain names and incidents, but musicians will be edified by the difficult enterprises that the choristers accomplished successfully. As a contribution to American Catholic history Father Finn's book is largely of incidental value. As an expression of his attitude towards the musical demands of the liturgy, it should be required reading for some of our neo-Puritans who would willingly rest content with the mere letter of the papal legislation on music. (JAMES J. WALSH)

FOOTMAN, DAVID. *Ferdinand Lassalle: Romantic Revolutionary*. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1947. Pp. xx, 251. \$3.50.)

Ferdinand Lassalle was the founder of the German labor movement of the 1860's, but this book is only incidentally concerned with the labor movement; it is almost entirely taken up with the man himself: the sensitive, self-centered, intelligent Jew who resented his middle class upbringing as a merchant's son, and much more his social position as a Jew. These accidents, he believed, were liabilities to be overcome. To do so he set out to lead the proletariat of Germany to a classless society, where a benevolent autocracy of intellectuals like himself—but not too many of them—would order the peoples' welfare to the greater glory of Lassalle.

The author has constructed his work well. He drew from first-rate sources and had the good sense to select what was just enough to reveal Lassalle inside out and the good taste never to forget that the fantastic, futile, and not too honorable Lassalle was in the minor virtues consistently heroic. Lassalle kept a diary. He began looking at himself critically in his fifteenth year and to the day of his death he found little fault with what he saw. Moreover, he kept copies of his love letters and his most casual correspondence, so he left himself wide open. It is to the great credit of David Footman's catholic understanding of life, love, and the pursuit of fame, that he does not define Lassalle by tags, Marxian or Freudian. These labels would be apt on Lassalle and inaccurate, as they are often in contemporary biographies.

Ferdinand Lassalle's life is interesting for itself but more so as an example of the genesis of the modern revolutionary: the man sick of himself and sorry for himself, who, out of his frustration, evolves a plan of release and calls his plan the principles of freedom. This very German and modern sickness, Lassalle sought to cure by the therapy of Hegel. Hegel, fermented in the spirit

of the French revolutions, gave Lassalle a way of thinking and the need of the Countess Hatzfeldt for a knight errant supplied the cause. The proletariat he carried like a Christopher.

What Lassalle might have done with the proletariat had he out-guessed Bismarck, God alone knows. When at the end he fell, mortally wounded in a ridiculous duel, the German labor movement did not fall under him, it toppled from his shoulders forward, and by his death, was freed, for a time at least, from the romantic myth that had become Lassalle. (JOHN P. MONAGHAN)

GANNETT, HENRY. *American Names: A Guide to the Origin of Place Names in the United States*. (Washington, D. C.: Public Affairs Press. 1947. Pp. 334. \$3.75.)

Henry Gannett, former geographer of the United States Geographical Survey, has compiled a handy volume giving briefly the meaning and origin of the names of most of the cities, towns, counties, and rivers in the United States. He prefaces his volume with a formidable array of authorities, whom he lists as sources for his statements, though seldom citing a particular author. The authorities, incidentally, are divided into an Indian section, and then into sections dealing with the individual states.

Aside from a few rather important place names, the information is contained in a line or two that translates the name, or mentions the historical personage after whom the spot was named. In those cases where there are differing opinions concerning the origin of a name, the variant theories are given. The translation of all names of Indian origin has been verified and corrected by officials of the Bureau of American Ethnology. The entire work is arranged in dictionary fashion for easy reference, and contains a very comprehensive collection of American names.

Nonetheless, it was the first reaction of this reviewer that the book is intended for the librarian rather than the historian. Although it does offer a quick reference in place-name origins, the volume achieves little more than this. In most instances, as we have noted, nothing more than a translation or historical connection is offered. The reasons for the selection of the particular name are seldom appended, nor, as a rule, are any facts given as to the individual whose name was thus chosen. Under "Newcastle," e.g., the author states:

Newcastle; county in Delaware, and twenty cities and towns in the United States, generally so called from the town in England, or for the Duke of Newcastle (p. 223).

Again, under "Lowell," we find only the generic statement:

Lowell; plantation in Franklin County, Maine, city in Middlesex County, Massachusetts, village in Kent County, Michigan, and town in Gaston County, North Carolina, named for Francis Cabot Lowell, of Boston.

This grouping of various place names with but a general explanation is disappointing to the student who expects the book to furnish him with concrete information. Nor can such generic treatment be accurate. In regard to Lowell, Michigan, e.g., Chapman's *History of Kent County, Michigan* (Chicago, 1881), states:



. . . the first plat of the village was made in 1847 for Capt. Daniel Marsac, who named the place "Dansville". . . In 1854 the name was changed to Lowell, in view of its manufacturing facilities. . . thus the beginning of the "Lowell of the West" was made (p. 1198).

Had Mr. Gannett offered concrete information of this type, his volume, though inevitably bulkier, would have been of far greater interest and value. (JAMES P. MORAN)

GLIMM, FRANCIS X., JOSEPH M. F. MARIQUE, S.J., and GERALD G. WALSH, S.J. (Translators), *The Apostolic Fathers*. (New York: Cima Publishing Co., 1947. Pp. xii, 401. \$4.00.)

Since 1945, when Dr. Ludwig Schopp first announced his ambitious plan to publish in seventy-two volumes a new English translation of the writings of the Fathers of the Church, the curious (and perhaps slightly sceptical) literati have anxiously awaited the appearance of the first volume. This new series, definitely intended as a monument of North American Catholic scholarship, would at last furnish students and scholars with a Catholic English translation of the Fathers. The last English translation of some selected writings of the Fathers, edited by Anglican scholars, was, although somewhat biased, an excellent work. However, that was sixty years ago, and although the work was reprinted, it is entirely out of print at present. Besides, many patristic texts have been discovered since then. Hence this new, modern, and Catholic translation will be very welcome.

The first volume of the series, augurs well for the rest of the series. In this work, the three erudite collaborators, Francis X. Glimm, Joseph M. F. Marique, S.J., and Gerald G. Walsh, S.J., have produced a distinctly modern translation of the eight Greek documents known as the writings of the *Apostolic Fathers*. Father Glimm has given us a fine English version of *St. Clement's Letter to the Corinthians* and *St. Polycarp's Epistle to the Philippians*, of the *Didache* (or Teaching of the Twelve Apostles) and the second-century letter falsely attributed to *St. Barnabas*, the co-worker of St. Paul. Father Marique's translation of *Hermas'* lengthy, but beautiful and instructive work called *The Shepherd*, and of the fragmentary writings of the ancient *Papias*, is equally commendable. Father Walsh's translation of the seven *Ignatian Letters* is what we would expect of that fine scholar. Especially excellent is his English rendering of the *Letter to Diognetus*, a precious gem of early Christian literature.

In scholarly introductions to each work the translators give evidence of familiarity with the latest findings in patristic literature. These introductions are so brief and to the point that they in no way overshadow the text itself, and they end with a select bibliography which could prove a useful guide for further study. Felicitous has been the decision of the editors to place all footnotes at the bottom of each page rather than at the end of the volume. Furthermore, it is so well indexed that a preacher in search of material may very easily make use of the veritable treasure of wisdom and doctrine contained in these early writings.

The importance of this new series which *The Apostolic Fathers* inaugurates can hardly be overstressed. It can very easily occasion a general revival of interest in those early champions of Christian faith. And a revived interest in their writings could, in turn, lead to renewed concern about Christian philosophy and theology—



so sorely needed as an antidote to the anti-Christian spirit which imperils mankind today. (THOMAS B. FALLS)

GOODRICH, LELAND M., and MARIE J. CARROLL. (Eds.). *Documents on American Foreign Relations*. Vol. VII. July 1944-June 1945. (Princeton: Published for the World Peace Foundation by Princeton University Press. 1947. Pp. xxxvii, 961. \$6.00.)

The momentous events of the period covered by this volume proved to be more than could be adequately presented without making a book within a book. An earlier publication of the World Peace Foundation, *Charter of the United Nations, Commentary and Documents*, edited by Leland M. Goodrich and Edward Harnbro (Boston, 1946), cleared away the greater part of the material on the United Nations Organization and is really the first part of the story detailed in documents here. It remained for the editors to present the elaborate monuments of the final period of lend-lease, the surrender notices, and the beginnings of reconstruction.

There can be no doubt of the value of this series, which keeps the record in order pending the decade or more it takes the Department of State to release its own official documents. It is a salutary contribution to perspective to have within covers the material which has been developing so rapidly in the *Bulletin* of the Department of State and the *New York Times*. However, since much of all this was, to begin with, no more than a facade, and more of it became a shabby backdrop for unpleasant disputes about the meaning of "democracy" and "fascism," it will be a relief when the next volume disposes of the Potsdam Conference and the reader has before him the more concrete manifestations of world events as they have developed ominously in the past two years. In war time the people seem to reign but not to govern; and they cannot even insist upon the last prerogative of full information. Every published item here is no more than a starting point, and such points do not in themselves constitute adequate information about what is going on. For example, it is no more than a beginning of the strange story of displaced persons in the postwar world to read of the UNNRA Council resolutions of September, 1944 (pp. 370 ff.) which in complex verbiage set forth the procedure for treating the "stateless" in "groups" and "subject to such control as the military command or the established control authority may find necessary." Perhaps more than a starting point is revealed in the declarations of Stalin and in the treaties between the USSR and the countries of eastern Europe, but there is no mystery any longer about Soviet Russia's foreign policy. As for our own declarations, little more is implied than a determination to prepare, as it were, for the last war—a state of mind which used to be attributed to soldiers, not diplomats. (JOHN T. FARRELL)

GRAYZEL, SOLOMON. *A History of the Jews: From the Babylonian Exile to the End of World War II*. (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America. 1947. Pp. xxv, 835. \$3.50.)

It is to be expected that the Jewish people, having suffered so much during the past decade and a half, should meditate on its origins and should interpret its past

in terms of the present. Solomon Grayzel's volume is the product of such dispositions. It is clear, orderly, up-to-date, and generally objective presentation of the facts of the Jewish past. It is not merely a political history. It gives proportionate treatment, especially when treating of the first six centuries of Judaism, to social, religious, and cultural developments. Abundant illustrations, maps, and a serviceable index add to the usefulness of the work. However, in an effort to be popular and simple, the style at times becomes jerky and artificial, but it does not make unpleasant reading. The reflections on strife and suffering, the occurrence of words like 'democracy,' show that the author is not unaffected by the events of recent years.

The treatment of Christ and Christianity, while respectful, is Jewish in its inspiration and rationalistic in its development. Christ was a Galilean Essene, put to death by the aristocratic Sadducees and by the Romans. The Pharisees are exculpated. The only and sufficient explanation for Christianity is Judaism of the first century.

The lack of such names in the bibliography as Lagrange, Bonsirven, and Schürer is due, I suppose, to the fact that it is confined to English titles. With the exception of the author's theological bias, this work can be recommended as an acceptable popular presentation of Jewish history. (ROBERT WILDE)

GWYNN, DENIS. *Lord Shrewsbury, Pugin and the Catholic Revival*. (London: Hollis and Carter. 1946. Pp. xxxviii, 156. 10S.6d. \$2.75.)

This work is a supplement to an earlier volume by the same author. Published in 1942, the previous work appeared under the title *The Second Spring, 1818-1852*. Both works deal with the same phenomenon and largely within the margin of the same years. The author, however, uses a different scope in each. In the first work he was concerned with the activities of the bishops and their problems of church organization. In this later volume he gives us a detailed study of the activities of the three most prominent Catholic laymen in that period of intense Catholic rehabilitation.

The first of these men was of the family of Talbot and the sixteenth Earl of Shrewsbury and of Waterford. This Lord Shrewsbury, known widely as the "good Earl John," was of one of the oldest Catholic families of England and of one almost singular in its loyalty to the Church, there having been but one notable instance of apostasy among its members in its 500 years' tradition. The other two men of this study were both converts to Catholicism from the Church of England—Augustus Welby Pugin and Ambrose Phillipps. Pugin was a noted architect and Phillipps was a descendant of the landed gentry whose uncle was the Bishop of Gloucester.

The consuming interest of these three activists was the reform of church architecture and liturgy and the building of additional places of Catholic worship. This common interest united them so closely that, in the words of the author in his preface, "none of them can be thought of apart from the others." Such being the case, as is so strikingly illustrated in the narrative, one wonders that the name Phillipps was not included in the title of this book along with the other two gentlemen.

The author studies closely the interactions of these men on each other. He evaluates the benefactions of Lord Shrewsbury and sees them not nearly so great as has been commonly alleged, though their value was greatly enhanced by the fact that the "good Earl John" spent long stretches of time in Italy in order to save for church building. His admittedly great personal influence was effected rather through his patronage and example than his wealth. Thus he exercised influence in particular on Pugin and Phillipps just as they did on him by their initiative, enthusiasm, courage, and zeal. And so we have a glorious record of lay action responsible for so much in the Catholic revival in nineteenth-century England—a record edifying as it is interesting.

Besides the preface by the author previously alluded to, there is an introduction by Father S. J. Gosling, the parish priest of Alton in Staffordshire. This introduction supplies us with interesting notes on Lord Shrewsbury and the environment of Alton Towers from which so much Catholic activity radiated in the years with which this book is concerned. (JOSEPH P. BRADLEY)

HERZOG, WILHELM. *Dreyfus to Pétain*. (New York: Creative Age Press. 1947. Pp. viii, 313. \$3.50.)

"I am happy to have this great and definitive work in my library," wrote Roger Martin Du Gard, the talented and noble-minded author of *The Thibaults*. Alas for these enthusiasms which the blurb-writers seize on like leeches and perpetrate on book-jackets! Mr. Herzog's *Dreyfus to Pétain* is far from great, and it is, most certainly, not definitive. With the brilliant assistance of his translator, he has served up one of the most astonishing *pots-pourris* of all but contemporary French history, extending to the nature and position of French writers, and even to nomenclature.

Thus the once famous Jesuit Du Lac is always mentioned as "Pater" Du Lac, indicating that Mr. Herzog, or the translator, is unaware that *pater* means "Father" or "Père," and that no one in his right mind would dream of addressing or referring to a Catholic priest in the Latin tongue. Adherents to the conciliatory policy of Leo XIII toward the Third Republic are called the "re-allied" which is not even English. Oblates are known as "Oblades." The Rothschild residence at Paris is termed a "palais," while the Jesuit house of studies there is called (only heaven and Mr. Herzog know why) a "palace." Maurice Barrès who, so far as we know, never wrote a line of verse in his life, is continually mentioned as a "poet."

More serious than these little *gaffes*, which are merely the fruits of invincible ignorance, are certain misstatements of fact which are the result of a certain purblind Teutonism, doubled, we fear, by a kind of Israelite spite against the Catholic cult. What does M. Du Gard, who is intelligent enough to know better, mean by calling "a great and definitive work" one which reduces the human comedy and tragedy of the Dreyfus Affair to "a competition between the high Jesuit clergy" (whoever they were) "and the wealthy Jews?" We suggest "*Loyola versus* Rothschild" as a promising title for Mr. Herzog's next great and definitive study of *fin-de-siècle* France.

The fact is that Dreyfusard writers from Zola to Mr. Herzog have approached the Dreyfus problem from a diametrically different direction, but in the identical

spirit as their enemies of the royalist and clerical right like Léon Daudet. That is, they have a *prima facie* assumption of the captain's complete innocent, just as their enemies have the same assumption of his guilt. Yet Esterhazy, that "grim and ominous bird of yore," who is considered the real culprit by the Dreyfusards, were he capable of betraying his country for a price, was equally capable of confessing his "guilt" for another price, since he was capable of doing anything for a price. It is possible that both he and Dreyfus were in the same game of French counter-espionage, as *agents provocateurs*, the difference being that Esterhazy was the pet of the general staff (for whom we hold no brief whatever), whereas Dreyfus was its fall guy. The general staff appears to have had no proof against him, but, as Anatole France satirically remarked, "proofs must be acquired; Justice demands them."

"My case is very complicated," sighed the victim on his way to Rennes. It is, indeed; and there have been only three relatively trustworthy accounts of the affair which plunged France into practical civil war. The first is by Jacques Bainville in his *Histoire de la Troisième République*; the second that of Anatole France in his *Isle des Pingouins*; the third that of Peter Finley Dunne in his *Conversations with Mr. Dooley*. . . .

"I suppose (said Mr. Dooley) "they'll give the Cap a new thrille now."

"I hope not," said Mr. Hennessy. "I don't know anything about it, but I think he's guilty. He's a Jew."

"Well," said Mr. Dooley, "y'er remarks are interthresting, but not conclusive."

Mr. Herzog's book is not very conclusive either. (CUTHBERT WRIGHT)

HOUSE, BOYCE. *Cub Reporter: Being Mainly about Mr. Mooney and the Commercial Appeal*. (Dallas: Hightower Press. 1947. Pp. 175. \$2.50.)

This little volume recounts in easy, conversational vein the thrilling experiences of editors and office boys, of policeman and of criminals who in bewildering fashion fill the pages of the narrative. The author proposes to paint a picture of "life as it used to be" for a reporter. He vividly portrays the days when men who were "not trained for any particular calling" turned to newspaper work. After he was graduated with highest honors from Memphis Central High School, he secured, partly by chance and mostly through the kindly influence of Judge A. B. Pittman, a position on the staff of the Memphis *Commercial Appeal*, at that time a highly respected newspaper, whose editor, Mr. Mooney, was held in great esteem for his sound judgment and his spirit of honest and patriotic, if not always objective, interpretation of news. Those interested in "wild western life" will enjoy *Cub Reporter* with its pathos, humor (not always gentle), and stark tragedy. Innumerable characters flash upon the scene in kalaeidoscopic profusion, some in faint outline, others in silhouette, while a few, like the eccentric but kindly managing editor, Mooney, and Frank, the office boy who worked so desperately to increase his stature that he might enter the service of his country, are indelibly impressed on the reader.

The author makes no pretense at organization of material. He records the incidents just as they happen, with a generous interspersion of irrelevant matter which merely confuses the reader. This reviewer feels that the book could be

greatly improved by eliminating all extraneous incidents and many of the minor characters together with some, if not all, the stories of past experiences—real or otherwise—recalled by his colleagues. The subtitle, too, is somewhat misleading. Except for occasional incidental references, Mooney's name is not mentioned until near the end. Then in a short chapter the author expresses his esteem and admiration for him whose "views were as highly regarded as the utterances of the Delphic oracle in ancient Greece."

However, *Cub Reporter* is more than just another narrative of wild western adventure in a town which had the unenviable distinction of having "more crime news, population considered, than any other city in the nation." The author has fulfilled his purpose "to picture an epoch, now gone forever." He has done more. In the opinion of the reviewer, he has made a real contribution to the history of journalism. The future historian of the development of the modern newspaper will find in *Cub Reporter* important source material for his work. (SISTER MARY STANISLAUS CONNAUGHTON)

HYDE, WALTER WOODBURN. *Paganism to Christianity in the Roman Empire*. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1946. Pp. 296. \$4.00.)

It is the story of the transformation of Christianity into a secularized institution during its struggle with the pagan order of the Roman Empire which the author wishes to outline in the present volume. After a chapter on Roman religion, including the later imperial cult, one on the eastern mystery cults which influenced the old national religion, and another on Christianity's parent religion, Judaism, the succeeding chapters give an account of Jesus, both His person and His teaching, and follow the development of the Church to the time of Theodosius the Great under whom it triumphed over all its pagan rivals. The author assures us that he has attempted to treat this large subject "in the spirit of critical historical scholarship of our time, which investigates the beginnings of Christianity as fearlessly as it would those of Mithraism or any other religion once powerful in antiquity" (p. 7). It seems to this reviewer that Mr. Hyde has failed in this attempt. To mention only a few cases, according to the author's view the Pope claims infallibility "even, it might be, in matters of history" (p. 236). Modernism was "the last intellectual movement" in the Church (*ibid.*). "The chief appeal of the Reformation was intellectual in character; but the Church of Rome still appeals to the emotions" (p. 236). "The papacy has stopped the spirit of progress within the Church and forbidden its priests to express their ideas" (p. 237). There are many more passages which indicate that the author is not free from bias. Beyond this there is nothing new in the volume. On the contrary, the three excursions at the end, dealing with the origin of Christmas, Sunday observance, and the question "Was St. Peter in Rome?" indicate that Mr. Hyde is not familiar with the results of modern research. Only thus can it be explained that in dealing with the question of Peter's sojourn at Rome he does not even mention the important book of the Protestant scholar H. Lietzmann, *Petrus und Paulus in Rom*. (2nd ed., Berlin, 1927), not to speak about the publications of modern Catholic authors. (JOHANNES QUASTEN)



JACOBS, JAMES RIPLEY. *The Beginning of the U. S. Army, 1783-1812*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1947. Pp. ix, 419. \$5.00.)

Because American historians have long neglected military history the United States Army has not received proper historical treatment. Major Jacob's volume is the first in a projected series in which he intends to provide a detailed and thorough record of the army to the outbreak of the Mexican War. His understanding of military affairs and his sympathy for his subject will unquestionably make the subsequent volume as valuable as the first one. The scope of his work is not as great as the title seems to indicate. It is primarily a history of the *regular army*, and while the role and fortunes of the militia are occasionally acknowledged, first place in the narrative is given to the regulars. And the army is dealt with mainly in the garrisons and the field, for the large domain of military policy is touched only briefly, and the political aspects of the size and structure of the armed forces are by and large ignored.

Almost half of the book is taken up by an account, and a good one, of the campaigns in the Northwest which culminated in Wayne's great victory of Fallen Timbers. By giving considerable attention to military life and antiquities the author succeeds in developing a realistic picture of service conditions, training, and campaigning. General Wilkinson, who succeeded Wayne in command of the army, is not spared for his dubious relations with the Spaniards, but the author seems to feel that his moral weakness was offset by technical accomplishments. Neither Jefferson nor his Secretary of War, Dearborn, excites the author's admiration, although from his regular army point of view the establishment of West Point allows a partial redemption of the President. In concluding chapters there is a brief account of the Battle of Tippecanoe and an excellent survey of the state of the army on the eve of 1812. It is to be hoped that the ensuing volumes achieve a fuller literary form and that more attention will be given the organization of material so painstakingly garnered from many sources. (WILLIAM O. SHANAHAN)

KANIA, WLADYSLAW. *Bolshevism and Religion*. Translated by R. M. Dowall, O.P. (New York: Polish Library. 1947. Pp. xvi, 96. \$1.75.)

This small book is a summary of some of the Soviet laws on religion, to which is added a documentary account of the harrowing experiences of those Polish citizens who were deported to Russia after the Berlin-Moscow pact of 1939. The title of the work, at least in its English translation, is misleading. The Soviet religious policy is outlined, but there are added accounts of Soviet court procedure, the treatment of Jews and their synagogues, and a very depressing picture of the life of the deported Poles. Some of the material is not new. In fact, Timasheff and others have covered the Soviet religious, or anti-religious, activity in more detail. But no one, to the writer's knowledge, has unfolded a more eloquent or more dispassionate statement of this subject. This book is a calm, factual indictment. The story of the advance of the Red Army through Poland and the consequent destruction of churches and maltreatment of clerics is plainly told. The courage of many Poles in protecting their pastors is properly noted. The Soviet practice of closing churches and synagogues by



heavily taxing them and the various attempts of conducting religious exercises in concentration camps is well explained. Under the Soviets the school system of the Poles was completely changed. The Russian language replaced Polish and the history of the party and communist ideology and literature replaced religion and Polish history. When one reads these pages and remembers the superbly heroic Polish stand against another tyranny in 1939, one can only say that Poland has not received full justice as yet from the United Nations. (BROTHER ALEXANDER JOSEPH)

KUHN, ANNE L. *The Mother's Role in Childhood Education: New England Concepts, 1830-1860*. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1947. Pp. x, 224. \$3.00.)

This work focuses attention on the role of the mother as an educator. It presents a picture of the New England Protestant mother of the middle and upper classes as the religious and moral guide of her children, the primary and principal mentor of their minds, the guardian of their immortal souls, and the gentle ruler of the home. The portrait drawn is detailed and comprehensive.

Perhaps the title should be changed to include the phrase "New England Protestant Concepts." The research was limited presumably to the Sterling Library at Yale University. The sources used are invariably Protestant and nowhere do the ideas or ideals of Catholics enter even indirectly. The influence of religion in the Protestant home is rather fully elucidated with its attitudes on health, prosperity, thrift, alcohol, Bible reading, and death. The author seems to take more pains than necessary to point up the absurdities in which moralists and preachers indulged, particularly on the topics of hell, judgment, and death. Within this limitation, that the whole frame of reference is Protestant to the exclusion of any other religion or culture, the book gives a vivid picture of the mother and her place in the home and society.

The general conclusion is that in New England from 1830 to 1860 the mother was all but a prisoner at her own fireside. Modern ideologists, particularly the feminists of the woman suffrage and prohibition eras, on the other hand have striven to "emancipate" the mother. But "science" has, according to Miss Kuhn, been proving gradually that the true solution lies somewhere in the middle. However, the author leaves the reader very much in doubt as to what conclusions are the result of research and what merely of personal opinion.

Those who view death as a blessed release are implicitly called religious fanatics (p. 122); and "to speak of the body as 'the temple of the soul' would be considered naive pantheism today" (p. 190); "to assert once more that the future of democracy depends upon the activity and vigilance of parents in the education of young children is to discount the prime importance of armies and of atomic weapons in our warring world." Statements of this kind, and more throughout the book, betray a latent antagonism towards the very home and mother role which the research sought to uncover. In other words, there are people of no mean intellectual stature who do believe that death often is a blessed release; those who can call the body the temple of the soul and still not fall into or believe in Cartesian dualism, and those, too, who feel that democracy does depend more

on family life than atom bombs or armies. The author's last chapter of conclusions, in our opinion, does not always remain within the premises established in the earlier chapters. (MARK J. HURLEY)

LUCAS, HENRY S. 1847—*Ebenezer*—1947. *Memorial Souvenir of the Centennial Commemoration of Dutch Immigration to the United States*. (New York: Netherlands Information Bureau. 1947. Pp. 40.)

*Ebenezer*: hitherto has the Lord helped us (I Sam. 1-2), was the legend which appeared on the banners, unfurled by the Dutch immigrants when they commemorated the twenty-fifth and fiftieth years of their sojourn to the United States. Hence on the occasion of the centennial commemoration, Professor Lucas has chosen this motto of gratitude as the title of his booklet which tells us why these Dutch immigrants left their native country a century ago, where they settled, how they labored, and what they achieved. The Protestants among them left the old country because they wanted freedom of religion; being strict Calvinists, they were given the cold shoulder by their more liberal Protestant brethren. After finding a justification for their emigration in the Lord's command, "Be fruitful and multiply the earth," they crossed the Atlantic. Practically all the groups were led by ministers (*dominies*) who not only cared for their spiritual needs, but had also a keen eye on their material welfare.

Whereas the Protestant groups settled mainly in Michigan, Iowa, Illinois, and New Jersey, the Catholic Dutch immigrants, led by Father Van den Broek, O.P., founded flourishing communities in Wisconsin. This interesting contribution to American history is illustrated with many maps and pictures. (JAMES VAN DER VELDT)

MACMANUS, M. J. *Eamon de Valera*. (Chicago: Ziff-Davis Publishing Co. 1946. Pp. 281. \$3.00.)

This is the story of the part played by the Irish statesman in the eventful history of modern Ireland. The author, literary editor of De Valera's newspaper, the *Irish Press*, purposed to write an honest rather than an impartial account. The result is a sympathetic biography by an ardent admirer.

From a quiet scholarly life as student and professor De Valera was drawn into the current of public events. In 1913 he joined the National Volunteer Movement; in 1915, the Irish Republican Brotherhood. He was one of the leaders in the Easter uprising in 1916. He was condemned to death for his participation but his sentence was commuted to penal servitude for life. Upon his release from jail in the general amnesty of 1917 he accepted County Clare's selection of him as Sinn Fein candidate to Parliament. The decision was fateful: it was but the beginning of a long struggle for the independence of Ireland.

Mr. MacManus tells that struggle interestingly and dramatically: his opposition to conscription; his escape from jail; his visit to America; his launching the negotiations that culminated in the treaty of December 6, 1921, and his rejection of that treaty; his opposition to the government established in accord-

ance with that treaty; his founding of a new organization, Fianna Fail; the gradual victory of Fianna Fail after years of defeat and patient waiting. Through all the political complexities, De Valera is revealed as steadily pursuing his purpose, modifying his position, but not sacrificing principle. Not the least interesting of the political situations he had to encounter was that connected with his visit to the United States, the situation that centered about the old Fenian John Devoy and Daniel F. Cohalan of New York. The general reader should find the biography an interesting introduction to Eamon de Valera and his Ireland. (SISTER MARY BORGAS PALM)

MARCUS, JACOB R. *Communal Sick-Care in the German Ghetto*. (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press. 1947. Pp. xiii, 335. \$4.00.)

Professor Marcus, the author of *The Jew in the Medieval World: A Source Book, 315-1791* (Cincinnati, 1938), here presents a comprehensive study down to 1800 of the care given by the Jewish community to its own sick members as well as to the transients who took sick within its territorial limits. Structurally the book consists of nine chapters, which constitute two-thirds of the volume, and eighteen appendices. An extensive bibliography covering twenty-five pages and a seventeen-page index complete the work.

One point rendered certain by this study is that the Jewish community did provide for its sick. The general public health program of the Jews was modeled after the Christian pattern which had been in operation for centuries in almost every town of any size. Every Jewish community had its physician, its surgeon ("barber"), and its mid-wives, and later on it also had a hospital, a druggist, a drugstore, male and female hospital attendants, and other public servants for communal use. The first and introductory chapter describes the nature and functions of these various attendants.

The next four chapters deal with the "Holy Brotherhood" (*Hebra Kaddisha*), a confraternity which assisted the community and sometimes supplanted it in caring for the sick. The author treats in order the origin of the brotherhoods, their structure, their program of philanthropy, prayer, and study, and finally what they did for the sick. The oldest brotherhood established in the German lands was that of Prague, about 1564. Appendix IX (pp. 253-256) gives a chronological list of the German-Jewish holy brotherhoods.

Chapter six studies women's sick-care societies. Like the holy brotherhoods, these female organizations were originally burial societies; the first instance of a specific sick-care society occurred in Berlin in 1745. The rise of Jewish youth societies is described in chapter seven, while the two final chapters are devoted to the Jewish hospital. Appendix XVI (pp. 279-280) gives a partial list of Jewish hospitals in chronological order. Four of the appendices give documents in Judaeo-German text.

The documentation is thorough and gives proof of the careful and scientific character of the work. The volume is admirably printed and is singularly free from printing mistakes. (GEORGE J. UNDREINER)

MCCALEB, WALTER F. *The Conquest of the West*. (New York: Prentice-Hall, Inc. 1947. Pp. xiv, 336. \$3.75.)

If readers of this volume are informed regarding Dr. McCaleb's background they will probably approach his newest work wondering whether in this instance a successful journalist and banker has proved himself an expert in early trans-Mississippi history. The study under review essentially belongs, therefore, in that dwindling category of publications by Sabine farmers whose *otium cum dignitate* bears fruit now in a military treatise, now in a sheaf of fugitive pieces that aim to appraise art or to reform politics.

From the opening pages of *The Conquest of the West* it will be clear to all that Dr. McCaleb has not undertaken to fill gaping voids in archival content or in any very specific fashion to obligate teachers of American history; instead, he has disclaimed undue pretensions as a trail-blazer in the unexplored realms of research. He assesses his offering as an effort to organize known, but hitherto uncorrelated, materials. "So far as I am aware," he says, "no attempt has been made to present to the public an integrated account of the Conquest of the West—that vast region lying between the Mississippi River and Pacific Ocean. I have tried in this book to tell that story, which runs without a break from the Louisiana Purchase (1803) to the treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo (1848). That forty-five year span can be said to constitute our 'heroic age'." The need for such chronological interrelation, actually nonexistent up to now, will hardly concern the general reader. The "public," on finding the "integrated account" an attractive one, will briskly follow the author as he narrates what the jacket calls "the remarkable story of how Americans between 1800 and 1848 spanned a continent and won the rich territories of Louisiana, Texas, Oregon and California."

If special readers indulge in criticism, it will be likely to turn on three rather obvious points. First, they may pronounce the title of the book misleadingly comprehensive, denying to a historian whose searchlight skims across East and West Florida to Oregon, New Mexico, and California, before and after resting with some permanence on Texas, the right so to designate what it fleetingly illumines. For they will have spent five pages surveying the Floridas and determining their boundaries; they will have camped for 200 pages in Texas and strenuously pioneered through its era of colonization, revolution, and republican life; in sixteen pages they will have formed a bowing acquaintance with our settlement of the Oregon problem and focused attention in passing on the activities of Russia and England in the far Northwest; and they will have returned to the Rio Grande for the war with Mexico. Again, they may argue that the term "conquest" cannot be employed with propriety, let alone with historical precision, to cover American action in any of these instances. And, further, they may object that the word "fiasco," selected to summarize our negotiations in Oregon, imparts to the whole account a tongue-in-cheek flavor.

Approval of the book by even such readers need not, however, be reluctant or reserved, despite its inexact title and disproportionate emphasis. A praiseworthy amount of exploration in Texan and Mexican depositories and in the files of contemporary newspapers has enabled the author to tint interestingly the varicolored dome of glass that he raises on four sturdy foundation stones. They

are H. G. Warren's *The Sword Was Their Passport*, Carlos E. Castañeda's *The Mexican Side of the Texas Revolution*, G. P. Garrison's *Diplomatic Correspondence of the Republic of Texas*, and J. H. Smith's *The Annexation of Texas*. Whether or not the several episodes of our western movement before 1848 required linking at Dr. McCaleb's hands, these writers did, and he has serviceably brought them into effective correlation. (RALPH F. BAYARD)

McLEAN, JOSEPH E. *William Rufus Day: Supreme Court Justice from Ohio*. [Johns Hopkins University Studies in Historical and Political Science. Series LXIV, Number 3]. (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press. 1945. Pp. 172. \$2.00.)

The purpose of this excellent biographical study of William Rufus Day is, as the author notes in his preface, "an attempt to interpret the work of the Supreme Court in the light of one unpublicized justice" (p. 6). At the conclusion of the work one is convinced that Justice Day lived "a life, marked by simplicity, by a lack of personal political ambition, and by an unselfish devotion to his friends, his work and the public" (p. 166).

In between the purpose and the conclusion of this doctoral dissertation, the reader can trace a biographical pattern, compactly and interestingly arranged in six chapters and an epilogue that painstakingly and competently depict the social, political, economic, and legal background of Justice Day as factors influencing the more than 400 majority and the eighteen dissenting opinions which he wrote in a little less than two decades of service on the Supreme Court. The significance of Justice Cardozo's work on *The Nature of the Judicial Process* can more readily be appreciated after reading Dr. McLean's study of the 'unpublicized justice.'

Here is a 'country lawyer', Republican in politics, disciplined in common law court practice, committed to *laissez faire*, not unfamiliar with railway and corporation practice, suddenly placed on the highest court in the land during an era when public law cases and questions concerned with the social and economic life of the nation were pressing for decision. To a lesser degree than Marshall and Taney, perhaps, but nevertheless quite definitely, Day contributed much to American constitutional development.

Justice Day is said to have held "honestly and firmly to a middle course of action." This fact, together with his views, both moderate and liberal, on national and state power, make up the core of this analysis of his contributions to constitutional development. In a scholarly chapter on "A State-Rights Federalist" Justice Day is alleged not to have "personally used the reserve powers of the states to limit national action and then turned about to limit state action in the same area (thereby leaving a no-man's land or area of no regulation)" (p. 65). However, the justice seems to have had his own 'no-man's land' in a very narrow, but for a *laissez faire* Republican, convenient conception of commerce "as an economic process that did not comprehend production in any of its forms" (p. 157).

Scholars will rejoice in excellent summaries of the opinions on many important cases which Mr. McLean has included in his study as well as in the clear type



and excellent format of the book which is quite in keeping with the best efforts and traditions of the publishers. (EDWARD J. EGGL)

MILLS, RANDALL V. *Stern-Wheelers up Columbia: A Century of Steamboating in the Oregon Country*. (Palo Alto: Pacific Books, 1947. Pp. 212. \$3.75.)

The Mississippi River boats had their Mark Twain, Walter Havighurst has spread abroad the fame of the Great Lakes' boats, and now Randall Mills puts in pleasing words the story of steamboating in the Oregon Country during the past century. Every phase of steamboating on the rivers of the far Northwest receives mention: transportation of troops during the Indian uprisings as well as bringing permanent settlers to the Columbia's watershed; carrying gold-mad prospectors to the Idaho diggings and to those on the Fraser River in British Columbia; braving the rapids with gunwales almost awash under the load of newly-harvested wheat. A lighter aspect of the story is found in the traditional races between the stern-wheelers that involved crew and passengers, emotionally and financially. Successful and unsuccessful attempts to monopolize river business constitute still another fascinating chapter.

The major sources of the book are indicated in the preface and selective bibliography. There are no notes, and yet the reader receives the distinct impression that he is reading the work of a man thoroughly familiar with his subject. The appendix which lists 577 boats and exact technical information regarding date and place of construction, length, tonnage, and ultimate fate of each, makes impressive reading in its own right. Mills' fine literary style becomes more noteworthy when one realizes he has incorporated much of this specialized data into his book without frequently using nautical terminology and with extremely rare lapses of interest.

With excellent maps and genuinely pertinent illustrations throughout the work, Dr. Mills has composed a delightfully readable account of a segment of Pacific Northwest history which should win him widespread gratitude for removing this story from the vaults of regional periodicals and research monographs. (WILLIAM N. BISCHOFF)

MONRO, MARGARET T. *Blessed Margaret Clitherow*. (New York: Longmans, Green and Co. 1947. Pp. 108. \$2.00.)

This is a slender volume presumably intended for the general reader rather than for the professional historian. It tells in a rather eulogistic style the story of the life of Margaret Clitherow, one of the three valiant women put to death under Queen Elizabeth for the "crime" of harboring priests. Unfortunately, one can learn just as much about Margaret Clitherow by consulting either Thompson Cooper's sketch in the *Dictionary of National Biography*, IV, 559, or Dom Bede Camm's article in the *Catholic Encyclopedia*, IV, 59. The author admitted in the introduction that her work is based almost entirely on one source, viz., *Troubles of Our Catholic Forefathers* (Third Series, 1877), by John Morris, S.J., which is a second edition of *A True Report of the Life and Martyrdom of Mrs. Margaret Clitherow*, written in 1586, three months after her death, by



John Mush, a secular priest and the spiritual director of Margaret Clitherow. The extent to which the author leaned upon this work is to be regretted. Did she hope to bring forth an objective treatment relying so completely upon the testimony of one witness and that a friendly one? She tries to justify her position by explaining that the work mentioned "contains valuable research into the Middleton and Clitherow families, and into the affairs of the recusants of York during Margaret's lifetime." Is the author aware of the considerable research done on the lives of the victims of the Elizabethan persecution by such scholars as the late J. H. Pollen, S.J., C. A. Newdigate, S.J., and Dom Bede Camm? Extensive bibliographical aids are offered by Conyers Read, Pollard, Black, and others.

This volume could have filled an important lacuna. Unhappily, one feels that the author has missed an opportunity to rescue a truly heroic woman from obscurity. In addition to an unattractive format, there are a few repetitions, several Anglicisms unfamiliar to American readers, many common-place expressions, and unimportant inconsistencies, all of which should have been corrected before publication. Possibly an index and a few illustrations would have enhanced the value of the book. For the general reader, however, who probably never would investigate source material, the author has painted an interesting picture.

(SISTER M. ALPHONSINE FRAWLEY)

## PERIODICAL LITERATURE

### MISCELLANEOUS

- Theoretical History. Jan Romein (*Jrn. of the Hist. of Ideas*, Jan.).
- History and the Humanities. Hajo Holborn (*ibid.*).
- Bias in History. G. M. Trevelyan (*History*, Mar., 1947).
- Historical Revision No. CXI: English Hungarian Connections in the Humanist Circle of Erasmus of Rotterdam. Joan Moholi (*ibid.*).
- National Self-Determination and International Cooperation. O. Halecki (*Thought*, Dec.).
- Two historians: Ozanam and Toynbee. M. Whitcomb Hess (*America*, Jan. 24).
- Centenary of the Communist Manifesto. Franz H. Mueller (*ibid.*, Mar. 6).
- Rousseau and the "Social Contract". Louis J. A. Mercier (*ibid.*, Mar. 20).
- Frédéric Ozanam, Apostle of Charity and Truth. John Fitzsimons (*Clergy Rev.*, Jan.).
- The Communist Manifesto Centenary. Béla Menczer (*Month*, Jan.).
- Nouvelles acquisitions latines et françaises du Département des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque nationale pendant les années 1941-1945. Jean Porcher (*Bibliothèque de l'école des chartes*, Vol. CVI, 2<sup>e</sup> livraison).
- Leçon d'ouverture du cours d'histoire du droit civil et canonique à l'École des chartes (4 novembre 1946). F. Joûon des Longrais (*ibid.*).
- Paléographie précaroline et papyrologie. R. Marichal (*Scriptorium*, Tome I, Fasc. I, 1946-47).
- Le scriptorium et la bibliothèque de Saint-Amand. A. Boutemy (*ibid.*).
- Rand-und andere Glossen zum ältesten Schriftwesen in Zürich bis etwa 1300. L. C. Mohlberg (*ibid.*).
- Inventaire raisonné des cent manuscrits des "Constitutions tactiques" de Léon VI le Sage. A. Dain (*ibid.*).
- Status Imperii Iudaici*. J. Hammer and H. Friedmann (*ibid.*).
- Note sur l'origine et la date du *Status Imperii Iudaici*. A. Boutemy (*ibid.*).
- Quelques miniatures vénitiennes du XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle. P. Toesca (*ibid.*).
- Le manuscrit Colbert de Beaulieu du "Ci nous dit". Etude d'une des sources de cette compilation. L. Mourin (*ibid.*).
- Les miniatures d'un ms. du "Ci nous dit": le réalisme préeyckien. F. Lyna (*ibid.*).
- La transcription en notation moderne du "Liber missarum" de Pierre de la Rue. A. Auda (*ibid.*).
- Le plus ancien témoin manuscrit de la Règle du Maître: le Parisinus latin 12634. A. Genestout (*ibid.*).
- Un nouveau livre d'heures de l'école d'Utrecht. A. W. Byvanck (*ibid.*).
- Le "Dialogue de l'homme et la femme" attribuable à Philippe Bouton. L. Mourin (*ibid.*).
- Le Débat des deux grands amis. L. Mourin (*ibid.*).
- Une reliure du Tyrol du Sud. B. van Regemorter (*ibid.*).
- Sur quelques particularité séméiographiques des manuscrits musicaux de la Bibliothèque royale de Belgique. A. Tirabassi (*ibid.*).
- Un Priscien de Heilsbronn à Erlangen et Leyde. K. A. de Meyier (*ibid.*).
- Errata de la description du ms. Leyde B.P.L. 189. K. A. de Meyier (*ibid.*).
- Un "Jeu" d'amour en un seul hexamètre latin. G. I. Lieftinck (*ibid.*).

- La bibliothèque de "Johannes Darquet Rothomagensis". G. I. Lieftinck (*ibid.*).  
 Un manuscrit grec recherché. E. Denissoff (*ibid.*).  
 Un *περί τῆς οὐσίας* faussement attribué à Michel Apostolès. F. Masai (*ibid.*).  
 Théophile d'Alexandrie et les manuscrits de la correspondance de Mélétiüs Pigas.  
 Ch. Astruc (*ibid.*).  
 Deux erreurs dans l'édition du Lucidaire moyen-néerlandais. S. Schreiber (*ibid.*).  
 Latin Mss. Facsimiles, Editions, Studies Published in Great Britain, Ireland, Canada and the United States since July 1939. L. Bieler (*ibid.*, Fasc. I&II).  
 Les plus anciens manuscrits de la Règle du Maître transmettent un texte déjà interpolé. H. Vanderhoven (*ibid.*, Fasc. II).  
 Le Roman de la Rose de la Bibliothèque de la Ville de Tournai. L. Fourez (*ibid.*).  
 Texto de la "Visio S. Pauli" según el códice 28 de la Catedral de Barcelona. J. Oliveras Caminal (*ibid.*).  
 Un remaniement de la *Philosophia* de Guillaume de Conches. A. Vernet (*ibid.*).  
*Gallus et Vulpes*. L. Herrmann (*ibid.*).  
 La version parisienne du poème de Simon Chère d'Or sur la guerre de Troie.  
 A. Boutemy (*ibid.*).  
 Les miniatures de l'Apocalypse flamande de Paris. M. Hontoy (*ibid.*).  
 Une oeuvre inconnue du Maître de Marie de Bourgogne. F. Lyna (*ibid.*).  
 Une allusion au nom de Raymond de Peñafort dans une initiale enluminée? G. I. Lieftinck (*ibid.*).  
 Un Valère Maxime de la Sorbonne à Leyde. K. A. de Meyier (*ibid.*).  
 Un manuscrit ignoré de l'*Apologie de Machiavel* de Scioppius. F. Masai (*ibid.*).  
 Fragment d'un ms. du *Doctrinale* d'Alexandre de Ville-Dieu. P. Gorissen (*ibid.*).  
 Le manuscrit des Epigrammes de l'humaniste anversoïis Bauhusius. L. M.-J. Delaisse (*ibid.*).  
 Quelques mss. parents de la Bible de Saint-Hubert. A. Boutemy (*ibid.*).  
 L'*Excidium Troiae* dans la compilation de Guy de Pise. L. M.-J. Delaisse (*ibid.*).  
 L'Épilogue de l'Épître à Diognète. P. Andriessen (*Recherches de théologie ancienne et médiévale*, Vol. XIV, No. 2-3).  
 Nouveaux fragments théologiques de l'école d'Anselme de Laon. Conclusions et tables. O. Lottin (*ibid.*).  
 The Date of Grosseteste's Translations and Commentaries on Pseudo-Dionysius and the Nicomachean Ethics. A. Callus (*ibid.*).  
 Le III<sup>e</sup> livre des Homélies de Bède le Vénérable. J. Leclercq (*ibid.*).  
 Manegold de Lautenbach, source d'Anselme de Laon. O. Lottin (*ibid.*).  
 Zur Handschriftlichen Überlieferung der Quodlibeta des Petrus Johannis Olivi.  
 A. Maier (*ibid.*).  
 La date de la *Didascalie des Apôtres*. P. Galtier (*Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, Vol. XLII, No. 3-4).  
 Les origines de Prémontré. C. Dereine (*ibid.*).  
 Un mariage fertile en conséquences (Godefroid de Barbu et Béatrice de Toscanne). H. Glaesener (*ibid.*).  
 Un problème de chronologie liégeoise au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle. La date primitive de la Fête-Dieu. P. Lefèvre (*ibid.*).  
 The "Theologism" of Duns Scotus (Part II). Allan B. Wolter (*Franciscan Studies*, Dec., 1947).  
 Poverty in Perfection according to St. Bonaventure. (Part II). Aidan Carr (*ibid.*).

- Christ Jesus the Secure Foundation according to St. Cyril of Alexandria (Part III). Dominic J. Unger (*ibid.*).
- The Litany of the Saints in the Breviary of the Roman Curia and the Friars Minor before Haymo of Faversham. Aurelian van Dijk (*ibid.*).
- La Aureola del Salvador. Ambrosio Sanz Lavilla (*Universidad*, Vol. XXIV, No. 2).
- A propos des fouilles de Saint-Pierre: Questions historique et liturgiques. Noë Maurice-Denis Boulet (*Recherches de science religieuse*, Oct.).
- Navicula Petri: Zur Symbolgeschichte des römischen Primats. Hugo Rahner (*Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie*, 69 [1947], 1. Heft).
- Die Abwehr des germanischen Arianismus und der Umbruch der religiösen Kultur im frühen Mittelalter. Josef Andreas Jungmann (*ibid.*).
- Der Einfluss von Heiligenfesten auf die Perikopenwahl an den Sonntagen nach Pfingsten. Anton Vogl (*ibid.*).
- La typologie d'Isaac dans le christianisme primitive. J. Daniélou (*Biblica*, Vol. 28, Fasc. 4).
- How Fifth-Century Rome Administered Sacraments. Gerald Ellard (*Theolog. Studies*, Mar.).
- Sinners and the Mystical Body of Christ according to St. Augustine, II. Stanislaus J. Grabowski (*ibid.*).
- La carrière ecclésiastique des papes et les documents liturgiques du moyen âge. M. Andrieu (*Revue des sciences religieuses*, May, 1947).
- L'idéal du théologien au moyen âge, textes inédits. (*ibid.*).
- Equivalencia de fórmulas en las sistematizaciones trinitarias griega y latina. Augusto Segovia (*Estudios eclesiásticos*, Oct., 1947).
- Sermo panegyricus in memoriam ss. Cyrilli et Methodii. Grivec (*Acta Academiae Velehradensis*, Vol. XVIII, Fasc. 1-4).
- Libri liturgici in lingua Slavica a Sancta Sede editi. Alphonsus Raes (*ibid.*).
- Note on the Crisis of the Early Seventh Century C. E. Joshua Starr (*Jewish Quart. Rev.*, July, 1947).
- The Hebrew Bible in Art. Rachel Wischnitzer (*ibid.*).
- Paganism to Christianity. Solomon Zeitlin (*ibid.*, Oct., 1947).
- The Creeds of St. Victorinus and St. Patrick. Ludwig Bieler (*Theolog. Studies*, Mar.).
- El "De institutione virginum" de San Leandro de Sevilla con diez capítulos y medio inéditos. Angel Custodio Vega (*Ciudad de Dios*, May, 1947).
- Die Lehre vom geheimnisvollen Leib Christi in den frühen Paulinenkommentaren und in der Frühscholastik. Artur Michael Landgraf (*Divus Thomas*, Dec., 1947).
- Procédure de la canonisation. Charles de Clercq (*La Revue de l'Université Laval*, Feb.).
- Justice in the Moral Thought of St. Anselm. John R. Sheets (*Mod. Schoolman*, Jan.).
- Urban's Crusade—Success or Failure. A. C. Krey (*Amer. Histor. Rev.*, Jan.).
- Peter Martyr and His Works. Henry R. Wagner (*Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Soc.*, Vol. 56, Part 2).
- The Delictal Responsibility of Medieval Corporations. Walter Ullmann (*Law Quart. Rev.*, Jan.).
- The Reputation of St. Thomas Aquinas among English Protestant Thinkers of the Seventeenth Century. John K. Ryan (*New Scholasticism*, Jan.).
- A Short Survey of the Christians of South India and their Rites with an Account of the Easter. Dominic de Turville (*Eastern Churches Quart.*, Oct., 1947).

- The Social and Socio-Ecclesiastical Customs of the Syrian Christians of India. Father Placid (*ibid.*).
- The Missionary Enterprises of the Syrian Catholics of Malabar. Thomas Arayathinal (*ibid.*).
- The Armenian Colony in India. S. Kaloustian (*ibid.*).
- Romania: The Latin Empire of Constantinople. Robert Lee Wolff (*Speculum*, Jan.).
- Pastoral and Epithalamium in Latin Literature. E. Faye Wilson (*ibid.*).
- John of Avesnes and Richard of Cornwall. Henry S. Lucas (*ibid.*).
- Paradiso*, xxvi, 97. Angeline H. Lograsso (*ibid.*).
- An Emendation in *Anticlaudianus*. G. J. Engelhardt (*ibid.*).
- Neben das Geschichtsbewusstsein Dantes. Romano Guardini (*Theologische Quartalschrift*, 127 [1947], 1. Heft).
- La libertad humana según el concilio de Trento. Jorge Sily (*Ciencia y fe*, Vol. II, No. 8).
- Francisco Suárez (1543-1617). His World, Mind and Method. Julián Marias (*Dublin Rev.*, Spring, 1948).
- Serie completa dei padri e teologi Francescani Minori Conventuali al concilio di Trento (1545-1563). Giovanni Odoardi (*Miscellanea Francescana*, Vol. 47, Fasc. III-IV).
- Il P. M.<sup>o</sup> Alessandro d'Hales, O. Min. (+1245) e il ritrovato suo "Commento" alle Sentenze del Lombardo. Lorenzo Di Fonzo (*ibid.*).
- Un insigne dantista francescano: il P. M.<sup>o</sup> Stefano Ignudi O.F.M. Conv. (1865-1945). Gaetano M. Stano (*ibid.*).
- As ideias políticas depois da Reforma: Jean Bodin. L. Cabral de Moncada (*Boletim da Faculdade de Direito da Universidade de Coimbra*, Vol. XXIII, Fasc. 1).
- Filosofia da História e Filosofia do Direito no século XIX. F. Javier de Ayala (*ibid.*).
- François Pallu, évêque d'Héliopolis. F. Combaluzier (*Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft* [*Nouvelle revue de science missionnaire*], Vol. IV, Fasc. 1).
- St. Lawrence of Brindisi, Apologete. Isidore Mausolf (*Round Table of Franciscan research*, Feb.).
- Leibniz, l'illuminismo e il romanticismo. M. Campo (*Rivista di filosofia neoscolastica*, Vol. XXXIX, Fasc. 4).
- The Historical Setting of the Malthusian Theory. James R. Irwin (*Histor. Bulletin*, Jan.).

## EUROPEAN

- The Diplomatic Preliminaries of the Double Election of 1257 in Germany. C. C. Bayley (*English Histor. Rev.*, Oct., 1947).
- Netherland Regionalism and the Decline of the Hansa. William L. Winter (*Amer. Histor. Rev.*, Jan.).
- The Capuchins in the Low Countries. Armand Dasseville (*Round Table of Franciscan Research*, Feb.).
- Autour de l'histoire du Gallicanisme. E. Amann (*Revue des sciences religieuses*, May, 1947).
- Madame de Maintenon. John Leonard (*Studies*, Dec., 1947).
- Educational Theories and Principles of Cardinal Jacopo Sadoletto. Francis P. Cassidy (*Catholic Educational Rev.*, Jan., Feb., and Mar.).
- La lignée épiscopale de saint Charles Borromée. Paul Broutin (*Nouvelle revue théologique*, Nov., 1947).

- El Liber Sancti Jacobi y el Codice Calixtino. Louis Vazquez de Parga (*Revista de archivos, bibliotecas y museos*, Vol. LIII, No. 1).
- Anotaciones a un fraude histórico: Al margen del centenario de D. Juan de Austria. F. Cereceda (*Razón y fe*, Nov.).
- The Situation in Austria. Erik v. Kuehnelt-Leddihn (*Catholic World*, Feb.).
- The Occupying Powers. Erik von Kuehnelt-Leddihn (*Commonweal*, Feb. 20).
- The Nazification of the Baltic German Minorities. C. Leonard Lundin (*Jrn. of Central European Affairs*, Apr., 1947).
- Once More: Three Years of the Oriental Question, 1856-1859. Friedrich Engel-Janosi (*ibid.*).
- Behind the Curtain of Indifference: Recent Polish Literature. Wacław Lednicki (*ibid.*).
- The Insurrection of Warsaw. Leopold Orlowski (*ibid.*, July, 1947).
- American Opinion and Documents on Garibaldi's March on Rome, 1862. Howard R. Marraro (*ibid.*).
- Peacemaking in Perspective, II. F. W. Pick (*ibid.*).
- The Spiritual Independence of the Church in Czechoslovakia. František Bendnár (*Christendom*, Vol. XIII, No. 1).
- Inside Czechoslovakia. E. M. Voyta (*America*, Jan. 17).
- Nationalisme et internationalisme dans l'histoire des peuples danubiens. D. Kosáry (*Revue d'histoire comparée*, Vol. XXV, No. 3).
- Les débuts du capitalisme en Hongrie, 1200-1350. É. Molnár (*ibid.*).
- L'Église orientale dans la Hongrie du XI<sup>e</sup> siècle. M. Gyóni (*ibid.*).
- De motu idearum in Russia saeculo XIX. Joannes Mastyl'ak (*Acta Academiae Velehradensis*, Vol. XVIII, Fasc. 1-4).
- Kdo je Autorem Tak Zv. "Bulharské Legendy" [with a summary in Latin]. Ota Polách (*ibid.*).
- Alexander Kerensky, Minister of War and Marine. Sister Angelita Myers-cough (*Histor. Bulletin*, Jan.).
- Thirty Years of the Soviet Regime. Waldemar Gurian (*Rev. of Politics*, Jan.).
- The Greek Crisis—Its Constitutional Background. Frank O'Malley (*ibid.*).
- Russia and Europe. N. S. Timasheff (*Thought*, Mar.).
- Danubian Federation. Andrew Gyorgy (*ibid.*).
- Reports on the Soviet Union. A Survey of Recent Literature in the U. S. A. Waldemar Gurian (*Dublin Rev.*, Autumn, 1947).
- They're Doing a Job on Uncle Sam. Richard Pattee (*Columbia*, Jan.).
- The Christian Resistance in Europe. Richard Pattee (*Columbia*, Mar.).

## BRITISH EMPIRE

- Royal Demesne, Parliamentary Taxation, and the Realm. Robert S. Hoyt (*Speculum*, Jan.).
- Chaucer's Man of Law and *Disparitas Cultus*. Paul E. Beichner (*ibid.*).
- A Survival from the Middle Ages: William Baldwin's Use of the *Dictes and Sayings*. Curt F. Bühler (*ibid.*).
- A Text of Merlin's Prophecies. Gordon Hall Gerould (*ibid.*).
- Who Was Ysopullus? S. T. Collins (*ibid.*).
- Les mercenaires au XII<sup>e</sup> siècle: Henry II Plantagenet et les origines de l'armée de métier. J. Boussard (*Bibliothèque de l'école des chartes*, Vol. CVI, 2<sup>e</sup> livraison).
- Elizabethan Royal Supremacy and Contemporary Writers. L. Hicks (*Month*, Nov., 1947).



- The Ely Land Pleas in the Reign of William I. Edward Miller (*English Histor. Rev.*, Oct., 1947).
- Notes on Thirteenth-century Judicial Procedure. Charles Johnson (*ibid.*).
- Bishop Challoner's Early Years in London. C. Desmond Ford (*Clergy Rev.*, Feb.).
- Oxford and James II. Basil Hemphill (*ibid.*).
- Heralds of the Second Spring. Denis Gwynn (*Clergy Rev.*, Feb.).
- Tendencies in the Church of England. Humphrey J. T. Johnson (*Dublin Rev.*, Autumn, 1947).
- Some Missing Letters of Cardinal Vaughan. Shane Leslie (*ibid.*).
- Religious Education: The Final Curtain? An Anglican Assessment of Present Problems. (*ibid.*, Spring, 1948).
- Reflections on Anglo-Jewish History. Ludwig Feuchtwanger (*Historia Judaica*, Oct., 1947).
- Halevy: Diagnostician of Modern Britain. J. Bartlet Brebner (*Thought*, Mar.).
- Ignatius of Llanthony. Oswald J. Murphy (*Clergy Rev.*, Jan.).
- Irish Parliamentary Elections, 1727-68. J. L. McCracken (*Irish Histor. Studies*, Mar., 1947).
- Historical Revision, VIII. Parnell's Vindication. Henry Harrison (*ibid.*).
- Research on Irish History in Irish Universities, 1946-7. (*ibid.*).
- The Great Irish Famine, 1845-52. Thomas P. O'Neill (*Irish Ecclesiastical Record*, Nov., 1947).
- St. Thomas and Sir Edmund Whittaker. T. Crowley (*ibid.*, Dec., 1947).
- The Latest Crisis in Anglicanism: The South India Scheme. W. J. Hegarty (*ibid.*, Jan.).
- Archbishops Edmund MacGauran and Malachy Ó Queely. M. J. Connellan (*ibid.*).
- Irish Missionaries in Liberia. Helena Concannon (*Studies*, Dec., 1947).

## AMERICAN

- Religious Liberty: the Concern of All. John C. Murray (*America*, Feb. 7).
- Dr. Morrison and the First Amendment. John C. Murray (*ibid.*, Mar. 6 and 20).
- The Continental Congress and the Plan for a Library of Congress in 1782-1783. An Episode in American Cultural History. Fulmer Mood (*Pennsylvania Mag.*, Jan.).
- History and the Empire State. Carlton J. H. Hayes (*New York Hist.*, Jan.).
- American Life and Catholic Culture. Geoffrey Stone (*Thought*, Dec., 1947).
- Italian Immigration into Philadelphia. Sister Agnes Gertrude (*Records of the Amer. Cath. Histor. Soc. of Philadelphia*, Dec., 1947).
- St. Peter in Chains, Cincinnati. Henry C. Montgomery (*Museum Echoes*, Feb.).
- The Missouri Reader: The Louisiana Purchase, Part II. Ed. by Alice Furtney Laforce (*Missouri Histor. Rev.*, Jan.).
- The Formation of the Catholic Minority in the United States, 1820-1860. Thomas T. McAvoy (*Rev. of Politics*, Jan.).
- Labor Legislation in the United States: the Background and Growth of the Newer Trends. Aaron I. Abell (*ibid.*).
- U. S. Foreign Policy and the Balance of Power. Robert Strausz-Hupe (*ibid.*).
- Catholic Aspects of the Mexican War, 1846-1848. Benjamin J. Blid (*Social Justice Rev.*, Mar.).
- Some Recent Publications Relating to Polish American History. A. S. Wolanin (*Polish American Studies*, July).

- The First Polish School in the United States. Sister M. Nobilis (*Polish-American Studies*, Jan.-June, 1947).
- Polonica and Connecticut. Arthur Prudden Coleman and Marion Moore Coleman (*ibid.*).
- "Pike" Landusky, Montana Frontiersman. Edmund L. Kowalczyk (*ibid.*).
- Zur Geschichte der Missionierung der Neger in U. S. A. P. A. Tellkamp (*Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft* [*Nouvelle revue de science missionnaire*], Vol. IV, Fasc. 1).
- Recent Studies of Turner and the Frontier Doctrine. George W. Pierson (*Mississippi Valley Histor. Rev.*, Dec., 1947).
- The Beginnings of Anglican Sisterhoods. Thomas J. Williams (*Histor. Mag. of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Dec., 1947).
- Quebec, Cradle of Democracy. G.-O. Rothney (*Culture*, Dec., 1947).
- Louis XVI, le Congrès et le sort du Canada (1774-1783). Marcel Trudel (*ibid.*).
- Anglo-French Rivalry in the Fur Trade during the 18th Century. E. R. Adair (*ibid.*).
- Two Ways of Life: The Spirit of our Institutions. A. R. M. Lower (*Canadian Histor. Rev.*, Dec.).
- Les Plaines d'Abraham. G.-E. Marquis (*Revue de l'Université Laval*, Feb.).
- Understanding Latin America. James A. Magner (*Sign*, Jan.).
- Rogel, Padre of the Ports. Rosemary Ring Griffin (*Mid-America*, Jan.).
- Baegert Pictures a Lower California Mission. Peter Masten Dunne (*ibid.*).
- The Gallegos Relacion Reconsidered. Fray Angelico Chavez (*New Mexico Histor. Rev.*, Jan.).
- Missionary Aspects of the Founding of New Mexico. Agapito Rey (*ibid.*).
- Black-Robed Justice in New Mexico, 1846-1912. Arie Poldervaart (*ibid.*).
- Bolívar's Conquest of Guayaquil. William H. Gray (*Hispanic American Histor. Rev.*, Nov., 1947).
- The Early Days of San Miguel de la Frontera. Robert S. Chamberlain (*ibid.*).
- Grain Legislation in Colonial Mexico. Raymond L. Lee (*ibid.*).
- São João de Brito na Bahia e o movimento missionário do Brasil para a Índia. Serafim Leite (*Verbum*, Sept., 1947).
- Padre Ângelo de Siqueira, Missionário, Fundador e Escritor Ascético (1700?-1776). Luís Castanho de Almeida (*Revista eclesiástica brasileira*, Dec., 1947).
- Contribuciones a la historia del arte en el Ecuador. J. G. Navarro (*Boletín de la Academia Nacional de Historia* [Ecuador], July-Dec., 1947).
- Una figura dominicana en la época de la colonia. J. Roberto Páez (*ibid.*).

## BOOKS RECEIVED

- Alfred, Brother, *Catholic Pioneers in Upper Canada*. (Toronto: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. viii, 251. \$3.75.)
- Barck, Oscar Theodore, Jr., and Nelson Manfred Blake, *Since 1900. A History of the United States in Our Times*. (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. x, 863. \$4.75.) A textbook in twentieth-century American history by two professors of Syracuse University.
- Barraclough, G., *The Origins of Modern Germany*. [Second edition] (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. xi, 481. \$6.00.)
- Berman, Eleanor Davidson, *Thomas Jefferson Among the Arts: An Essay in Early American Esthetics*. (New York: Philosophical Library. 1948. Pp. xviii, 305. \$3.75.)
- Bill, Alfred Hoyt, *The Campaign of Princeton, 1776-1777*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1948. Pp. ix, 145. \$2.50.)
- Blegen, Theodore C., *Grass Roots History*. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. 1947. Pp. x, 266. \$3.00.)
- Bourke, Vernon J., *St. Thomas and the Greek Moralists* [Aquinas Lecture 1947, Spring]. (Milwaukee: Marquette University Press. 1947. Pp. 63. \$1.50.)
- Brown, Ralph H., *Historical Geography of the United States*. (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co. 1948. Pp. viii, 596. \$7.50.)
- Brydon, George Maclaren, *Virginia's Mother Church and the Political Conditions under Which It Grew*. (Richmond: Virginia Historical Society. 1947. Pp. xxii, 571.)
- Burton, Katherine, *Three Generations. Maria Boyle Ewing, Ellen Ewing Sherman, Minnie Sherman Fitch*. (New York: Longmans, Green and Co. 1947. Pp. viii, 312. \$3.50.)
- Capua, Francesco di, *Il ritmo prosaico nelle lettere dei papi e nei documenti della cancelleria romana dal IV al XIV secolo*. (Romae: Lateranum. Facultas Theologica Pontificii Athenaei Lateranensis. 1946. Pp. xii, 214.)
- Caro, Miguel Antonio, *La cancion a las ruinas de Italica del licenciado Rodrigo Caro*. (Bogotá: Publicaciones del Instituto Caro y Cuervo. Editorial Voluntad. 1947. Pp. xxxii, 241.)
- Carrington, C. E., *An Exposition of Empire*. (Cambridge: At the University Press; New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. v, 140. \$1.25.) A brief treatment of the rise of the British Empire in the Current Problems Series edited by Sir Ernest Barker.
- Carthy, Mother Mary Peter, O.S.U., *Old St. Patrick's, New York's First Cathedral*. (New York: United States Catholic Historical Society. 1947. Pp. vii, 109.) This study was originally done as a dissertation for the master of arts degree at the Catholic University of America. Mother Peter has used all available manuscript and printed materials to give a definitive history of the first cathedral of New York.
- Clinard, Outten Jones, *Japan's Influence on American Naval Power, 1897-1917*. (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press. 1947. Pp. iv, 235. \$3.75.)
- Cohen, Morris R., *The Meaning of Human History*. (La Salle, Illinois: Open Court Publishing Co. 1947. Pp. xi, 304. \$4.00.)
- Coleman, R. V., *The First Frontier*. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons. 1948. Pp. xiii, 458. \$3.75.)
- Denomy, Alexander J., *The Heresy of Courtly Love*. (New York: Declan X. McMullen Co. 1947. Pp. 92. \$1.50.)

- Dick, Everett, *The Dixie Frontier: A Social History of the Southern Frontier from the First Transmontane Beginnings to the Civil War*. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf. 1948. Pp. xix, 374, xxv, \$4.50.)
- Dirksen, Cletus F., *A Critical Analysis of Richard Hooker's Theory of the Relation of Church and State*. (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame-Department of Political Science. 1947. Pp. viii, 148.)
- Documents of International Organizations. A Selected Bibliography*. Volume I. No.1, November, 1947. (Boston: World Peace Foundation. 1948. Pp. xvi, 83. Yearly subscription \$2.50; single issue \$.75.) The staff of the World Peace Foundation issues herewith the first of its quarterly bibliographies to cover the tremendous documentation pouring forth daily from various international agencies. Naturally, the UN is given major space but specialized international agencies, such as the International Labor Organization, are likewise included as well as the old League of Nations. The quarterly bibliography should prove of immense help to students in all fields of international relations.
- Dunaway, Wayland F., *A History of Pennsylvania*. [Second edition] (New York: Prentice-Hall, Inc. 1948. Pp. xviii, 724. \$6.65.)
- Egbert, Donald Drew, *Princeton Portraits*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1947. Pp. vii, 360. \$15.00.)
- Ferm, Vergilius (Editor), *Religion in the Twentieth Century*. (New York: Philosophical Library. 1948. Pp. xix, 470. \$5.00.)
- Finn, Brendan A., *Twenty-Four American Cardinals*. (Boston: Bruce Humphries, Inc. 1948. Pp. 475. \$5.00.)
- Fries, Adelaide L. (Editor), *Records of the Moravians in North Carolina*. (Raleigh: State Department of Archives and History. 1947. Pp. x, 3021-3612.)
- Gade, John Allyne, *The Life and Times of Tycho Brahe*. (New York: Princeton University Press for the American-Scandinavian Foundation. 1947. Pp. xii, 209. \$4.50.)
- Gilson, Étienne, *History of Philosophy and Philosophical Education*. [Aquinas Lecture 1947, Fall] (Milwaukee: Marquette University Press. 1948. Pp. 49. \$1.50.)
- Grummon, Stuart E., *A Sarmiento Anthology*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1948. Pp. 336. \$5.00.)
- Hadrovics, Ladislav, *Le peuple serbe et son église sous la domination turque*. (Paris: Les Presses Universitaires de France. 1947. Pp. 168.)
- Hafkesbrink, Hanna, *Unknown Germany—An Inner Chronicle of the First World War Based on Letters and Diaries*. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1948. Pp. xiv, 164. \$2.50.)
- Houck, Frederick A., *Our Friends and Foes or the Angels, Good and Bad*. (St. Louis: B. Herder Book Co. 1948. Pp. xv, 256. \$1.50.) A treatise on the angels.
- Huerta, Pedro Jose, *Rocafuerte y la fiebre amarilla de 1842. La ciudad triste y desolada*. (Guayaquil, Ecuador: Imprenta de la Universidad. 1947. Pp. 82.)
- Huxley, Julian, *UNESCO. Its Purpose and its Philosophy*. (Washington: Public Affairs Press. 1947. Pp. 62. Paper, \$1.00; Cloth, \$2.00.)
- Jedin, Hubert, *Papal Legate at the Council of Trent. Cardinal Seripando*. (St. Louis: B. Herder Book Co. 1947. Pp. viii, 720. \$7.50.)
- Jenkins, Elmer (Editor), *Guide to America*. (Washington: Public Affairs Press. 1947. Pp. 705. \$5.00.)
- Johnson, F. Ernest, *Wellsprings of the American Spirit*. (New York: Harper and Brothers. 1948. Pp. ix, 241. \$2.50.)

- Jurgela, Constantine R., *History of the Lithuanian Nations*. (New York: Lithuanian Cultural Institute Historical Research Section. 1948. Pp. 544. \$5.00.)
- Kucharzewski, Jan, *The Origins of Modern Russia*. (New York: Polish Institute of Arts and Sciences in America. 1948. Pp. xxi, 503.)
- Lancot, Gustave, *Report of the Department of Public Archives for the year 1947*. (Ottawa: Public Archives of Canada. 1948. Pp. xlvii, 232. \$1.00.) The Annual Report contains five documents, an appendix of the Nova Scotia State Papers, together with the customary report of the Keeper of Public Records and lists of the acquisitions to the Manuscript Division.
- Landreth, Helen, *The Pursuit of Robert Emmet*. (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co. Pp. xviii, 407. \$3.75.)
- Lebreton, Jules, and Jacques Zeiller, *The History of the Primitive Church*. Volume IV. *The Church in the Third Century—Part II*. (London: Burns, Oates, and Washbourne, Ltd. 1947. Pp. 761-1152. 25s.)
- Lefebvre, Georges, *The Coming of the French Revolution, 1789*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1947. Pp. xx, 233. \$3.00.)
- Madariaga, Salvador de, *The Rise of the Spanish American Empire*. (New York: Macmillan Co. 1947. Pp. xix, 408. \$5.00.)
- Madoz, José, *Epistolario de Alvaro de Córdoba*. (Madrid: Instituto Francisco Suarez. 1947. Pp. 300.)
- Marguerite, Sister M., S.N.D., and Catherine Beebe, *This is Our Parish*. (Boston: Ginn and Co. 1948. Pp. 255. \$1.28.) This volume, for the second grade, is the latest addition to the series of illustrated readers for children issued by the Commission on American Citizenship of the Catholic University of America.
- Maynard, Theodore, *A Fire Was Lighted: The Life of Rose Hawthorne Lathrop*. (Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing Co. 1948. Pp. x, 443. \$3.50.)
- McGurrin, James, *Bourke Cockran: A Free Lance in American Politics*. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons. 1948. Pp. xv, 361. \$3.50.)
- Metz, René, *La monarchie française et la provision des bénéfices ecclésiastiques en Alsace de la paix de Westphalie à la fin de l'ancien régime (1648-1789)*. (Paris: F.-X. Le Roux and Cie. 1947. Pp. 435.)
- Middleton, R. D., *Newman and Bloxam: an Oxford Friendship*. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1947. Pp. x, 261. \$6.00.)
- Mills, Randall V., *Stern-Wheelers up Columbia. A Century of Steamboating in the Oregon Country*. (Palo Alto, California: Pacific Books. 1947. Pp. 212. \$3.75.)
- Olmedo, José Joaquín de, *Discurso sobre las mitas de America*. (Guayaquil, Ecuador: Imprenta de la Universidad. 1947. Pp. 37.)
- Orcibal, Jean, *Jean Duvergier de Hauranne: Abbé de Saint-Cyran et son temps (1581-1638), appendices, bibliographie et tables*. (Paris: Librairie Philosophique. 1947. Pp. 281.)
- O'Sullivan, Jeremiah F., *Cistercian Settlements in Wales and Monmouthshire, 1140-1540*. (New York: Declan X. McMullen Co. 1947. Pp. ix, 137. \$2.00.)
- Paris Peace Conference, 1946. Selected Documents*. (Washington: United States Government Printing Office. 1948. Pp. xvi, 1442.)
- Parrington, Vernon Louis, *American Dreams: A Study of American Utopias*. (Providence: Brown University Press. 1947. Pp. viii, 234. \$4.00.)
- Perkins, Dexter, *The United States and the Caribbean*. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press. 1947. Pp. xii, 253. \$3.00.)
- Quenzel, Carrol H. (Editor), *Preliminary Checklist for Fredericksburg, 1778-1876*. (Richmond: Virginia State Library. 1947. Pp. 176. \$2.00.) This checklist is Number 4 in the Virginia Imprint Series. It was compiled by various persons and edited in lithographed form by the librarian of Mary



- Washington College of the University of Virginia. Wars and the Protestant churches of this region of Virginia accounted for most of the books published in the Fredericksburg area in the years covered.
- Quigley, Martin, *Magic Shadows: The Story of the Origin of Motion Pictures*. (Washington: Georgetown University Press. 1948. Pp. 191. \$3.50.)
- Raeymeaker, Louis de, *Introduction to Philosophy*. (New York: Joseph F. Wagner, Inc. 1948. Pp. xi, 297. \$4.00.) Originally published in Belgium in 1938, this excellent work is the first of a series of philosophical manuals by Louvain professors, all of which are to be translated into English. The author discusses the character of philosophy and its relation to other disciplines, and certain of the problems of philosophy: knowledge, being, life, and value. A brief survey of the history of philosophy is included. One of the most important sections is the third part. In it the study of philosophy is discussed and some valuable bibliographies are given.
- Repetti, W. C., S.J., *The Manila Observatory*. (Washington: The Author. 1948. Pp. 43.) Father Repetti, formerly of the Manila Observatory staff and now stationed at Georgetown University, has told the story in this brochure of the history of the observatory from its inconspicuous beginnings in January, 1865, down to January, 1943. The fact that almost all the source material was lost in the fall of Manila in February, 1945, makes it all the more valuable to have the record of this institution from the hand of one of its recent personnel. The brochure is lithoprinted.
- Robinson, Howard, *The British Post Office: A History*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1948. Pp. xvii, 467. \$7.50.)
- Rodriguez, Ramon Insua, *Historia de la filosofia en Hispanoamerica*. (Guayaquil, Ecuador: Imprenta de la Universidad. 1945. Pp. 203.)
- Rolt, L. T. C., *High Horse Riderless*. (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd.; New York: Macmillan Co. 1948. Pp. viii, 171. \$2.75.) A series of fourteen brief essays on the need for a renewed spiritual orientation of our society before the materialist onslaught has finally destroyed Christian civilization.
- Schenk, H. G., *The Aftermath of the Napoleonic Wars: The Concert of Europe—An Experiment*. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1947. Pp. x, 228. \$5.00.)
- Schiavo, Giovanni Ermenegildo, *Italian-American History*. Volume I. (New York: Vigo Press. 1948. Pp. 604, xxxv. \$10.00.)
- Tate, Merze, *The United States and Armaments*. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press. 1948. Pp. xii, 312. \$6.00.)
- Thompson, A. Hamilton, *The English Clergy and their Organization in the Later Middle Ages* [Ford Lectures for 1933]. (Oxford: At the Clarendon Press; New York: Oxford University Press. 1947. Pp. xv, 327. \$5.50.)
- Tilton, Eleanor M., *Amiable Autocrat: A Biography of Dr. Oliver Wendell Holmes*. (New York: Henry Schuman. 1948. Pp. xi, 470. \$5.00.)
- Walz, Angelus, *Compendium historiae ordinis praedicatorum*. [Revised edition]. (Roma: Pontificium Athenaeum "Angelicum". 1948. Pp. xxiv, 733.)
- Weinberg, Julius Rudolph, *Nicolaus of Autrecourt: A Study in 14th Century Thought*. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1948. Pp. ix, 242. \$3.75.)
- Zacharias, H. C. E., *Protohistory: An Explicative Account of the Development of Human Thought from Palaeolithic Times to the Persian Monarchy*. (St. Louis: B. Herder Book Co. 1947. Pp. vii, 391. \$4.00.)



# The Catholic Historical Review

ALOYSIUS K. ZIEGLER                      MARTIN R. P. McGUIRE  
JOHN TRACY ELLIS  
*Managing Editor*

ADVISORY EDITORS

MANOEL S. CARDOZO                      THOMAS T. McAVOY                      THOMAS P. NEILL  
WILLIAM L. DAVIS                      ROBERT F. McNAMARA                      GEORGE J. UNDRAINER

---

## Table of Contents

JULY, 1948

ARTICLES

Clerical Taxation: The Scottish Alternative to Dissolution of the Monasteries, 1530-1560	W. Stanford Reid	129
The Attitude of the <i>Civiltà Cattolica</i> on the Italian Ques- tion, 1866-1870	Dora Guerrieri	154
BOOK REVIEWS		175
NOTES AND COMMENTS		204
BRIEF NOTICES		214
PERIODICAL LITERATURE		244
BOOKS RECEIVED		252

## BOOK REVIEWS

<i>Histoire de l'église en Belgique.</i> (E. de Moreau). CHARLES H. LYNCH.....	175
<i>Saints' Lives and Chronicles in Early England.</i> (Charles W. Jones). SISTER M. THOMAS AQUINAS CARROLL.....	176
<i>The English Clergy and Their Organization in the Later Middle Ages.</i> (A. Hamilton Thompson). CARLETON M. SAGE.....	178
<i>A Critical Analysis of Richard Hooker's Theory of the Relation of Church and State.</i> (Cletus F. Kirksen). CLARENCE J. RYAN.....	180
<i>Ein Gnadenstrom zur neuen Welt und seine Quelle. Die Leopoldinen- Stiftung zur Unterstützung der amerikanischen Missionen.</i> (Johannes Thauren). THEODORE ROEMER.....	181
<i>A Fire Was Lighted: The Life of Rose Hawthorne Lathrop.</i> (Theodore Maynard). ROBERT F. McNAMARA.....	183
<i>The Natural Law: A Study in Legal and Social History and Philosophy.</i> (Heinrich A. Rommen). BRENDAN F. BROWN.....	184
<i>State and Morals. A Study in Political Conflicts.</i> (T. D. Weldon). THOMAS F. MAHER.....	186
<i>Mélanges Auguste Pelzer. Etudes d'histoire littéraire et doctrinale de la scolastique médiévale offertes à Monseigneur Auguste Pelzer. Scriptor de la Bibliothèque Vaticane à l'occasion de son soixantedixième anni- versaire.</i> JOSEPH N. GARVIN.....	187
<i>The Great Elector.</i> (Ferdinand Schevill). OSCAR HALECKI.....	190
<i>The Coming of the French Revolution, 1789.</i> (Georges Lefebvre). CRANE BRINTON.....	192
<i>Golden Multitudes. The Story of Best Sellers in the United States.</i> (Frank Luther Mott). EUGENE P. WILLING.....	193
<i>The Journals of Francis Parkman.</i> (Mason Wade). JOHN BERNARD MCGLOIN.....	194
<i>Moreau de St. Méry's American Journey (1793-1798).</i> (Kenneth Roberts and Anna M. Roberts). JOHN J. MENG.....	196
<i>Latin America: An Historical Survey.</i> (John Francis Bannon). MICHAEL B. McCLOSKEY.....	198
<i>The Discovery of New Spain in 1518 by Juan de Grijalva.</i> (Henry R. Wagner). CARLOS E. CASTAÑEDA.....	200
<i>Fr. Bartolomé de las Casas, Del único modo de atraer a todos los pueblos a la verdadera religión.</i> (Agustín Millares Carlo). CARLOS E. CASTAÑEDA.....	202